

Women's citizenship
the democracies of the Americas

## Caribbean







## Women's citizenship in the democracies of the Americas

## The English-speaking Caribbean

Rawwida Baksh and Linnette Vassell

August 2013

#### Women's citizenship in the democracies of the Americas: the English-speaking Caribbean

©Inter-American Commission of Women, OAS, 2013 ©International Institute for Democracy and Electoral Assistance, International IDEA, 2013

#### Author:

Rawwida Baksh and Linnette Vassell

#### Project and study coordinator

Belkys Mones

© Copyright 2013 All rights reserved

Inter-American Commission of Women

La ciudadanía de las mujeres en las democracias de las Américas / Comisión Interamericana de Mujeres. p. ; cm. (OEA documentos oficiales ; OEA/Ser.L)

ISBN 978-0-8270-6031-9

1. Women and democracy--America--Congresses. 2. Women--Political activity--America--Congresses. 3. Women's rights. 4. Political participation--America--Congresses. I. Title. II. Title: Segundo Foro Hemisférico sobre la Ciudadanía de las Mujeres para la Democracia. III. Grupo de Trabajo Regional sobre la Ciudadanía de las Mujeres para la Democracia. IV. International Institute for Democracy and Electoral Assistance. V. UN Women. VI. Series. OAS Official Records Series; OEA/Ser.L.

OEA/Ser.L/II.6.12

#### Design and layout

Sabreu Design

#### Interior photos (by order of appearance)

http://farm5.staticflickr.com/4007/4695915599\_427597d517\_o.jpg OEA/CIM http://www.flickr.com/photos/33498942@N04/7013220989/ http://farm5.staticflickr.com/4089/5094181883\_76933b57f6\_o.jpg http://farm5.staticflickr.com/4075/4823529874\_52dcb3f564\_o.jpg http://farm5.staticflickr.com/4153/5063209199\_3a43bc8809\_o.jpg

The designations employed in the presentation of the material in this publication do not imply the expression of any opinion on the part of the CIM/OAS or International IDEA concerning the legal status of any country, territory, city or area, or of its authorities, or concerning the delimitation of its frontiers or boundaries.

The opinions expressed are those of the authors and do not necessarily reflect the opinion of the CIM/OAS or International IDEA.

## Table of contents

Acronyms		7
Acl	knowledgements	7
1.	Towards understanding women's citizenship and democracy in the anglophone	
	caribbean	11
	1.1 Women's perspectives on democracy without citizenship	13
	1.2 Theoretical perspectives on women's citizenship and democracy in the caribbean	16
2.	A historical perspective on the political economy of Caribbean democracy	22
	2.1 Background	22
	2.2 Colonial gender policy	22
	2.3 Women's early organizations for social reform and political rights	24
	2.4 The labour movement	24
	2.5 The experience of national independence	37
	2.6 Questioning the westminster system of democracy	32
3.	New social and political actors	35
	3.1 Emergence of new social and political actors	36
	3.2 Popular cultural forms	37
	3.3 Contributions of women's and feminist organizing to democracy	40
4.	Women's social and economic citizenship: implications for democracy	51
	4.1 Introduction	52
	4.2 Family and conjugal arrangements	52
	4.3 Sexuality and sexual citizenship	54
	4.4 Socialization, affection and care	58
	4.5 Women and the economy	59
	4.6 Human security	64
5.	How women evaluate the performance of democracy	70
	5.1 Democracy's ambiguous relationship with women	70
	5.2 Democratic deficits of governance and accountability	71
	5.3 Under-representation of women in politics	72
	5.4 New initiatives for advancing women's transformational leadership: two case studies	77
	5.5 Experiences and expectations of women's political leadership	81

6.	Conclusions and recommendations 6.1 Conclusions 6.2 General and specific recommendations	<b>88</b> 88 91
7.	Bibliography	101
8.	A note on the authors	114

### Acronyms

APPA Antigua Planned Parenthood Association

ASCRIA Association for the Establishment of Cultural Relations with Independent Nations of Africa ASPIRE Advocates for Safe Parenthood: Improving Reproductive Equity (Trinidad and Tobago)

BOWAND Belize Organization for Women and Development

BRWA Belize Rural Women's Association

CAFRA Caribbean Association for Feminist Research and Action

CARICOM Caribbean Community and Common Market

CARIWA Caribbean Women's Association
CCJ Caribbean Court of Justice
CDB Caribbean Development Bank

CEDAW Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Discrimination against Women

CIWIL Caribbean Institute for Women in Leadership
CPA Commonwealth Parliamentary Association
CPDC Caribbean Policy Development Centre
CSME CARICOM Single Market and Economy

CSO Central Statistical Office

CSW Coterie of Social Workers (Trinidad and Tobago)
CWP Committee of Women for Progress (Jamaica)

CWP Concerned Women for Progress (Trinidad and Tobago)

EC Eastern Caribbean

ECLAC Economic Commission for Latin America and the Caribbean

FAO Food and Agriculture Organization
FES Friedrich Ebert Stiftung (Jamaica Office)
HFLE Health and Family Life Education
IDB Inter-American Development Bank
ILO International Labour Organization
IMF International Monetary Fund
JCSC Jamaica Civil Society Coalition

JCWR Joint Committee for Women's Rights (Jamaica)

JHWA Jamaica Household Workers Association

JLP Jamaica Labour Party

LGBTQ Lesbian, Gay, Bisexual, Transgender and Queer

NIS National Insurance System
NJM New Jewel Movement (Grenada)

NOW National Organisation of Women (Barbados)

NPTA National Parent Teachers' Association (Trinidad and Tobago)

NUDE National Union of Domestic Employees (Trinidad and Tobago)

NWO National Women's Organisation (Grenada)

PIOJ Planning Institute of Jamaica
PNC People's National Congress (Guyana)
PNP People's National Party (Jamaica)
PPP People's Progressive Party (Guyana)
PSOJ Private Sector Organisation of Jamaica
PWA Progressive Women's Association (Grenada)
OECS Organisation of Eastern Caribbean States
OWP Organisation of Women for Progress (Jamaica)

SIDS Small Island Developing States
SISTREN Sistren Theatre Collective (Jamaica)
TWA Trinidad Workingmen's Association
UNICEF United Nations Children's Fund
UNFPA United Nations Population Fund
UWI University of the West Indies

VOW Voluntary Organisation of Women (Jamaica)

WHO World Health Organization

WINAD Women's Institute for Alternative Development (Trinidad and Tobago)

WINFA Windward Islands Farmers Association
WPA Working People's Alliance (Guyana)

WROC Women's Resource and Outreach Centre (Jamaica)
WRSM Women's Revolutionary Socialist Movement (Guyana)

## Acknowledgements

This report on *Women's Citizenship and Democracy in the English-Speaking Caribbean* was made possible by the Organization of American States (OAS)/ Inter-American Commission of Women (CIM), as part of the organization's larger report on *Women's Citizenship in the Democracies of the Americas*. We offer our deep appreciation to OAS/CIM for its strategic decision to commission an Anglophone Caribbean report, and for the opportunity to participate in the LAC Working Group and the Second Hemispheric Forum.

We would like to thank the UN Women–Caribbean Office for co-funding the Anglophone Caribbean report. Roberta Clarke offered thoughtful feedback on the draft report, and Gabrielle Henderson provided insights on young women's citizenship in the region.

We are particularly grateful to the following women activists in Jamaica and Trinidad and Tobago, who participated in the four focus group meetings held in preparation of the report. We have drawn on their experiences, analyses and perspectives throughout the report:

Jamaica: Althea Blackwood, Sonia Britton, Paulette Burke, Prudence Burke, Mavis Campbell, Honor Ford-Smith, Sandra Glasgow, Ena McDonald, Hilary Nicholson, Tracy Robinson, Christine Senior, Nikeisha Sewell, Deloris Simmonds, Marlene Thomas, Danielle Toppin, Judith Wedderburn and Dorothy Whyte.

Trinidad and Tobago: Rebecca Abder, Raquel Birbal, Hazel Brown, Surendra Dwarka, Isata Golfa, Brenda Gopeesingh, Gabrielle Hosein, Ida Le Blanc, Folade Mutota, Aleah Ranjitsingh, Tara Ramoutar and Waveney Richards.

The Institute for Gender and Development Studies (IGDS), University of the West Indies, St. Augustine Campus, Trinidad and Tobago invited us to participate in its regional workshop on *Gender, Politics and Social Justice* held on 15-16 March, 2012. This enabled us to share the preliminary findings as well as attend a WINAD/ IGDS *Conversation on Women, Politics and Activism* held among women's rights activists, women parliamentarians and local councillors.

The Caribbean Institute for Women in Leadership (CIWiL) invited us to present the draft report at its Executive Board's strategic planning workshop, held in collaboration with UN Women–Caribbean Office in Barbados on 21-22 May, 2012. The workshop provided the opportunity for feedback as well as uptake of some of the recommendations into CIWiL's work plan.

We offer our deep appreciation to Joan French (Jamaica), founding member of Sistren Theatre Collective and CAFRA, for her insightful comments and inputs which have enriched the final report. We also owe a debt of gratitude to the following for their contributions: Tonya Haynes (Code Red: Society for Gender and Justice, Barbados) on young women's citizenship in the region; Carol Narcisse on the Jamaica Civil Society Coalition (JCSC); Sheila Roseau (Director of Gender Affairs, Antigua and Barbuda) on CIWiL; and Judith Wedderburn (Director, Friedrich Ebert Stiftung, Jamaica) for her general feedback on the report.

Finally, we are grateful to Aleah Ranjitsingh, Mavis Campbell and Nikeisha Sewell for their excellent assistance with the desk research and organizing of the focus group meetings.



# Introduction: Towards understanding women's citizenship and democracy in the anglophone caribbean



# 1. Introduction: Towards understanding women's citizenship and democracy in the anglophone caribbeano

For the middle class women in Jamaica who participated in one of the focus group meetings held in preparation of this report, 'citizenship' meant "the right and opportunity to participate," "helping to define and shape the place where one lives," and "contributing to the life of one's community and country." They also viewed citizenship as "a sense of belonging," "an entitlement to space," and "being comfortable in that space." 'Democracy' represented their right as a citizen to choose, the opportunity to participate, and the responsibility to exert agency. Their counterparts in Trinidad and Tobago expressed the view that "voice and power are fundamental attributes of citizenship," and that ordinary women and men had exercised citizenship in earlier periods through taking the initiative to form organizations, build their communities, and bring their voices to bear on issues of national development.

Working class women from urban communities in Kingston articulated the fundamental attributes of citizenship somewhat differently, stressing one's "legal status," "right to an equal share," "ability to vote," and "right to speak out for your rights at any time." Linking citizenship and democracy, these activists saw democracy in terms of "freedom," e.g., to join a particular political party or not, as compared with being under authoritarian rule. "Having respect and demanding respect," "having the opportunity for education," and "having the ability to be part of something and ensure change," were also regarded as important elements of citizenship and democracy.

One focus group participant in Trinidad and Tobago reported on her research among street vendors in San Fernando, who occupied the roadside illegally after regular market hours. The vendors interpreted their citizenship rights as the responsibility to survive – "everybody have to eat." The persistent clash between the rule of law and people's impulse to eke out a living was seen as an example of the state's lack of responsiveness to its poor citizens, and as constituting a crisis of accountability and governance.

Across classes and ethnicities in both countries, the women activists all agreed that 'citizenship' was a "detached notion" and that "lived citizenship was distant from the realities of people's lives."

Summary of comments from four focus group meetings held in preparation of this report with working and middle class women activists in (Kingston) Jamaica and (St. Augustine and San Fernando) Trinidad and Tobago, in January 2012.

#### 1.1. Women's perspectives on democracy without citizenship

When women activists in the focus group discussions in Jamaica and Trinidad and Tobago, representing different class and ethnic affiliations, discussed issues of citizenship and democracy, they admitted to finding the concept of citizenship "vague." However, the meanings they ascribed converged around 'rights', 'entitlements', 'belonging', 'participation' 'voice', 'agency' and 'respect'. Although these dimensions seemed definite, many felt that they were not clear-cut in their application to everyday life.<sup>1</sup>

#### "A sense of belonging"

Many asserted that citizenship as being "a sense of belonging" to a country was fluid. One participant related that her pregnant friend was planning to leave Jamaica for the USA months before her due date, to secure the child's US citizenship. However, it was recognized that the visa route to citizenship has its own complexity – dual citizenship may bring benefits from two countries, but can disqualify someone from contesting national elections in the Caribbean.<sup>2</sup>

Various issues related to the citizenship rights of Caribbean nationals within the region have generated media interest in recent years, in relation to the CARICOM Single Market and Economy (CSME), in which some 10 categories of persons have been approved under the "Free Movement of People" regime (including graduates from the UWI and all recognized universities, artistes, musicians, sportspersons, media workers, teachers, nurses, artisans with Caribbean Vocational Qualifications, and holders of Associate degrees or comparable qualifications, and most recently household workers). However as recent country studies on "Gender and the CSME" have concluded, the Contingent Rights Protocol which establishes the rights of a spouse to gain employment, children to enter the education system, and the family to have access to social services, is not yet finalized and fully implemented across the community.<sup>3</sup>

While inertia with regard to policy and regulations is evident, there have also been instances of poor treatment of nationals entering certain countries, which call into question the commitment to Caribbean Community<sup>4</sup> citizenship espoused under the CARICOM Single Market and Economy (CSME). For example, the deportation of Guyanese citizens from Barbados under an amnesty law relating to "illegal CARICOM aliens" enacted on 1 June, 2009 raises questions about the free

<sup>1.</sup> Focus group discussions held in Jamaica, January 2012.

<sup>2.</sup> See "The Unresolved Question of Dual Citizenship and Political Representation", In Jamaica Gleaner, December 25, 2011.

<sup>3.</sup> See Tamara Huggins (2010), "Gender Analysis of the CSME and its Impact on Antigua and Barbuda", Draft Report, Unpublished); "An Investigation into Gender Implications of the CSME – the Situation of Dominica, Unpublished; Linnette Vassell with Mavis Campbell (2012), "Gender and the CSME: Jamaica", Unpublished.

<sup>4.</sup> The Caribbean Community (CARICOM) was established in 1972, a common market being an integral aspect. Member countries are Antigua and Barbuda, Bahamas, Barbados, Belize, Dominica, Grenada, Guyana, Haiti, Jamaica, Montserrat, Saint Lucia, St. Kitts and Nevis, St. Vincent and the Grenadines, Suriname, and Trinidad and Tobago. Associate members are the Anglophone non-independent territories: Anguilla, Bermuda, British Virgin Islands, Cayman Islands, and Turks and Caicos Islands.

passage of CARICOM citizens to work within the CSME. The "Barbadian First" amnesty law "resulted in the deportation of Guyanese to resolve the professed rising crime rates and poverty epidemic in Barbados." Guyana, defined in the 1990s as a heavily indebted poor country by the International Monetary Fund and World Bank due to its multibillion-dollar debt burden, faced "extensive job loss, a decreased standard of living, and continuous uncertainty," leading to the out-migration of its citizens, many of them domestic workers, seeking economic opportunities in other Caribbean countries, Barbados and Trinidad and Tobago being key destinations.<sup>5</sup>

Prejudice against Haitians, who constitute the largest body of intra-regional migrants within the Caribbean on the grounds of race, class and religion; and the exploitation of and disrespect to household workers, predominantly women, serve to heighten their vulnerability. Sharing their experiences in focus group discussions in Dominica, migrants saw themselves as excluded from regulations on working conditions, and complained of delays in securing official documents which create an environment for exploitation and illegal activity. Poor treatment at ports of entry was another violation cited by migrants under the CSME. A case currently before the Caribbean Court of Justice (CCJ), involves a Jamaican citizen who was allegedly subjected to demeaning vaginal searches or "finger-rape" by an immigration officer in Barbados on 14 March, 2011.6

These examples raise questions about the meanings of citizenship within CARICOM, in the context of women's vulnerability, the importance of voice in claiming rights and respect, and human security.

#### "Rights stop at Cross Roads"

Focus group participants in Jamaica affirmed the right to vote as a mark of citizenship, having recently experienced a general election on 29 December, 2011.

However, among participants in the middle class focus group, a young academic and activist reported that community members involved in a SISTREN research project<sup>7</sup> had expressed the view that "rights stop at Cross Roads." Cross Roads is a popular geographical demarcation between "uptown" and "down-town" Kingston, between privilege and under-privilege. The SISTREN study examined gender-based violence as obstacles to citizen security and community development in Hannah Town and Rockfort, two inner cities in Kingston, and the focus group participant's statement thus pointed to the gap between rights under the law and poor women's lived access to these rights.

<sup>5.</sup> See Andrew Herweg (2009), "Barbados first' policy flogs Guyanese in Barbados", In Council of Hemispheric Affairs, 5 August, 2006, Accessible at: http://www.coha.org/barbadian-first-policy-flogs-guyanese-in-barbados/; Andaiye (2011), "Promoting and Protecting the Rights of Migrant Domestic Workers in CARICOM", Presented at the Global Forum on Migration and Development (GFMD), Jamaica Conference Centre, Kingston, Jamaica, September 7-8, 2011, Accessible at: http://www.google.tt/#hl=en&sugexp=frgbld&gs\_nf=1&cp=52&gs\_id=a0&xhr=t&q=Deportation+of+Guyanese+women+household+workers+from+Barbados&pf=p&rlz=1C2ECWD\_en-GBTT464TT464&sclient=psy-ab&oq=Deportation+of+Guyanese+women+household+workers+from+Barbados&aq=f&aqi=&aql=&gs\_l=&pbx=1&bav=on.2,or.r\_gc.r\_pw.r\_qf,cf.osb&fp=31d0849f3382550c&biw=1920&bih=930

<sup>6.</sup> Karyl Walker (2011), "Finger-raped in Barbados, J'can woman deported after shameful cavity search by immigration officer", 24 March, 2011, Accessible at: http://www.jamaicaobserver.com/news/Finger-raped-in-Barbados\_8573453#ixzz1NCqphKEy

<sup>7</sup> SISTREN Theatre Collective (2009), "Tek it to dem and rise up wi community", Baseline Report, May 2009.

One of the Jamaican focus groups comprised working class women activists who live "below Cross Roads." They narrated their daily experiences of discrimination and being treated as second-class citizens in a variety of settings – as consumers seeking to buy household goods in the mid-town wholesale supermarket, as parents within the school system, as workers on the job market – all of which represented a short-changing of their access to equal rights and justice. In their experience, "dangling a car key on your finger," or "showing up in your jacket-suit," was a passport to respectful communication, preferential service and recognition, whether at the supermarket or their child's school. They saw education as the only accessible stepping stone to securing respect and their rights as equal citizens in society, and feared that their children's prospects could be blighted if they spoke out or protested. They also referred to "the way that women tear down other women," as being particularly painful. These behaviours "bring down your self-esteem, undermine your hope, your sense of rights and you feel depressed, that you are not wanted." The informants also raised the "bad treatment of the elderly in the home and on the street," and the "even worse treatment of persons who are HIV positive, disabled and/or illiterate."

The Caribbean independence project has not effectively addressed the internalized oppressions reflected in these experiences. These and the other painful experiences of daily life reveal how patterns of discrimination and exclusion normalized by the state are perpetuated in women's day-to-day interactions in their communities, and the process of silencing experienced by poor women.

#### "No gays in my Cabinet"

The Jamaican focus groups also discussed the link between the right to express one's sexual orientation and the right to participate in public life. The discussion hinged on a statement made by the former Jamaican Prime Minister that there would be "no gays in my Cabinet." In a debate during the 2011 election campaign, Portia Simpson-Miller, now the elected Prime Minister, stated that her political party (the People's National Party) believed in protecting the human rights of all Jamaicans and that no one should be discriminated against because of their sexual orientation. She stated that she would facilitate a review of the Buggery Law and proposed that Parliamentarians should vote with their conscience on any amendment. This position was strongly condemned by the vocal evangelical section of the Church, but not among all denominations.

Portia Simpson-Miller's position found support among Jamaican focus group participants, even as some women in the working class group tended to separate themselves from the issue: "I don't believe in homosexuality," at the same time that they agreed that persons had the right to express their sexual orientation, "but in private." The middle class group expressed greater openness to state recognition for sexual orientation. Both groups agreed that opening the discussion on the

<sup>8.</sup> Focus group held in preparation of this report, Kingston, Jamaica, January 2012.

<sup>9. &</sup>quot;Morality can't be policed – tackle homosexuality through moral suasion," says Rev. Oliver Daley in The Sunday Gleaner, December 25, 2011, p. A10.

issue of sexual rights represented an important step forward in the Caribbean. This assessment is supported by the LGBTQ community itself.<sup>10</sup>

Thus Jamaican women's evaluation of the performance of democracy after 50 years of independence indicates that duty bearers are failing in their basic obligations to women, who represent over half the society. Although there are positive developments such as women's increased educational access and achievements, the underlying assumption that power and leadership are the rightful domain of men still persists, whether in parliament and local government, on boards and commissions, or in family and community life. Political parties, despite lofty manifestos, have tended to operate as election campaign machineries rather than institutions with a broader development mandate, and need to be held to account. Their male-biased party culture, internal structures, candidate selection and financing processes have militated against increasing women's political representation and leadership. While women do exercise leadership in the private sphere of the home, their contribution is still undervalued. And although many demands are made on the home for positive outcomes for society, the requisite resources are not prioritized by policy-makers and the shortfall is expected to be met by women.

## 1.2 Theoretical perspectives on women's citizenship and democracy in the Caribbean

The comments summarized above reflect the views of women who live in Caribbean states committed to a liberal democratic governance system. This framework speaks to the "universal citizen – an individual with rights, who engages with governance institutions or the state in the public arena of political debate" (Meer, 2004: 2). It assumes that citizens have equal rights, duties and status, and that "principles of inequality deriving from gender, ethnicity, class, or other contexts are not supposed to be of relevance to the status of citizenship" (Yuval-Davis, 2006: 70). However, these positions have been questioned by focus group participants (reflected in the box and Section 1.1. above), and feminists scholars and advocates in the Caribbean<sup>11</sup> and globally, who have expanded our understandings of citizenship by exposing how the claims of 'universal citizenship' masks the reality of gender and other forms of inequality.

The contesting perspectives on 'universal citizenship' has meant unmasking the 'public/ private dichotomy' in which men were viewed as citizens with rights, responsibilities, freedoms and privileges in the 'public sphere' (Habermas, 1989), while women occupied the 'private sphere' of the home and family. Feminist philosopher, Nancy Fraser has argued that the bourgeois public sphere constituted a "number of significant exclusions," and discriminated against women and the lower social strata of society. "This network of clubs and associations – philanthropic, civic, professional,

<sup>10.</sup> See "Let's do more to protect gay rights for Jamaica," in *The Sunday Gleaner*, 29 January, 2012, p. A9.

<sup>11.</sup> See Barriteau (1998); Reddock (2004); and Mohammed (2011).

and cultural – was anything but accessible to everyone. On the contrary, it was the arena, the training ground and eventually the power base of a stratum of bourgeois men who were coming to see themselves as a 'universal class' and preparing to assert their fitness to govern." Thus, she argues that the public/ private split has framed the differential access to citizenship rights by men and women, and perpetuated the subordination of women (Fraser, 1990, 56-80).

The purpose of this report is to examine women's experiences of citizenship and struggles for gender justice in the Caribbean during the 'independence project', and to "recommend strategies and actions to facilitate the full exercise of women's citizenship and gender parity in the Anglophone Caribbean." <sup>12</sup>

In exploring women's citizenship in the Anglophone Caribbean democracies, this study marks an important historical moment for Jamaica and Trinidad and Tobago, the first two countries in the group to have achieved independence from British colonial rule in 1962. As they celebrate and reflect on 50 years of national independence this year, the widely held view is that "a consistent record of commitment to democracy" has been established in the region despite challenges of poverty and underdevelopment (Barrow-Giles and Joseph, 2006: 1).

This study is necessarily concerned with the legacy of the colonial period in the gendered construction of democracy. The anti-colonial movements and struggles which defined and shaped the processes of constitutional decolonization and political independence, included women who articulated their interest in democracy for the achievement of nationhood as well as to secure their civil and political liberties. However, male dominance in the political, economic and social processes framed the independence project, and it is not surprising that the 1962 Jamaican Constitution failed to secure women's fundamental citizenship rights by not prohibiting discrimination on the basis of sex.<sup>13</sup> As Patricia Mohammed points out, while gender inequities were experienced at the individual, domestic and private, collective, institutional and public levels, they remained "marginal issues" up until the 1960s (2011: 5). Thus, it was in 2011, almost 50 years after Jamaica's independence, that the Charter of Fundamental Rights and Freedoms corrected this long standing injustice within the Jamaica Constitution, while carrying forward many other negative vestiges of the past.<sup>14</sup>

Throughout the report, democracy's commitments are juxtaposed and evaluated against its practical meanings and outcomes for women through an examination of Caribbean political economy; new social and political actors, including the feminist movement; and women's social, economic and political citizenship. The focus group meetings convened in the preparation of this report have enabled working and middle class women activists in Jamaica and Trinidad and Tobago,

<sup>13.</sup> See Constitution of Jamaica (1962), Section 24 (3).

<sup>14.</sup> Jamaican Charter of Fundamental Rights and Freedoms (2011), Accessible at: http://www2.ohchr.org/english/bodies/hrc/docs/ngos/JSSR\_Jamaica.HRC103\_Anne

to discuss their experiences of gender, race/ethnicity/colour, class and other forms of discrimination and exclusion. Indeed, when the General Secretary of the National Union of Domestic Employees (NUDE) in Trinidad and Tobago asked, "Are domestic workers citizens?", 15 the question seemed to encode an expectation of citizenship that extends beyond traditional understandings of civil and political rights to embrace poor women's lived realities. In articulating and expressing their citizenship, women have exposed the deficits of democracy and challenged the system to deliver on its claims of liberty, equality and justice, among others.

For Maxine Molyneux, the conceptualization of citizenship in women's experiences of everyday life has enabled their worth to be identified, valued and evaluated, and "how their distinctive political subjectivity could find expression" (2007: 175). <sup>16</sup> This is not to suggest that active citizenship will be the same among all women, for from the birds-eye view of the focus groups, differences in emphasis do emerge. Speaking from the African context, Robins et al have observed that such differences might be due to the "differential capacity" of the middle class and the "popular classes" to exercise power when making demands on the state, and that this may shape their perspectives on citizenship (Robins, Cornwall and Von Lieres, 2008: 1069-1086). While these differences are important and must be closely analyzed, what is also interesting to note is that regardless of their particular locations and perspectives, the women across socio-economic classes have brought to the fore various dimensions of citizenship including democratic, economic, social, sexual and reproductive, and global – which now form the core of the ongoing debate on citizenship (McClain and Crossman, 2009), and pose new issues and dilemmas for future organizing and advocacy in the Caribbean.

Understanding and responding to the particular needs and interests of women across differences of class, race/ethnicity, age, (dis)ability and sexual orientation will be vital if Caribbean women's organizing is to move forward purposefully into the next 50 years of independence.<sup>17</sup> This would need to constitute a clear departure from the past 50 years during which, according to Tracy Robinson, Caribbean feminists "often adopted a pragmatic response, more concerned with addressing Caribbean women's specific social and economic issues than with challenging how citizenship is constructed" (2003: 231). This pragmatism has meant that, to a large extent, the women's rights struggles in the independence period have been framed largely within the broad agenda of international platforms for action, adapted to national and regional priorities.<sup>18</sup> While this focus has raised public awareness, strengthened women's organizing and led to important gains

<sup>15.</sup> Focus group meeting held in St. Augustine, Trinidad and Tobago, January 2012.

<sup>16.</sup> Molyneux notes in the paper that the Caribbean is not treated in any detail.

<sup>17.</sup> The Institute for Gender and Development Studies (IGDS), The University of the West Indies (UWI), Mona Campus, Jamaica is co-hosting with WROC and FES a series of "Conversations on Independence" which includes gender and citizenship; the IGDS, UWI, St. Augustine Campus, Trinidad and Tobago is engaged in a research project on "Politics, Power and Gender Justice in the Anglophone Caribbean", which explores women's understanding of politics and possibilities for gender transformation; and the 37th Annual Conference of the Caribbean Studies Association, to be held on May 28-June 1, 2012 in Guadeloupe, is exploring the theme, "Unpacking Caribbean Citizenship: Rights, Participation and Belonging".

<sup>18.</sup> The Beijing Platform for Action (1995) identified 12 critical areas of concern as follows: women and poverty, education and training, health, violence, armed conflict, the economy, power and decision-making, institutional mechanisms for the advancement of women, human rights of women, the media, the environment and the girl child. Division for the Advancement of Women (DAW), United Nations, New York.

particularly in terms of legal rights and attention to critical single issues facing women, it has failed to connect the dots across the various dimensions of women's experience of subordination and discrimination. According to Robinson, one consequence of this approach is that,

TW]e have tended to view the question of women's citizenship as uncontroversial ..., as having been resolved by the independence enfranchisement of women and by independence and post-independence constitutional provisions (2003: 231).

After 50 years of the independence project in the Anglophone Caribbean, it is important to grapple with state accountability for advancing women's full political, economic, social, cultural and sexual citizenship, and to define a collective way forward for securing women's empowerment, gender justice and sustainable human development in the region.



A historical perspective on the political economy of Caribbean democracy



## 2. A historical perspective on the political economy of Caribbean democracy

#### 2.1 Background

Dependency and resistance as ingrained features of Caribbean political economy are rooted in its 500-year history of colonial domination which started with the Spanish incursion into the Americas in the late 15<sup>th</sup> century and included the genocide of the Indigenous peoples, African slavery, Indian indentureship and other forms of forced immigration, as well as the struggles against servitude and towards nationhood.

The dependent colonies of the Anglophone Caribbean were an important cog in the wheel of the British imperial project of wealth creation. In response, they were well served by the attendant political system that offered 'democracy' to capital interests at the expense of the exploited masses. The African majority, regarded as property in the production and export of plantation sugar and later bananas, underpinned the citizenship rights of the predominantly white male propertied class. African men and women were denigrated within a system stratified by race, colour, class and gender. In territories such as Guyana and Trinidad and Tobago with significant Indian immigration in the post-slavery period, the indentured labourers were seen as instruments to sustain labour force competition with the African population, while themselves facing harsh living and working conditions. Democracy for the propertied class was thus secured by the continued subjugation of the majority African and the Indian populations across the Caribbean. Within this framework, women's citizenship was circumscribed by a colonial gender policy built on European values whose influence has been pervasive, reaching across history into the contemporary period.

#### 2.2 Colonial gender policy

In the period spanning the abolition of African slavery by the British in 1830s to the anti-colonial and pre-independence movements of the 1940s and '50s, Linden Lewis states that the outcomes for women were shaped by a colonial state that was "masculinist in its personnel, orientation and policy formulation" (2002: 512-530). This had its basis in the social contract theory of the Enlightenment which defined political right in terms of "patriarchal right or sex right, the power that men exercise

over women" (Pateman, 1988: 1). Although the separation of the private and public spheres has had little basis in reality for the majority of Caribbean women who have always been active as workers in the public sphere, the ideology that 'women's place is in the home' has been pervasive.

Colonial gender policy, buttressed by Victorian ideology, thus defined a subordinate position for women vis-à-vis men in all aspects of political, economic and socio-cultural life, and essentialized their identities as wives and mothers under the authority of men within the private sphere (Vassell, 1998: 190-201). Rhoda Reddock explains how the process of "housewifization" in Trinidad and Tobago involved the elaboration of the content, strategies and guidelines that governed the colonial education of girls towards "limited occupational and vocational opportunities" in line with their "domestic status" (1994: 47-69). Joan French documents the process for Jamaica, demonstrating how colonial policy guided women away from paid labour and into voluntary labour and housewife status in subordination to men, resulting in the new trade union movement becoming predominantly male, with domestic service becoming the main - and marginalized domain of working-class women (1995: 121-146). In Jamaica, when men's right to vote as citizens were extended in 1908 under a reduced tax qualification, women were excluded under law until 1919 when a limited number of upper and middle class women first gained the right to vote, but on unequal terms with men (Vassell, 1993: 40-54). The education policy, which reflected the male dominant value system of the state and shaped the life chances of women, continues to influence the gendered characteristics of the Caribbean labour market in the contemporary period.

The colonial state, as the agent of the metropolitan government, had ruled in the interests of the upper classes, but also had a "sensitivity ... to threats either to social peace or administrative order" which informed the advance to self-government (Munroe, 1962: 31). It espoused liberal democratic values of: (a) assertion of rights and respect for civil liberties – freedom of association, religious expression and the right to own private property; (b) restricted local involvement, which opened the way for the middle strata to participate in politics; and (c) a liberal authoritarian system of government managed by a bureaucracy focused on social order (Ledgister, 2006). With regard to women, the focus was on women's service, not women's rights.

#### 2.3 Women's early organizations for social reform and political rights

Caribbean women advocated for women's rights, drawing on a historical legacy of women's resistance and influenced by the first wave of the international feminist movement in the 19th and early 20th centuries. Their history of organizing includes religious and social welfare organizations, civic and political organizations, trade unions and women's arms of political parties (Shepherd, 1999).

The Women's Self-Help Movement was one of the earliest manifestations, where colonial governors' wives organized white women to teach poor women 'housewifery skills', and initiated income generating projects based on needle work skills. The movement included Lady Musgrave's Self Help Society of Jamaica founded in 1895, and the Trinidad Home Industries and Women's Self Help Society founded in 1901 (Reddock, 1994: 163). Numerous other organizations, many transplanted from Britain, undertook charitable work to build and extend the influence of the various Christian religious denominations and to respond to issues such as maternity and child care. The granting of the Municipal vote to women in Belize in 1912 (Reddock, 1994: 164-166), and the struggle of elite women for the vote in Jamaica in 1919 signalled a consciousness around political rights. The Suffragist movement was an inspiration to female agitators in the Caribbean (Vassell, 1993: 40-54).

The early 20th century also saw black and coloured middle class women organizing and campaigning independently for women's rights and social reforms. Audrey Jeffers founded the Coterie of Social Workers in Trinidad and Tobago in the 1920s and under its patronage the First Conference of British West Indian and British Guianese Women Social Workers was held in Port of Spain in 1936. The Coterie was responsible for creating school meal programmes known as "Breakfast Sheds", aimed at providing hot and free or almost free meals for primary school children. Similarly, the Jamaica Women's Liberal Club founded by Amy Bailey, Mary Morris-Knibb and other black middle class women in 1936, organized campaigns for social, economic and political reforms for women, and elaborated a programme of demands at its first All Island Women's Conference held in 1939. Audrey Jeffers and Mary Morris-Knibb were to become the first Caribbean women elected to municipal office in 1936 and 1939 respectively, and their organizations served to link the struggles for social welfare and political reform to the broader nationalist agenda (French and Ford-Smith, 1986; and Reddock, 1994).

#### 2.4 The labour movement

The 1920s and '30s proved a volatile period for the Caribbean region. Labour rebellions flourished and many of the Caribbean's colonized peoples, recognizing the economic depression, racism, and decreased living and working standards, sought new ways to organize themselves and demand social, economic and political change. The labour movements drew their impetus from the earlier resistance to African slavery and Indian indentureship, and the international labour and socialist movements. Their struggles for democratic rights for workers and the broad masses

of men and women included demands for improved working conditions and wage increases; marches against hunger, unemployment and poverty; and protests against tax increases. These demands spanned the sugar cane plantations in St. Kitts and Nevis, St. Vincent and the Grenadines, and Trinidad and Tobago; the oilfields in Trinidad and Tobago; and the wharves in Jamaica, among others (Hart, 2002; and Higman, 2011).

Marches and demonstrations catapulted Trinidad and Tobago into violence and unrest, in which women labourers participated actively. Reddock recounts that on 23 July, 1922, after the manager and the overseer of Esperanza sugar cane plantation failed to reduce the work tasks from 40 banks to 20–24 tasks, the weeders, bankers and para-grass gang attacked the overseer (2005: 23-25). Indian women who often worked as weeders were described as follows: during the attack "even the women of Central Trinidad beat the overseers with hooks and crook sticks when they sought to force people to work" (Basdeo, 1982: 56). Similarly at the Brechin Castle sugar cane plantation it was reported that women weeders, due to heavy workloads and the failure of the overseer to reduce their tasks, attacked the overseer with hoes and were taken into custody. On 6 July, 1934, eight hundred workers from the Brechin Castle and Esperanza sugar cane plantations held demonstrations to protest the lack of work. This protest soon turned violent when the police attempted to quell the situation and prevent the protesters from congregating in the commercial area of the town (Hart, 2002).

Women also figured largely in the 1935 disturbances in St. Vincent and the Grenadines. Due to the Windward Islands' governor, Sir Selwyn Grier and the St. Vincent Legislative Council's plan to increase government revenue by increasing taxes, in addition to the high tariff that was already placed on local sugar, workers of two estates near to Georgetown initiated a strike on 21 October, 1935. Workers also gathered in the capital city of Kingstown as the legislature was to meet again for a second reading of the Bill to increase taxes. As the local town council member was meeting with the governor with a list of the demonstrators' grievances, violence erupted. It was reported that "the original number of rioters was fifteen women armed with sticks and stones. They were shortly joined by about 200 of their male counterparts armed with stones, sledge hammers, cutlasses and knives" (Gonsalves, n.d., quoted in Reddock, 2005: 27).

Women's contribution to Caribbean labour movement has been significant, but often ignored. Bolland recounts the 1894 labour disturbances in Jamaica where soldiers, men and women attacked the police at Fletcher's Land and Sutton Street (2001: 175); and Rodney notes that during the stevedores' strikes of 1905 in Guyana, women domestics went on strike and marched in the streets (1981: 206). In addition, they not only organized and fought side by side with men in the unions, but also rose to become trade union leaders and some even formed their own organizations. Ramdin (1982: 123) and Reddock (2005: 22) chronicle that as early as 22 July, 1844, six hundred male and female workers and small producers formed the Trinidad Free Labourers Society in Couva.

The Trinidad Workingmen's Association (TWA) led by Captain Cipriani created a space for women workers to become members, since the association was organized into gender-based occupational sections such as stevedores, fishermen, labourers, seamstresses and domestics. By 1927, two women's sections were formed, located in Port of Spain – Women's Section No. 1, led by Erica Alkins, a milliner from Barbados; and the Domestics Section or Women's Section No. 2, led by Theresa Ojoe. In 1928, Helena Manuel, a member of the TWA, founded the Trinidad Cocoa Planters and Labouring Classes Association. A year later, with Hubert Carrington, she founded the Trinidad and Tobago National Trade Union Centre, and by 1930 this umbrella organization's membership would number around 2,000 (Lewis, 1977: 27; Ramdin, 1982: 72; and Reddock, 2008: 11).

The British Empire Workers and Citizens Home Rule Party, also known as the Butler Party, attracted large numbers of women. Led by labour leader, Tubal Uriah "Buzz" Butler, who gained prominence during this period as he led hunger marches from the oilfields of south Trinidad to Port of Spain in protest against poor working conditions, racism and exploitation on the oil fields, the Butler Party included a Women's Committee. While its main mission was to prepare meals and deliver them to the male strikers, the women of the Committee and the larger Butler Party took on a more substantial role as the riots escalated in 1937. It has been recounted that when Butler was to be arrested on 19 June, 1937 by Corporal Charlie King, a group of women chased and beat King, and when he broke his legs jumping through a window to escape, petrol was thrown over his body and he was set on fire. Three weeks of unrest followed, with women being prominent in the strikes and demonstrations which rocked south Trinidad. At the end of the unrest twenty three people were arrested, with five women and four men placed on trial for the murder of Corporal King, and ten women and fourteen men for unlawful assembly (Reddock, 2005: 30-31).

In Jamaica, as French and Ford-Smith recount, women made a strong contribution to the labour riots of 1938. They were among the strikers in Kingston and the rural areas. They demonstrated and marched; mobilized women to protest; faced police bullets; were stoned, wounded, and one woman was among those killed; faced imprisonment; took legal action against the police; wrote letters to the press; and cooked and fed the strikers. Working class and unemployed women as well as middle class women were active, and many built the energy towards the formation of trade unions (1986: 49-66).

The formation of trade unions in the 1930s served to sustain workers' advocacy, and build leadership and organizational capacity. Along with citizens' associations and other civic groups, they constituted an important interest group which galvanized the formation and mobilization of political parties around an explicit anti-colonial agenda. The Barbados Labour Party, and in Jamaica the People's National Party and Jamaica Labour Party originated from these roots. However, while playing a significant role in the path towards constitutional decolonization and independence, political parties would also serve to entrench differences based on race/ethnicity and class within the culture of party politics, particularly in the case in Guyana and Trinidad and Tobago. Yet race/ethnicity has played a pivotal role in Caribbean resistance.

In spite of (unsuccessful) attempts to organize domestics made by the Bustamante Industrial Trade Union, Jamaican labour unions largely ignored women's specific concerns and their analysis of the impact and implications for women of prevailing labour conditions, until the surge of feminist organizing in the 1970s. The few women such as Gladys Longbridge (later Lady Bustamante) who were visible as women leaders were revered for their service to the male leadership rather than representing the need for the full participation and recognition of women. However, in the 1970s and '80s, women like Marva Phillips confronted issues of women's equality within union organizing, and today the labour unions in Jamaica exhibit the highest representation of women in decision-making positions of all social movements. These women also joined the struggle for the expansion of maternity leave rights.<sup>19</sup>

#### 2.5 The experience of national independence

Women's activism and organizing fed into the anti-colonial and independence movements of the 1940s and '50s and the processes of negotiating constitutional decolonization and national independence by the male political leadership. While women were granted the vote equally with men under universal adult suffrage, beginning with Jamaica in 1944 and ending with the Bahamas in 1962 (see Section 5.3, Table 3), this did not alter the male-female power relations inherited from the colonial period with regard to other civil liberties, such as women's equal access to the labour market.

The independence project itself, founded largely on the institutional systems and values of Great Britain, did not significantly transform the concentration of economic and social power in the hands of the elite. Upon independence, political power was handed over to Caribbean citizens, predominantly African-Caribbean men who aimed to strengthen democracy in the newly independent states as the years progressed, with Guyana and then Jamaica declaring a commitment to democratic socialist programmes in attempts to further throw off the yoke of dependency and neo-colonialism.

Within this construct, new women's organizations sprang up to challenge the limited theoretical and organizational frameworks of the political parties and their women's arms', based on the realities faced by women. In so doing they expanded the analysis and content of women's organizing to include the domestic, personal and inter-personal spheres, including women's unpaid labour, domestic work, and violence against women. These alliances on specific issues were facilitated by personal relationships and critical thinking among the leadership of the 'women's arms' of political parties and the new feminist organizations.<sup>20</sup>

In Guyana in 1970, President Linden Forbes Burnham declared Guyana a Socialist Co-operative Republic, and he and the People's National Congress (PNC) believed that "co-operative socialism"

<sup>19.</sup> Joan French, Personal communication, April 2012.

<sup>20.</sup> Joan French, Ibid.

would generate national development. As outlined by Burnham in the *Declaration of Sophia* in 1974, the main goals of the socialist government were to ensure: "that the people of Guyana own and control ... the natural resources of the country, the "transferring [of] economic power to the masses," the "ending of poverty and the building of a just and classless or egalitarian society," and the "production for human need rather than ... for profit" (Chandsingh, 1980: 59). Touted as the means of ownership and production for the "little man," Burnham believed that this economic and political system represented a throwing-off of Guyana's imperial and colonial legacy and would strengthen the newly independent state.

The Women's Revolutionary Socialist Movement (WRSM) emerged as the women's arm of the party chaired by Viola Burnham, wife of the President. The WRSM promoted and developed educational programmes and income-generating projects especially for rural women, among them the Rice Van Shop project which centred on the use of locally grown rice flour instead of imported wheat flour for bread, pastries, cakes and other products (Dankelman and Davidson, 1988: 150). However, while the WRSM worked within communities and advocated on behalf of women, the PNC hierarchy was male-dominated, a phenomenon which the WRSM failed to challenge. Of the four political parties contesting the 16 July, 1973 elections, only 26 or 12.2% of the 212 candidates were women. Among them was future President Janet Jagan, wife of Cheddi Jagan, leader of the opposition People's Progressive Party (PPP), and the only woman in the PPP's list of 53 candidates (McAlmont, 2011).

At the First Biennial Conference of the PNC held in August 1975, President Burnham admitted to the male-dominated hierarchy of the party and agreed that it had not done enough to end discrimination against women in the country. At the First Biennial Conference of the WRSM held in February 1979, Burnham also admitted to discrimination against women in the party and the government. In his speech, he stated that, "... the Women's Auxiliary Members have been carrying out those tasks and duties, which our hitherto benighted society tended to associate exclusively with women and thought that women were exclusively fitted for .... Our women in the People's National Congress are not going to be banished for all time to the kitchen, are not going to be relegated to looking after the needs of men at every level ...." (McAlmont, 2011: 4-5). However, by Burnham's passing in 1985, the co-operative socialist movement and the PNC government had done little towards legislating equality for women.

Other social movements and organizations were also founded in Guyana during this period, many having regional and international influence. The Working People's Alliance (WPA), founded in Guyana in November 1974 and led by Walter Rodney, was created to fight against race-based elections, worsening economic conditions and political oppression (Westmaas, 2009: 106). The Red Thread Women's Development Organization was founded in 1986 by the middle class women who headed the WPA's Women's Development Committee. Women such as Andaiye, the International Secretary of the WPA, initiated income generating projects for women in four communities, which

included the production of embroidered pillowcases, wall hangings and greeting cards. Out of this, Red Thread emerged as an organization to give a voice to grassroots women (Trotz, 2007: 72). Red Thread's strategy was to use the traditional skills of grassroots women representing the major ethnic groups in the country (African-Guyanese, Indian-Guyanese and Indigenous women) as the starting-point for consciousness-raising and actions to transform their lives. Red Thread's organizing included a combination of personal empowerment (e.g., empowering Indian-Guyanese women to assert their autonomy and social, economic and political rights), women's specific concerns (e.g., the recognition of women's unpaid labour, and advocacy on sexual and reproductive health rights including abortion), and macro-issues from the perspective of working class women (e.g., food prices, the economy, and corruption and accountability).<sup>21</sup>

In Jamaica, Michael Manley and the People's National Party (PNP) appealed to "radicalized youth," who were dissatisfied with the unequal distribution of wealth that had marked Jamaica Labour Party (JLP) rule. Kaufman explains that Manley's increased popularity was based on his charismatic personality which drew on "Rastafarian imagery, a watered-down black power appeal, and intellectual and persuasive oratory adaptable to the streets or the boardroom." With a philosophy centred on slogans such as "Better must come," "It's time for a government of love," and "Power for the people," Manley appealed to the country's nationalist aspirations and was elected Prime Minister in 1972. A democratic socialist programme was unveiled two years after the PNP's election to power, although it would take four years for it to be clearly defined (Kaufman, 1985: 71).

The PNP Women's Movement (PNPWM), founded in July 1973, played a significant role in the election of the PNP. It served as an auxiliary to the PNP from its inception until 1977 when it became an independent party group. The PNPWM comprised working class and poor women throughout Jamaica, and was led by middle class women such as Beverly Manley, wife of the Prime Minister. In seeking to link women's struggle against oppression and discrimination with the democratic-socialist state, the PNPWM established itself as a key advocate for progressive legislation on women. For example, in alliance with the Committee of Women for Progress (CWP) which was linked to the Marxist Workers Party of Jamaica, and with the broad support of women's organizations, a maternity leave law was passed in 1979 which protected working women over the age of 18 from being fired if pregnant, and granted them eight (8) weeks of paid maternity leave and an additional four (4) weeks without pay. The CWP and PNPWM, as the Joint Committee for Women's Rights (JCWR), were also vocal about the high prices of food caused by a balance of payments crisis which was affecting many women, a disproportionate number of whom were heads of households. The JCWR lobbied the PNP government for a stronger government price policy and price inspectors who would work with the Prices Commission to ensure that food prices were regulated (Kaufman, 1985: 177-178).

Sistren Theatre Collective, whose members came primarily from the special employment programme instituted by the PNP, brought together grassroots and middle class women. Using

<sup>21.</sup> Joan French, Personal communication, April 2012.

and developing the new methodology of drama in education, they brought issues from the daily lives of working class women to national attention, including violence against women and incest. They showed the connections between the widespread phenomenon of teenage pregnancy and girls'ignorance about their sexuality, poverty and economic dependence on men. They articulated the oppressions faced by working class women through the lenses of race, class, male power and privilege, and power issues between women of different classes (see Ford-Smith's "Ring Ding in a Tight Corner", 1989). SISTREN's activism strengthened and extended the advocacy on maternity leave, food prices, and the rights of domestic workers (whose right to maternity leave was strongly contested by middle class women). At first, the women's arms of political parties were not ready to confront the issues raised by SISTREN, but some issues (e.g., violence against women and women's domestic labour) eventually found a consensual place in the struggle for women's citizenship, with gradual legislative as well as institutional changes.<sup>22</sup>

Due to what has been described as "the first shock to the post-independence Jamaican economy, after a decade of neo-colonial economic growth," Jamaica under Manley negotiated its first structural adjustment and standby loan package from the IMF in 1977 (Clark and Howard, 2006: 108). This decision was influenced by the rising price of crude oil, as well as the failure to mobilize needed support from socialist countries or from friendly Western countries, outside of an IMF framework.<sup>23</sup> Seven more loan packages would be negotiated between 1977 and 1990 and these would have dire consequences for the people of Jamaica, especially low income women and men. Balance of payments constraints ensued, and social services and social welfare programmes were sharply cut. More specifically, health programmes for women and children were cut or funding drastically reduced, and between 1977–1989 women's formal employment decreased from 52% to 44%. On the other hand, employment of women in "unprotected jobs" such as in free trade zones, increased from 12% to 18% in the same period. Unemployment among women rose from 30% in 1977 to 35% in 1983 (Clark and Howard, 2006: 109). SISTREN joined the struggle against IMF conditionalities and food prices led by the CWP/ OWP and democratic socialist women, articulating the implications for poor women, children and families.<sup>24</sup>

The New World Group, established in 1963, of which Trinidad and Tobago's Lloyd Best and Jamaica's Norman Girvan played leading roles, emerged from the University of Guyana and other universities in the region. Consisting of a group of Caribbean intellectuals who considered themselves to be the "conscience of the region" (Girvan, 1969: 4), New Worldism sought to restructure the political, economic and social spheres of Caribbean societies and in so doing, "expose the subjugation of the Caribbean" (Thomas, 1992: 394).

Early Caribbean post-independence economic and trade policies sought to reform mono-crop agriculture and mining and implement import substitution, strategies that were being used by

<sup>22.</sup> Joan French, Personal communication, April 2012.

<sup>23.</sup> Professor Anthony Bogues' address to the Michael Manley Foundation, April 2012, as reported by Joan French.

<sup>24.</sup> Joan French, Personal communication, April 2012.

decolonizing countries across the world up until the 1980s. Caribbean governments subsequently attempted to attract foreign direct investment and promote industrialization by invitation, accompanied by strategies and measures such as liberalization, privatization and deregulation. While stimulating growth in some sectors, these approaches did not significantly shift the main features of dependence, although oil in Trinidad and Tobago and tourism across the region emerged as major investment sectors in Caribbean economies.

Nor, as was expected, did they result in positive outcomes for the majority of men and women in the region. For example, the liberalization of the sugar and banana commodity markets in the European Union has eroded the traditional trade preferences for Caribbean Community (CARICOM) exports, causing male and female workers in these agricultural sectors in Dominica, Jamaica, St. Lucia, and St. Vincent and the Grenadines to be robbed of livelihoods. The 2008/2009 poverty assessment in Dominica revealed that the number of banana farmers fell from 6,000 to 1,000 in five years, and ex-banana farmers were forced into dependence on wage labour.<sup>25</sup>

The economic vulnerability of Caribbean small island developing states (SIDS), and most notably those located in the Eastern Caribbean, has been further exposed by natural disasters. They are among the most disaster prone countries in the world due to the large number of hurricanes experienced (IMF, 2004: 7). Since 1970, twelve large natural disasters in Eastern Caribbean countries have been linked to a 2.2% decrease in GDP growth, a decline in agricultural production and exports, increases in imports, and deteriorating circumstances for women, children and the elderly who constitute the majority of the vulnerable population, and those least likely to benefit from earning incomes from relief and rehabilitation works (ECLAC, 2005: 36-37).

While several initiatives, for example in health, education, security and disaster management have been pursued to good effect, the CARICOM Single Market and Economy (CSME), an instrument towards more effective economic collaboration, has acknowledged an "implementation deficit" and "a loss of momentum with regard to the regional integration agenda" (Thomas, 2010). In addition, shocks due to the 2008 global financial crisis have overtaken any positive trade-induced price changes that emerged as a result of liberalization. For example, some 80,000 to 100,000 jobs have been lost in Jamaica since 2009, resulting in a free fall of disposable incomes among men and women at all levels. These conditions have forced Caribbean states to enter or re-enter into borrowing relationships with the International Monetary Fund (IMF) and other multilateral bodies. Since 2008, eight CARICOM countries – Antigua and Barbuda, Belize, Dominica, Grenada, Jamaica, St Kitts and Nevis, St Lucia, and St Vincent and the Grenadines – have negotiated agreements with the IMF to cope with the negative economic and social impacts of the current crisis. The cumulative effects of persistent underdevelopment, a feature of decolonizing countries across the global South, are evident in increasing indebtedness across the Caribbean and accompanying increases in poverty.

<sup>25.</sup> See Country Poverty Assessment, Dominica 2008/09, Draft vol. 1 – Main Report, submitted to the Caribbean Development Bank by Kairi Consultants, Trinidad and Tobago, pp. xvi-xvii.

<sup>26.</sup> See Submission of the Private Sector Working Group on Tax Reform made to the Taxation Committee of Parliament of Jamaica, 6 January 2012.

The table below of comparative poverty rates between 1998 and 2008 in Grenada, Carriacou and Petit Martinique shows that in addition to the 37.7 % of the population classified as poor, another 14.6% was classified as vulnerable.

Table 1: Comparison of 1998 and 2008 poverty rates: Grenada, Carriacou and Petit Martinique

Poverty Indicators (1996 and 2007/08 compared	% Individuals 1998	% Individuals 2008
Indigence Rate	12.29	2.4
Poverty Headcount Index (Poverty Rate)	32.1	37.7
Vulnerability Rate (Vulnerable but not poor)	n/a	14.6

Source: Country Poverty Assessment, Grenada, Carriacou and Petit Martinique 2007/08, vol. 1, Main Report, Caribbean Development Bank by Kairi Consultants, Trinidad and Tobago, 2008, p. xvi.

In 2008, the national debt as a percentage of GDP among CARICOM countries ranged from 15.6% for Trinidad and Tobago to 120.1% for Guyana. Jamaica's debt-to-GDP ratio was approximately 150% in 2010, and currently stands at 130%. With regard to poverty, country assessments conducted between 1996 and 2006 reveal that the percentage of persons below the poverty line in CARICOM countries ranged from a low of 14% for Barbados to a high of 38% for St. Vincent and the Grenadines, with several countries exceeding 30% (ECLAC, 2009: 15). Women, particularly as heads of households, comprise a significant portion of both the rural and urban poor, and together with children, the elderly and disabled, are among the most vulnerable in the region.

#### 2.6 Questioning the Westminster system of democracy

Under the independence project, broadly defined democratic values that speak to religious tolerance and open political debate, free and fair elections, and the rule of law have shaped the practice of democracy and the exercise of citizenship. However, there is an emerging consensus that the Westminster system of democracy, installed through the processes of constitutional decolonization and national independence, has not adequately addressed the core issues of development. It is generally agreed that while the replication of the Westminster system has included important institutions to secure the peaceful transfer of power through elections and the rule of law, and propel changes in social relations (e.g., investments in education), the project of ensuring an equitable distribution of rights, resources and representation among citizens is a long way to being achieved. There is therefore an implicit disappointment with, and questioning of the narrow concept and practice of democracy that prevails.

It needs to be noted that when compared with the colonial period, there have been noticeable improvements in the overall quality of life of the majority of the Caribbean population, such as higher levels of employment and per capita income; increased access to health care and education; increasing life expectancy, declining fertility rates and reduction in infant mortality; and expansion

of water, electricity and telephone services. However, despite the progress made, citizenship rights in terms of economic and social well-being have been under assault and contribute to increasing political apathy, alienation and questioning of the meaning and value of democracy that have been promoted since independence. According to Joan French, the apathy is related not only to the continuing decline, but the increasing demonstration by successive governments that they are unable or unwilling to address the needs of the poor, vulnerable and marginalized, and particularly the youth. However, in Jamaica, while the percentage of the electorate exercising their vote has declined, the overwhelming rejection of the JLP government in favour of the PNP in the 29 December, 2011 general election is based on the perception that they might fare better under the PNP<sup>27</sup>

Norman Girvan, a noted regionalist, academic and activist, gives voice to this disappointment as he reflected on the 29 December, 2011 national election in Jamaica. He admitted:

As one who came of age in the same year as Jamaica's independence, I can say that the big dreams that my generation had that independence would serve as an opportunity to transform the society, economy and cultural life in the interest of the majority have, for the most part, not been fulfilled. Looking back on half a century, I am coming to the conclusion that the "Independence" that was bequeathed and the democracy that was acquired in 1962 were nothing but a monumental face card. Very little of substance [has] actually changed.<sup>28</sup>

Girvan does not speak with any particular sensitivity about the persistent gender inequality that has characterized democracy since independence. Indeed, as Lewis observes, the struggle for "gender equality is not generally a part of the consciousness of men in the vanguard of social change" (2002: 517).

The "monumental face card" that democracy is said to have been since independence, can perhaps be best understood by examining the new social and political actors and popular cultural forms of the 1970s and '80s committed to the search for alternatives in economic, political, social and cultural life, and the experiences of women who despite seeing high points of organization building and advocacy in the same period, have not secured a significant shift in their relationship to power in the family, community, market or state.

<sup>27.</sup> Joan French, Personal communication, April 2012.

<sup>28.</sup> Norman Girvan (2012), "Jamaica's PNP – Back in the Saddle Again", January 9, 2012. Accessible at: http://www.normangirvan.info/Girvan-Jamaica's-new-PNP-government.



## New social and political actors



### 3. New social and political actors

#### 3.1 Emergence of new social and political actors

The 1970s and '80s saw the founding of Caribbean non-governmental organizations influenced by the 'new social movements' that had emerged internationally in the late 1960s and '70s. In the West, the new social movements stemmed from the discontent of the students' movements with the modernization project, their loss of faith in the conventional politics of transformation (in particular that of the labour movement), the threat of nuclear war as the cold war deepened, etc. In the developing South, they represented the breaking up of the old imperial order and the relationship of domination and exploitation between Western democracies and their colonies.

Several radical sociologists and philosophers (e.g., Touraine, 1981; Offe, 1984; and Habermas, 1981) viewed the 'new' social movements as authentic successors of the 'old' social movements, the classical one being the labour movement. Touraine defined social movements as those kinds of conflicts centred on the "social control of the main cultural patterns" of a society, namely representations of truth (knowledge), production (type of investment) and morality (ethical principles) (1985: 755). Oloffson stated that the new social movements were the "natural and self-evident" successors since their "goals and ideas, ... forms of struggle and organization, are perceived to be in tune with the modern age, its development trajectory and its contradictions," and "they hold up the promise of relevancy for the post-industrial age" (1988: 16).

In the Caribbean, these new social and political actors articulated a rights-based agenda, concepts such as 'participatory democracy' and 'empowerment', and engaged in alternative approaches to development for and with 'the marginalized'. They represented a wide spectrum of constituencies and concerns (including women, youth, farmers, Indigenous peoples, rural development, the environment, etc.), and a diversity of standpoints from which to define 'alternative development'. They also emerged from local communities, e.g., citizens' associations, community-based organizations, neighbourhood organizations and parish development committees. They have enabled activists to advocate and lobby for their concerns and influence the social and political spheres, and their presence 'on the ground' has been seen as a place where democracy is practiced first-hand.

These non-governmental organizations included regional networks such as the Caribbean Association for Feminist Research and Action (CAFRA), Caribbean Natural Resources Institute (CANARI), Caribbean Network for Integrated Rural Development (CNIRD), Caribbean Organization of Indigenous Peoples (COIP), Caribbean Peoples' Development Agency (CARIPEDA), Caribbean Policy Development Centre (CPDC), Windward Islands Farmers' Association (WINFA), and Women and Development Unit (WAND),

among others. Many of them integrated women's rights and gender equality issues into their mandates and programmes, influenced by the advocacy of CAFRA and WAND, and pressure from Northern donors. For example, WINFA actively supports women farmers and has a stated mission "to build a financially independent democratic organization that champions the cause of farmers and rural communities in the Caribbean, through the provision of programmes which address issues such as food security, gender equity, sustainable development, and sector linkages." <sup>29</sup>

The lesbian, gay, bisexual, transgender and queer (LGBTQ) community represents a recent addition to the new social movements in the Caribbean, which is seeking to be recognized in states where homosexuality is criminalized. Many members of LGBTQ community do not identify publicly to avoid being criminally detained, discriminated against or face violent reprisals. Of the 12 independent states in the Anglophone Caribbean, 11 have laws criminalizing homosexuality. Thus state-sponsored homophobia is the norm in the region.

These new social and political actors, including feminist organizations and networks, represent both a continuation of earlier social movements such as the labour movement, as well as a departure. Despite being small organizations rather than focused on mass mobilization, they have played a catalytic role in articulating a rights-based agenda, etched out new constituencies and issues for organizing and public debate, influenced governments to 'mainstream' their concerns into state policy and public service delivery, and in some cases entered the political arena and put in place government policies and programmes such as in Belize and Dominica.

#### 3.2 Popular cultural forms

Popular culture has been instrumental in the transmission and reproduction of values (Tator, 1998). During the 15th to 20th centuries, Caribbean struggles for the survival of cultural forms among the Indigenous populations, African slaves, Indian indentured labourers and other socio-culture groups represented an important means of subverting the colonial project by 'subjected' peoples, and were later intertwined with their quest for political independence and economic self-sufficiency. Thus, Caribbean resistance found strength in these cultural forms, and mass support was mobilized through the "culture of the ordinary people" (Nettleford, 1978: 3; and Rabess, n.d.).

In the early 20th century, popular cultural forms such as calypso, stick fighting, carnival, the steelband and hosay played an important role in challenging colonialism, racism and classism in Trinidad and Tobago. Calypsonians such as Growling Tiger and Atilla the Hun, among the first professional calypsonians singing political satire, were joined by Lord Kitchener, Mighty Spoiler, Mighty Dictator and others in the 1940s. During the 1950s at the height of the independence movement, calypsonians would sing about political matters and sway public opinion, so much so that people said of the Mighty Sparrow, "If Sparrow say so, is so!" (Regis, 1999: 4). Calypso music thus

<sup>29.</sup> Windward Islands Farmers Association (WINFA), Accessible at: http://www.winfacaribbean.org/index.php/about-us

played a crucial political and social role in Trinidad and Tobago, especially on the achievement of independence in 1962. The art form articulated the deep seated aspirations of the nation and gave voice to the voiceless (Regis, 1999: xi). The 1960s and '70s would see other social classes and groups joining in as independence, civil rights and Black Power movements flourished.<sup>30</sup>

In the post-independence period, women were active in the process of shaping a definably Caribbean 'high culture' from historical roots, including literature, dance and theatre, establishing cultural and literary organizations and "experimenting with Creole forms in their short fiction" (Gregg, 2005: 78). This was no easy path for pioneers like Louise Bennett of Jamaica who spoke and wrote in Jamaican creole or patois, the language of the masses, or Beryl McBurnie of Trinidad and Tobago who was "deeply committed to the articulation and preservation of a nationalist indigenous art form through the medium of dance" (Gregg, 2005: 84). Speaking of McBurnie's contribution to the "nationalist ethos of the period," Rex Nettleford commented that "the idea of a ... dance idiom rooted in the traditional life and lore of a Caribbean which is the creation of ordinary men and women in the region, was revolutionary ... at a time when social legitimacy, political authority, aesthetic energy and culture in general came in the garb of faraway rulers" (Nettleford, 1978: 85). Nettleford himself would play the same role through the founding of the National Dance Theatre Company in Jamaica in 1962. McBurnie also founded the Little Carib Theatre in Port of Spain, where the plays of Derek Walcott, Nobel Laureate in Literature, were performed.

In Jamaica, drawing on the inspiring folk wisdom of cultural activists such as Louise Bennett, reggae music began engaging in spiritual and political matters from the perspective of the masses during the 1970s. Taking on a "roots and culture" identity, reggae singers adopted themes drawn from Rastafarian as well as Black Nationalist worldviews such as those advocated by Marcus Garvey (Anderson, 2004: 208). Bob Marley, a Rastafarian, rose to become one of the most powerful and popular artistes of this genre. His lyrics were infused with Black Nationalism and pride, and oppression and freedom. In "Them Belly Full," he discussed hunger in the Caribbean and the Third World, and in "Burnin' and Lootin," the struggle for human rights in Jamaica. In "One Love/People Get Ready" and "One Foundation," he articulated the suffering and oppression in the world and called for unity to "eliminate the barricades of racism and discrimination and unite as one people through the power of love" (King and Jensen, 1995: 27). However, Marley did not view discrimination against women as an issue, condemning women's sexual freedom while defending his own sexual libertarianism. In "No Woman, No Cry", he expressed gratitude for women's support to men and families and the discrimination against them as black people, but made no mention of the discrimination and inequality they faced as women.<sup>31</sup>

While calypso and reggae and their derivatives have enabled the ordinary person to voice political and social commentary, they also represent sites of misogyny. In the 1990s and 2000s, calypso and

<sup>30.</sup> See The National Carnival Commission of Trinidad and Tobago, "History of Calypso", Accessible at: http://www.ncctt.org/home/carnival/history-of-carnival-and-its-elements/history-of-calypso.html

<sup>31.</sup> Joan French, personal communication, April 2012.

reggae have seen a reduction in political commentary accompanied by an increase in misogynistic messages, which some argue has caused the art forms to deteriorate. Smith points out, however, that calypso music mirrors social relations including relations of gender, and thus "the misogyny of such calypso lyrics is merely the by-product of the culture of survival present in a grassroots urban environment." Given that the calypsonian sings about issues other than gender relations, e.g., poverty, war, local politics and the labour movement, "bringing down women only underscores the fact that ... this [is] one of the few sources of power and domination available to him" (2004: 38).

Women slowly began entering the calypso arena and a number of female calypsonians have sung about women's empowerment. For example, Barbadian calypso and soca artiste, Allison Hinds has sought to reclaim and celebrate the Black female body by subverting traditional Caribbean representations of womanhood in her songs (Springer, 2008: 93). In her 2007 hit song, "Roll it Gal," Hinds sang: "Go to school gal, and get your degree. Nurture and take care of your pickney. Gal, you work hard to make your money. Roll it gal, roll it gal. If you know you smart and you sexy, never let them abuse your body. Show it off gal and let the world see. Roll it gal, roll it gal." In the song, 'woman' becomes "a more liberated category that is conscious of the varied identities of female subjects: the educated person, the mother, and the sexy gal" (Springer, 2008: 120).

Celebrated across the Anglophone Caribbean, Carnival has also allowed women of all ethnic groups and social classes to express their bodily autonomy. Carnival's historical feature of "highly charged and complex modes of subversive communication" continues today (Aching, 2002: 4; and Murdoch, 2004: 205-206). Barnes has described women's bodies during Carnival as both a spectacle and performance (2000: 93). For some analysts, women's exposure of their bodies in skimpy costumes on the streets is a logical extension of their new identities as "modern, assertive feminist subjects." However, this linking of "female performativity" and "feminist dominance" has been critiqued by others who argue that during Carnival, a "period that is licensed for the reversal of social order, women's subversion and appropriation of male-identified forms of sexual display may actually serve to reinforce the patriarchal structures that it otherwise critiques" (Barnes, 2000: 94-95).

Similarly, the emergence of dance hall music in Jamaica has provided a space for urban working class women to express their sexuality though dance. Dance hall music has been described as "the site of an on-going struggle between respectability and riot, propriety and vulgarity, slackness and culture" (Cooper, 2005), "simultaneously resisting and enticing respectable culture" (Cooper, 2004: 2). However, while the lyrics of dancehall are often misogynistic, Cooper argues that women are celebrated and liberated since in expressing themselves through dance, they can assume new roles that are unavailable to them in their normal lives (2004: 126-127). Bakare-Yusuf posits that through dance hall music, Black women have been able to create a space of multiple meanings (2006: 462).

The phenomenon of chutney music and dance, which caused a furore among the Hindu male leadership when it stormed the Trinidad and Tobago music scene in the early 1990s, has provided

a parallel space for Indian-Trinidadian women. Chutney music and dance forms originated in the matikor and laawa ceremonies of the Hindu wedding, women-only spaces where women of the family and community have and continue to portray the sexual act through folk dance. According to Baksh-Soodeen, these "women's ceremonies" represent one of the spaces for "Indian women to collectively express their sexuality" within Hindu culture as practised in the Caribbean, and the fact that only women are allowed to participate in these dances has meant that "a woman can express herself explicitly without any fear that her father, brother, husband or son would hear of it and rebuke her" (1991: 7).

These popular forms have created spaces for Caribbean women of all race/ ethnic groups and social classes to articulate their citizenship as sites of resistance, breaking traditional socio-cultural barriers with regard to their bodily autonomy and sexuality.

### 3.3 Contributions of women's and feminist organizing to democracy

### a. Brief historical perspective

The contemporary Caribbean feminist movement that emerged in the 1970s and '80s was inspired variously by the civil rights, anti-war, students' and women's liberation movements in the USA and Europe; the independence movements, wars of liberation and anti-apartheid struggles in Africa and Asia; the Caribbean anti-colonial, labour, independence, New Left and Black Power movements; and feminists' experience and observation of discrimination and male power in the home and society, and their disappointment with the exclusion of women's lived realities and voice in Caribbean political organizations and movements.

The women's arms of political parties established in the independence period operated primarily to support men to achieve and hold power. However, they remained subordinate to the male leadership, and did not make a political issue of the power relations between men and women in the parties, the wider society or the home. They became aware of these issues gradually, through the influence of dissenting individuals within or the critiques of organizations with broad feminist agendas. It was not uncommon for the organizations and individuals questioning patriarchal power relations in political parties to be accused of dividing the struggle, being anti-male or importing bourgeois feminism from the West. These perceptions persist in some quarters, including among women, even today.<sup>32</sup>

However, the women's arms of the socialist-oriented political parties did make very important contributions to moving women's agenda forward, within the limits of the theoretical frameworks defined by the parties. For example, the Committee of Women for Progress (CWP) and the OWP

<sup>32.</sup> Joan French, Personal communication, April 2012.

into which it evolved, associated with the Marxist-oriented Workers' Party of Jamaica (formerly the Workers' Liberation League, itself previously associated with the Independent Trade Union Action Council whose women's arm the Voluntary Organisation of Women had focused on the struggle against rising prices and women's welfare), as well as the PNP Women's Movement, advocated for and won equal pay for equal work in Jamaica, with the support of the newer feminist organisations (see Section 2.5). The PNP Women's Movement (PNPWM) also engineered the PNP government's establishment of one of the first Women's Desks globally in 1974. Headed by Peggy Antrobus, it was subsequently upgraded to the Bureau of Women's Affairs in 1975.

In Grenada, the National Women's Organization (NWO) played a significant role in establishing the socialist government under Maurice Bishop. The NWO was founded in 1977 as the Progressive Women's Association (PWA). After Maurice Bishop and the New Jewel Movement (NJM) staged a military coup on 13 March, 1979 to overthrow Prime Minister Eric Gairy and his Grenada United Labour Party, the women's arm of the NJM was renamed the National Women's Organization (NWO) in May 1980. The women of the NWO played an active role within the revolutionary government, including collaboration with the Women's Desk to undertake a number of programmes such as the free distribution of milk to all, mass health programmes, and education programmes that included equal opportunity for girls and raising women's awareness of their legal rights (Phillip, 2007: 45). The women of the Progressive Women's Association (PWA), although also opposed to the former Gairy administration, did not support the socialist agenda of the NJM, now the new People's Revolutionary Government. The PWA continued to organize around issues of equal wages for equal work, access to employment and housing, and women's civil and political rights. It thus "served as a small but effective urban forum for politicizing and organizing middle class women, housewives, teachers, professionals, students, and a core of the urban working class" (Phillip, 2007: 40).

Since the late 1970s and '80s, feminist organizations have mushroomed across the Caribbean around issues of discrimination against women and gender inequality. In Jamaica, Sistren Theatre Collective was founded in 1977 by an alliance of working and middle class women (see Section 2.5). In Belize, the Belize Organization for Women and Development (BOWAND) was founded in 1979 to advocate for better wages and improved working conditions for women, and was instrumental in forming local neighbourhood groups and raising awareness among community and grassroots women. The Belize Rural Women's Association (BRWA) raised sexuality issues including prostitution and HIV/AIDS from a feminist perspective as early as 1989.<sup>33</sup> In Trinidad and Tobago, the Concerned Women for Progress (CWP) emerged as the country's first feminist organization in 1980, rallying around issues of equal pay for equal work, violence against women and abortion. The organization disbanded in 1983 and some of its members formed The Group, a "more woman-centred and less traditionally socialist organization" (Mohammed, 1989: 44; Meighoo, 1998: 256). Three members of The Group, in turn, broke off to found Women Working for Social Progress (Working Women) in 1985, which continues to advocate and programme on women's economic empowerment and issues

<sup>33.</sup> See for example, The Belize Woman, Newsletter of the Belize Rural Women's Association, vol.3, no.1, March 1989.

of national concern such as corporal punishment in schools. Several of these organizations also engaged with issues such as legal protection for women in marital and non-marital relationships and in redefining notions of women's work in the private and public spheres.

Caribbean organizations working on women's issues increasingly located their work within a human rights framework, drawing on the processes and outcomes of the UN Decade for Women and the United Nations International Conferences on Women from 1975 onwards (see Section 3.3.2 below). Commitment to the outcomes of these conferences operated as a unifying force between the different strands of women's rights activism. Some organizations made the link to rights' frameworks explicitly – for example the Defence for Rights of Women in Trinidad and Tobago, and Women Against Terrorism in Guyana (Ellis, 2003: 71). Feminist organizations, groups and individuals worked to strengthen national and international commitment, legislative reform and action in relation to issues of violence against women, and sexual and reproductive rights.

Many Caribbean women who may or may not define themselves as feminists are currently organizing in their communities across the Caribbean to improve women's lives. In Trinidad and Tobago, women local councillors who comprise 32% of local government representatives are working in partnership with women community activists to address local and community issues. Of two such activists who support their local councillor in Siparia, a town in south Trinidad, one had witnessed her father's activism as a child, when being active in the community was seen as a means of asserting one's rights as a citizen and articulating the group's position within the democratic process. She explained that her activism enables her to "give back" to the community. The second had become involved in community activism due to having observed her mother's lack of education and resulting poor quality of life, as well as other "women in crisis" in the community who experienced "a lack of financial empowerment."<sup>34</sup>

### b. The impact of internationalism and regionalism

The formation in 1936 of the West Indian Association of Social Workers among women from the Eastern Caribbean and Guyana was among the earliest attempt by Caribbean women to work on a regional basis around a common agenda.<sup>35</sup> The Caribbean Women's Association (CARIWA) was formed in the context of the establishment of the West Indian Federation in the late 1950s. The first President, Audrey Jeffers of Trinidad and Tobago, had expected that CARIWA would pave the way for women's participation in the Federation. The short-lived Federation that existed from 3 January, 1958 – 31 May, 1962 comprised several Caribbean colonies of the British Empire.<sup>36</sup> Established

<sup>34.</sup> This narrative emerged from the focus group meeting held with women community activists in San Fernando, Trinidad and Tobago in January 2012.

<sup>35.</sup> Veronica Marie Gregg (2005), Caribbean Women: An Anthology of Non-Fiction Writing, 1890-1980, University of Notre Dame Press, p. 74. See the extensive discussion on "Gender and the Social Order" on the Caribbean women's movement, pp. 70-95.

<sup>36.</sup> The West Indies Federation comprised the ten territories of: Antigua and Barbuda, Barbados, Dominica, Grenada, Jamaica, Montserrat, the then St Kitts-Nevis-Anguilla, Saint Lucia, St Vincent and Trinidad and Tobago. Accessible at: http://www.caricom.org/jsp/community/west\_indies\_federation.jsp?menu=community

by the British Caribbean Federation Act of 1956, the intention was to create a political unit that would become independent from Britain as a single state. However, before that could happen, the Federation collapsed due to internal political conflicts,<sup>37</sup> and the individual colonies each sought its own independence, or in the case of Anguilla and Montserrat became 'overseas territories' of the United Kingdom.

These early attempts by women across the region to build a sense of solidarity and joint action has been an important legacy which served to prepare the contemporary Caribbean feminist movement to participate in the regional and international networks, coalitions and conferences that were to blossom from the mid-1970s. The revitalization of CARIWA took place in Guyana in 1970 on the initiative of Viola Burnham, wife of the President. On the initiative of Peggy Antrobus, the first director of the Jamaica Women's Bureau, CARIWA became a key partner in convening a regional meeting attended by representatives of 12 Caribbean governments, which developed a regional plan of action that called for the establishment of Women's Bureaux across the region and for a Desk within the CARICOM Secretariat.<sup>38</sup>

These initiatives, an outcome of the energy generated by preparations for and involvement in the UN's designation of 1975 as International Women's Year and convening of the first World Conference on Women in Mexico City, served to strengthen Caribbean women's activism. The UN's adoption of the Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Discrimination against Women (CEDAW) in 1979 was a pivotal international instrument for women's rights activists in the Caribbean. The UN World Conferences on Women had a significant impact on Caribbean women's organizing, and Caribbean women participated in the four conferences held in Mexico City (1975), Copenhagen (1980), Nairobi (1985) and Beijing (1995). Regional programmes of action coordinated partly by the CARICOM Women's Desk established in 1980, and national programmes developed by Women's Bureaux, sought to address specific areas of the global agendas on women in development (WID), women and development (WAD), and gender and development (GAD), the approaches that evolved within the UN system from the mid-1970s to 1980s. While these approaches led by the UN sought to address various manifestations of discrimination against women, they did not challenge the structural features of the global political, economic and socio-cultural order on which gender-based inequalities were buttressed.

Development Alternatives with Women for a New Era (DAWN), the Third World feminist network founded in India in 1984, the year preceding the third UN World Conference on Women held in Nairobi to review and appraise the achievements of the UN Decade for Women, would become the leading voice globally on these issues. DAWN argued that traditional development and economic models had failed women and poor people particularly during times of economic and development crises, and those in developing nations had fared the worst. The organization

<sup>37.</sup> Accessible at: http://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/West\_Indies\_Federation

<sup>38.</sup> Rhoda Reddock (1998), "Women's Organisations and Movements in the Commonwealth Caribbean", In Feminist Review, no. 59, pp. 57-73.

identified Africa's food crisis, Latin America and the Caribbean's debt crisis, South Asia's poverty, and the militarization of the Pacific Islands as the issues that had most impacted on women and other disadvantaged groups in the developing South. DAWN's platform document, "Development, Crises and Alternative Visions: Third World Women's Perspectives," was presented in Nairobi and subsequently published as a book (Sen and Grown, 1987).<sup>39</sup>

Other regional networks emerged in tandem with these global assemblies. The Caribbean Association for Feminist Research (CAFRA), a regional network of women's organizations and individual feminists was founded by a group of 40 Caribbean feminists and women's rights activists in Barbados in April 1985. CAFRA's mission has been "to celebrate and channel the collective power of women for individual and societal transformation, thus creating a climate in which social justice is realized." <sup>40</sup> The Association had its heyday in the late 1980s and '90s, organizing national networks, conducting action research, raising awareness, advocating and networking across the region on issues including women in agriculture, gender and human rights, domestic violence, trafficking in women, gender and trade, and women's history and creative expression. Founding members included Sonia Cuales, Joan French, Rhoda Reddock, Honor-Ford-Smith, Peggy Antrobus and Rawwida Baksh.

CAFRA was the first regional Caribbean women's organization that dared to call itself 'feminist' in the face of the negative backlash from the socialist and other political formations (see Section 2.4), and against the backdrop of negative publicity about the meaning and implications of that designation. However, CAFRA has suffered from internal divisions including on issues of sexual and reproductive rights, and power and leadership within the organization. In the recent past, the organization has drawn on the work of ASPIRE, a Trinidad and Tobago-based organization committed to advocacy around reproductive rights. CAFRA–St. Lucia, led by Flavia Cherry, CAFRA's current Chairperson, mobilized actively to change the law on abortion in St. Lucia. CAFRA's regional advocacy on macro-economic, social development and governance issues has suffered, but its influence continues to be felt in some national chapters<sup>41</sup>

The University of the West Indies (UWI) has also been a site of regional engagement. The Women and Development Unit (WAND) was established in August 1978, and is currently a unit within the Consortium for Social Development and Research. WAND, under Peggy Antrobus' leadership, facilitated the meeting at which CAFRA was established in April 1985. The Centres for Gender and Development Studies (CGDS) were founded in 1993. Today, the fully fledged Institutes for Gender and Development Studies (IGDS) are located on the three UWI campuses at Mona, Jamaica; St. Augustine, Trinidad and Tobago; and Cave Hill, Barbados. The IGDS has been successful in combining research and publications, policy advice and activism in support of women's rights

<sup>39.</sup> See Development Alternatives with Women for a New Era, Accessible at: http://www.dawnnet.org

<sup>40.</sup> See CAFRA, Accessible at: http://www.cafra.org/

<sup>41.</sup> Joan French, Personal communication, April 2012.

and gender equality. IGDS–Jamaica has also been engaging younger women through its "Young Women's Leadership Project" and making important linkages with activism off-campus, including in local communities. However, IGDS' activism has been inconsistent across the three campuses, linked to individual commitment rather than institutional mandates. However, due to their location in the academy and level of institutional development, and given the weaknesses of the feminist movement, they have tremendous potential.

A move has been underway over the past decade to rename the Women's Affairs Bureaux as Gender Affairs Bureaux. Ministries of Women's/ Gender Affairs have also emerged in a number of Caribbean countries to promote gender equality goals within the state's national development agenda. This is one manifestation of the 'gender mainstreaming' approach that emerged at the UN Fourth World Conference on Women held in Beijing in 1995, which promotes the mainstreaming of gender equality into all policies, plans and programmes across the public sector. However, while gender mainstreaming has been promoted among intergovernmental organizations and governments globally since the Beijing conference, the approach has been critiqued in recent years by the international feminist movement as being "technocratic and administrative" rather than "political and rights-based," with a questionable impact on changing deep-rooted and systemic issues of gender-based discrimination which remain pervasive.

In the Caribbean, the adoption of gender mainstreaming coincided with the weakening of the movement linked to the neo-liberal agenda and the professionalization of gender studies. It also coincided with the tension between the earlier women's rights agenda and the idea of "men at risk"<sup>42</sup> which gained currency due to the "under-performance" of boys in the school system in the case of Jamaica, and the proposal that men were discriminated against in legal rights over children in the case of Barbados. "Male equality" is a response to the call for the male side of the equation to be more evident in the thrust for gender equality (Barriteau, 2001). There is a widely held view that "women are taking over" due to their numbers in professions such education, where women have outnumbered men since the early 20th century. However, there is little corresponding support for the advance of women in areas where men outnumber women, such as public and private sector decision-making bodies, including Parliament and local government.<sup>43</sup>

Feminist engagement with the state has included lobbying on women's rights and gender equality issues; influencing and assisting in the drafting of legislation; bringing pressure to bear on governments to adhere to international conventions and instruments to which they are signatories; challenging governments on issues such as structural adjustment policies and the setting up of free trade zones; and delivering services to improve women's lives in their families and communities. They have also been able to work with governments in the development of national gender policies. For example, the Ministry of Community Development and Gender Affairs in Dominica commissioned

<sup>42.</sup> See Errol Miller (1991), Men at Risk, Jamaica Publishing House, Kingston.

<sup>43.</sup> Joan French, Personal communication, April 2012.

the Institute of Gender and Development Studies (IGDS), University of the West Indies (UWI), St. Augustine, Trinidad and Tobago and consulted women's organizations and other stakeholders in the process of formulating its National Policy and Action Plan for Gender Equity and Equality, which was adopted by the government in 2006. A similar process took place in Jamaica with the development of the national policy on gender equality which was adopted in 2011.

Today, many of the region's organizations work collaboratively in order to create spaces for advocacy, action and reflection. In addition, where missions and projects have overlapped, organizations have initiated and supported region-wide campaigns. At the regional and global levels, strong partnerships have been built with UN Women–Caribbean, ECLAC, OAS and the Commonwealth Secretariat, among others.

### c. Women's organizing and the broadening of rights and citizenship

The Caribbean women's movement includes a number of streams. The women who defined themselves as feminists in the 1970s were largely socialist and Black-conscious women who had come to feminism through their critique of the limited recognition of women's equal rights in nationalist struggles, trade unions, left political groupings and the Black Power movement. These women insisted on organizing within or outside these groupings to create a space for independent analysis and action from a women's rights perspective. Another group of women "saw themselves first and foremost as Black women living in societies which were in early transition from colonial rule, where race and class were still inextricably linked to the political/ economic/ social hierarchies, and where Black men obviously also belonged to the oppressed group."They accepted that women should not "divide the struggle" by organizing autonomously for their own issues. Another stream comprised organizations perceived by feminists as "traditional" and serving "to maintain the status quo regarding women's place in the society through welfare-oriented outreach" (Baksh-Soodeen, 1998: 80-82).

For 'grass roots women', according to Cecilia Babb, "the issue is survival, that of putting food on the table for their children, often in situations where they are the sole breadwinners" and "until this survival is managed it is very difficult for grass roots women to engage in theoretical debate, mobilization, lobbying and group demonstrations, on issues which impact on the very survival we are trying so hard to ensure" (Baksh-Soodeen, 1998: 81). The 1980s and '90s saw the active networking and bridge-building across these divides, "related, on the one hand, to the increased awareness of feminist concerns by traditional women's organizations and, on the other hand, to a general shift away from ideological dogmatism on the part of ... feminists" (Baksh-Soodeen, 1998: 82).

However, the Caribbean feminist movement has faced many challenges, among them the impact of the global and national economic crises on livelihoods, and the economic choices that individual activists have had to make. The organizations themselves have been struggling

to survive as international donor agencies have shifted from their commitment to funding civil society organizations, to channelling direct budgetary support to the poorest governments in the global South under the 2005 Paris Declaration on Aid Effectiveness. There have also been problems related to governance within organizations, including the lack of internal capacity for monitoring and evaluating the impact of programmes; leadership issues such as inadequate succession planning and mentoring of a new generation of activists and leaders; and an emerging unclarity and stasis on questions of "What constitutes the feminist movement'?" and "What is its direction?"

For despite: a level of service delivery to women and their families, consistent advocacy around critical social issues, rights-based legislative changes on gender-based violence and inheritance rights of children born in and out of wedlock, evidence of women's advancement in education, the creation of spaces for research and teaching in academia which is expanding the scope of the movement, there are still glaring gaps. For example, women's political representation is abysmally low (see Chapter 5), the state-defined Women's/ Gender Bureaux and Ministries remain weak, there has been limited engagement around macro-economic and trade policies and their impacts, the relationship between the academy and women's rights activists has not been systematized, and there is a long way to go in bridging the distance and creating effective partnerships between middle and working class women, both individually and organizationally. Importantly, however, these issues are coming to the fore, and the dialogue around women's citizenship and democracy and women's transformational leadership offers a potential space for critical thinking and strategizing the way forward.

### Young women's citizenship<sup>44</sup>

Tracy Robinson argues that not only are women considered second class citizens but that citizenship is considered secondary for women (2000: 25). According to Tonya Haynes, "for young women, this experience of citizenship is even more heightened. Young women are not considered a political constituency in the same way as young men. States respond to young men, often in very problematic ways, but respond they do, with efforts to understand and cater to them. Young women do not attract this kind of state attention and this has implications for the recognition of their citizenship rights and their economic and other forms of empowerment." Michelle Rowley makes the point that Caribbean states engage with women as mothers (2003: 31-58), and while this creates contradictions for all women it also contributes to state inattention to young women and girls, except as recipients of education.

Yet, young women have been active in youth organizations and mobilized as peer educators in relation to HIV/AIDS and sexual and reproductive health, and have also founded their own organizations and initiatives to respond to the issues which affect them. For example, a young

<sup>44.</sup> This section on young women's citizenship is based on the reflections of Gabrielle Henderson and Tonya Haynes, Personal communication, May 2012.

<sup>45.</sup> Tonya Hayes, Personal communication, May 2012.

woman incest survivor from St. Lucia started an initiative called PROSAF – Surviving Sexual Abuse in the Caribbean, which published regular features on child sexual abuse in the St. Lucia Star, a national newspaper. Despite this, Haynes argues that youth organizations in the region generally lack the sensitivity to asymmetrical gender relations, and do not tend to promote young women's empowerment and gender equality as part of their mandate. State-supported youth organizations are often incubators for future politicians and may serve to mobilize youth as an electoral resource for political parties. However, this environment neither seeks to increase young women's political participation nor foster the development of transformational leadership. Youth organizations are also somewhat limited in their outreach and fail to include the most vulnerable young people. Funding and support for youth-led organizations are essential to increasing their capacity to reach out to greater numbers of young women and teenage girls, to enable them to make claims for their citizenship rights.

According to Gabrielle Henderson, Caribbean feminist organizations formed in the 1970s and '80s sought to engage young women through consciousness-raising activities, outreach and programming. However, they achieved limited success in retaining young women members or promoting their leadership within the organizational structures. Women's and Gender Studies programmes have provided some space for university-educated young women to engage in feminist awareness-raising, but many have not gravitated towards activism in women's organizations. To some degree, the existence of state, civil society and academic institutions negated the need for young women to build "a movement", as understood by the earlier generation of women.

Facilitated by CARICOM and the Commonwealth Youth Programme, the 1990s saw a renewed focus on youth programming in the region, which emerged from a growing concern with "the crisis of youth" linked to the high drop-out rates and under-achievement of boys and young men in education; the increasing involvement of young men in violence, illegal drugs, and other anti-social and criminal activities; and the high HIV prevalence rates among young people. The publication of the Commonwealth Secretariat's, Tomorrow's Adults: A Situational Analysis of Youth in the Commonwealth Caribbean in 1997, and UNDP's Human Development Report for Trinidad and Tobago titled Youth at Risk in 2000, exemplified a renewed focus on young people. The reinstatement of National Youth Councils and development of National Youth Policies represented an increased focus on youth by state institutions, and a growing youth movement concerned with sexual and reproductive health and rights as well as larger issues of political economy and governance. This move received significant support from international organizations and the trade unions to address the growing HIV/AIDS epidemic. As such, activism revolved around adolescent sexual and reproductive health and rights, and some of the socialist concerns of earlier movements.

Despite the fact that unequal power relations between young women and men were recognized as a driver of the HIV epidemic among young people in the Caribbean, addressing gender inequality and young women's empowerment did not become a priority for youth organizations. Thus within

National Youth Councils and other youth organizations, very few leadership and decision-making positions are held by young women, and gender-related concerns do not feature on the agenda in spite of having young women members in significant numbers. In the absence of a strong young feminist voice and young women's leadership, the response to the HIV epidemic began to shape a singular type of discourse about young women in the Caribbean as being poor and powerless, and vulnerable to infection. Young women's feminist scholarship and activism has, however, begun to challenge this discourse, and to question wider economic, social and political concerns related to their citizenship, participation and power.

Thus young women's organizing in the Caribbean is taking place in the context of a relatively strong sexual and reproductive health and rights agenda shaped by a concern for HIV/ AIDS. It is also occurring within a framework shaped by women's organizations and state machineries that offer some space for young women to contribute to the process of change. Further, young women's activism is being articulated within a highly informed theoretical space linked to feminist scholarship. Social media allow for a virtual exchange of ideas and communication which means that there is less of an emphasis on physical presence, and 'voice' in the earlier sense of feminist organizing has to some extent been replaced by text and image as modes of expression and mobilization.

However, although more women have access to education in the region than ever before, gaps between university-educated young women and those who have not, persists. Socio-economic class differences informed by education and disposable income present a challenge to young women's organizing and agreement on common agendas for action. In addition, the pervasiveness of popular culture dominated by consumption and the sexual objectification of the young female body further complicates young women's constructions of identity, belonging, citizenship and nation.<sup>46</sup>

According to Rhoda Reddock, "a lead role for women's organizations ... will only follow some much needed revitalization as the movement has experienced a generational decline and transformational politics has been, relatively speaking, weak among younger generations. <sup>47</sup>The individualism and market orientation of the neo-liberal paradigm has taken a toll on collective organizing." There are thus organizational and political gaps with regard to supporting the emergence of a new generation of feminists, which to some extent is being filled by IGDS. However, the Caribbean feminist movement still needs to grapple with how to engage young women's ideas, politics and ways of organizing, and recognize their legitimacy as leaders in order to broaden and strengthen its reach in the present context. Grassroots and rural women's activism and leadership are also experiencing a decline. The level of national advocacy seen in the 1980s through the work of, for example, Sistren Theatre Collective in Jamaica and the Belize Rural Women's Association, is less evident. At the regional level, some hope lies with the initiative to form a regional association

<sup>46.</sup> Gabrielle Henderson, Personal communication, May 2012.

<sup>47.</sup> See Rhoda Reddock and Juliana Foster (n.d.), "The Impact of the Crisis on Women in the Caribbean", AWID Women's Rights Brief 2, The Systemic Crisis' Impact on Women: Sub-regional Perspectives, p. 13.

of household workers, building on the work of NUDE in Trinidad and Tobago and the Jamaica Household Workers' Association.

In this context of the challenges being faced by the Caribbean feminist movement and the state, UN Women–Caribbean (previously UNIFEM) has played a catalytic role in articulating a regional perspective under Roberta Clarke's leadership. For example, it has facilitated dialogue among the national women's/ gender machineries, CARICOM's Women's Desk and ECLAC; collaborated with the Commonwealth Secretariat and OAS in the formation of and support to the Caribbean Institute for Women in Leadership (CIWiL); conducted research on child support, gender-based violence and HIV/AIDS; and opened the space for broader work in the Caribbean through its support to Haiti.

# Chapter

Women's social and economic citizenship: implications for democracy



## 4. Women's social and economic citizenship: implications for democracy

### 4.1 Introduction

Feminist activism (as discussed in Chapters 2 and 3) has focused predominantly and made cumulative advances in the areas of women's social and economic citizenship. The engagement between women's organizations and the post-independent state may be said to represent both a site of contestation as well as the achievement of some gains.

This chapter examines the following key areas where there is evidence of significant changes in women's social and economic citizenship, as well as some 'unfinished business' around which there is much public controversy: family and conjugal arrangements; sexuality and sexual citizenship; socialization, affection and care; women and the economy; and human security including violence against women, human trafficking and HIV/AIDS.

### 4.2 Family and conjugal arrangements

Some studies of the African-Caribbean family have characterized Caribbean men as being "marginalized," "at risk" and "in crisis," as it appears that they do not conform to the European definition of the "male breadwinner." Barrow disagrees with this characterization, arguing that Caribbean family forms have not conformed to the European nuclear family since the period of African slavery (1998: 339). Female-headed households accounted for 52% of poor households in Grenada in 1999 (IFAD, 1999), 45.5% households in Jamaica in 2002 (UNICEF, 2005), and 44% of households in Barbados in 2007 (United Nations Economic and Social Council, 2007). In addition, in 2002 it was estimated that between 31–59% of Caribbean children lived in households headed by women from birth to age 14 (UNICEF, 2002).

Feminists have contributed to legislative reform to address issues related to the high levels of female-headed households, common-law unions, visiting male partners, and children born out of wedlock.

<sup>46.</sup> Gabrielle Henderson, Personal communication, May 2012.

<sup>47.</sup> See Rhoda Reddock and Juliana Foster (n.d.), "The Impact of the Crisis on Women in the Caribbean", AWID Women's Rights Brief 2, The Systemic Crisis' Impact on Women: Sub-regional Perspectives, p. 13.

Barbados was the first non-OECS country to introduce the concept of "a union other than marriage" into family law (Barbados Family Law Act, 1981), where a man and a woman living continuously for over five years are afforded the same rights as a married couple with regard to property, child custody and maintenance (UNICEF, 2002). In Trinidad and Tobago, the Cohabitational Relationships Bill, 1998 was passed to "confront the realities of conjugal life" and "to redress some of the injustices and hardships caused when parties in common-law unions do not recognize their obligations to each other." Further, the Distribution of Estates Act, 2000 speaks to the inheritance rights of unmarried women, common-law spouses and children born out of wedlock.

In Jamaica, the Property (Rights of Spouses) Act, 2004 provides for the equitable division of property between married and common-law spouses who have been in the relationship for at least five years. It reflects the kinds of emerging dilemmas where the state takes a 'gender equality' approach. The Act provides for a 50/50 division of property regardless of the male/female distribution of financial or unpaid labour contribution. The Act is advantageous to women whose unpaid domestic work in the home has contributed to the economic resource base of the family and who, prior to the Act, would have been left out in the cold with regard to property ownership on the termination of a marriage or common-law relationship. However, it is unfair to an increasing number of women who make the down payment and mortgage payments on the home, and also bear the main responsibility for housework. Men benefit 50% on divorce or separation whether or not they have contributed financially or in unpaid labour. Jamaican women who are financially independent and own their own homes refer to it as the legislation "to support wutless<sup>49</sup> man." Women who own property and have children prior to a marriage or common-law union may choose to negotiate legally binding agreements with their prospective spouse or partner in order to safeguard the property for their children, although this rarely happens in the prevailing environment of gender relations.<sup>50</sup>

However, despite these reforms, there are still multiple jurisdictions with regard to critical areas of family law, for example, with regard to child support applications in Barbados, Trinidad and Tobago, and other Caribbean countries. According to UNIFEM's (now UN Women's) research, in Barbados, "historically there has been a dual system of family justice in child support matters." Most matters heard in the lower courts are child support applications, with those relating to children born outside of marriage more numerous than those relating to children born within marriage. <sup>51</sup> In Trinidad and Tobago, the High Court receives a high number of child support applications which are supplementary to divorce proceedings, while the lower courts are dominated by child support applications from unmarried persons<sup>52</sup>

<sup>48.</sup> See Suzanne Sheppard (2006), "How TT's laws cover common-law unions", In Trinidad and Tobago Newsday, 22 January, 2006.

<sup>49. &</sup>quot;Wutless" is the Jamaican creole equivalent of "worthless".

<sup>50.</sup> Joan French, Personal communication, April 2012.

<sup>51.</sup> See UNIFEM Caribbean Office (2006), "The Administration of Family Justice: Child Support, Shared Family Responsibilities and Gender Equality". Barbados Research Report, Summary.

<sup>52.</sup> See UNIFEM Caribbean Office (2008), "Child Support, Poverty and Gender Equality: Policy Considerations for Reform", p. 8.

In multi-ethnic Trinidad and Tobago, there is a current push to standardize the legal age of marriage which is governed by four Marriage Acts, each with different ages of marital consent. The Marriage Act of 1923 inherited from the English common law which governs civil and Christian marriages, stipulates the age of consent as 14 for boys and 12 for girls. The Marriage and Divorce Act governing Muslim marriages stipulates 16 years for boys and 12 for girls; the Hindu Marriage Act stipulates 18 years for boys and 14 for girls; and the Orisha Marriage Act stipulates 18 years for boys and 16 for girls. All four Acts are in direct violation of the Sexual Offences Act which establishes 16 as the age of consent to sexual activity, and thus legalize child marriage in the context of the UN Convention on the Rights of the Child which defines a child as being under the age of 18. The Central Statistical Office reported that over 8,400 girls and 1,300 boys under 19 years old were married between 1997 and 2007 (Clyne, 2011).

Reddock argues that in postcolonial multi-ethnic societies seeking to forge a nation-state, groups have attached importance to demanding full citizenship rights based on the recognition of their difference. "In these contexts varying versions of multiculturalism have been used to provide feelings of inclusion, belonging and recognition that citizenship claims to deliver. Multiculturalist claims often are most significant in areas related to religious practice but also in areas related to control over women such as marriage." Thus while the Marriage Acts in Trinidad and Tobago "acknowledge the religious diversity of the population and provide ... religious leaders of representative communities with symbolic leadership, in so doing, however, they compromise the citizenship of women." Change may be within reach – a national stakeholder consultation held by the Ministry of Gender, Youth and Child Development on 4 November, 2011 was attended by some 40% of young women and men representing a diversity of religious faiths, who spoke out against the "mortgaging of the futures" of their peers, i.e., girls who were still experiencing early marriage.

### 4.3 Sexuality and sexual citizenship

While family law has been expanded to include common-law unions in many Caribbean states, the existence of anti-sodomy or anti-buggery laws in the majority of Anglophone Caribbean states has meant that homosexuality continues to be criminalized. In Barbados, Article 9 of the Sexual Offences Act, 1992 states that a person who commits "buggery" is liable to imprisonment for life.<sup>54</sup> In Jamaica, Article 76 of the Offences Against the Person Act, 1864 punishes "the abominable crime of buggery" by imprisonment and hard labour for a maximum of ten years.<sup>55</sup> And in Trinidad and Tobago, Section 13 of the Sexual Offences Act, 1986 makes "buggery" an offence.<sup>56</sup> These legal stipulations reflect evidence of state-sponsored homophobia.

<sup>53.</sup> Rhoda Reddock (2008), "Gender, Nation and the Dilemmas of Citizenship: The Case of the Marriage Acts of Trinidad and Tobago", In Carolyn Eliott (ed.), The Global Empowerment of Women: Responses to Globalisation and Politicised Religion, Routledge, New York. pp. 144-145.

<sup>54.</sup> See Immigration and Refugee Board of Canada (2007), Barbados: Treatment of homosexuals, including protection offered by the state and the attitude of the population, 9 March 2007, BRB102422.FE, Accessible at: http://www.unhcr.org/refworld/docid/469cd6a52.html.

<sup>55.</sup> See Immigration and Refugee Board of Canada (2006), Jamaica: Laws regarding homosexuality, applicable penalties and whether they are enforced, 26 October 2006, JAM101671.E, Accessible at: http://www.unhcr.org/refworld/docid/45f1475a2.html...

<sup>56.</sup> See Immigration and Refugee Board of Canada (2005), Trinidad and Tobago: Treatment of gays, gay lifestyle, support groups; whether sections 13 and 16 of the Sexual Offences Act and paragraph 8 (1) (e) of the Immigration Act are enforced (January 2003 - November 2005), 6 December 2005, TTO100707.E, Accessible at: http://www.unhcr.org/refworld/docid/45f148070.html.

This, according to Sir George Alleyne, the UN Secretary-General's Special Envoy for HIV/AIDS in the Caribbean, "has its origins in the concept that HIV/AIDS was a disease of homosexual males, which of course it is not." Homophobia is thus an obstacle to addressing HIV/AIDS in the region. Professor Nadia Ellis of the University of California Berkeley has described Caribbean attitudes about homosexuality as "complicated." On the one hand, there is widespread intolerance as evidenced by homophobic dancehall music lyrics, acts of violence against homosexuals, and 'anti-buggery' laws. On the other hand, there are thriving – albeit covertly hidden – pockets of queer communities to be found throughout the Caribbean, each possessed of its own unique markers and expressions of gay identity." 58

An emerging gay rights movement is evident in the Caribbean. In 1991, the Bahamas repealed its laws that criminalized homosexuality dating back to the Victorian Offences Against the Person Act, 1861. The Rainbow Alliance of the Bahamas advocates on behalf of persons who identify as lesbian, gay, bisexual, transgender and queer. Founded in 1999, the Alliance is a union of the Bahamian Gays and Lesbians Against Discrimination (BGLAD), and Hope Through Education and Awareness (Hope TEA). In Trinidad and Tobago, the Coalition Advocating for the Inclusion of Sexual Orientation (CAISO) lobbies for better laws to protect the gay community from violence and discrimination. The Jamaica Forum for Lesbians, All-Sexuals and Gays (JFLAG) is focused on advocacy, education and support services.

The LGBTQ movement across the Caribbean was inspired by Jamaican Prime Minister Portia Simpson-Miller's statement during her 2011 election campaign:

No-one should be discriminated against because of their sexual orientation. I think we should have a look at the buggery law and Members of Parliament should be given the right to vote with their conscience, in consultation with their constituents .... I do not have any intention of prying into the private business of anyone. I would appoint anyone with the ability, the capacity and the capability to my Cabinet (21 December, 2011).

Although Health and Family Life Education (HFLE) forms part of the school curricula across the Caribbean, it is often not or adequately taught. The United Nations has called on governments to include and expand sex education classes so as to help reduce the spread of HIV/AIDS in the region.<sup>59</sup> Little-White has advised that "based on the increase in the number of children having first sex at an earlier age, the increase in child and teenage pregnancy, as well as HIV/AIDS and other sexually transmitted infections (STIs), children and teenagers are in need of help." She also argues

<sup>57.</sup> Michael Jones (2008), "Caribbean Attitudes towards Homosexuality Changing but Violence toward LGBT People Remain Common," Change.org, Accessible at: http://news.change.org/stories/caribbean-attitudes-toward-homosexuality-changing-but-violence-toward-lgbt-people-remains-common

<sup>58.</sup> Editor (2009), "Faultlines: News and Notes from the Center of Race and Gender", Center for Race and Gender, University of California, Berkeley.
59. United Nations (2008), "UN calls for more sex education in Caribbean schools to curb spread of HIV/AIDS: Sexual education a lynchpin of HIV prevention," 1 August, 2008.

that, "homosexuality and other sexual orientation should be discussed outside the topic of HIV/ AIDS. The possibility that there is a broad range of 'normal' human sexual behaviour, or that families can come in many forms is never considered." However, such calls continue to be opposed by faith-based organizations.

In Antigua and Barbuda, the Antigua Planned Parenthood Association (APPA) has made itself available to schools and churches for "family life" education workshops and counselling on sexually transmitted diseases. In Trinidad and Tobago, the Family Planning Association, Advocates for Safe Parenthood: Improving Reproductive Equity (ASPIRE), and the National Parent Teacher Association (NPTA), have called on the government to implement Health and Family Life Education at all levels of education up to secondary school, in the context of high rates of teenage pregnancy and sexual molestation of adolescent girls by male peers.

The issue of abortion remains a controversial one in the Caribbean. Any advocacy on abortion laws has met with great opposition from faith-based organizations. As of 2003, only Barbados (Medical Termination of Pregnancy Act, 1983) and Guyana (Medical Termination of Pregnancy Bill, 1995) had legalized abortion. In St. Lucia, CAFRA was instrumental in abortion reform. Prior to 2003, abortion was illegal under the Criminal Code and could only be performed legally for medical reasons. In addition, any person who intentionally and unlawfully caused an abortion or miscarriage was subject to 14 years' imprisonment. In 2003, after much public debate and lobbying, St. Lucia amended its abortion laws to include the protection of a woman's physical or mental health and in cases of rape or incest.

In Jamaica, abortions are illegal under the Offences Against the Person Act, 1864 and a woman who has an abortion can be jailed for life and her doctor imprisoned for up to three years. Abortions can only be performed legally in cases of rape, incest and extreme abnormality of the foetus or danger to the mother. In 2008, a Select Committee of Parliament was established to consider recommendations for legal reform and expanded access made by an Advisory Committee on Abortion set up by the previous PNP government. The Advisory Committee had pointed to the high numbers of complications from illegal abortions treated at public hospitals (with one hospital ward recording over 600 cases in a six-month period), and the dangers women's health. Of 641 patients interviewed at another hospital, 250 admitted to having had a previous termination of pregnancy, while some 200 had had two or more abortions previously. Organizations working on women's health and rights, and feminists within wider networks mobilized to support and refine the recommendations of the Advisory Committee. Sistren Theatre Collective staged a play in Parliament to bring the voices of poor women to the attention of the Select Committee. Of The Committee was subsequently shelved by the then JLP government and a return to the status quo affirmed through a Charter of Rights, without the involvement of or information provided to those

<sup>61.</sup> See Zadie Neufville (2009), "Jamaica: For an Abortion Law that reaches the Poor," Inter Press Service (IPS), 14 June, 2009, Accessible at: http://ipsnews.net/news.asp?idnews=47216

who had lobbied for expanded access.<sup>62</sup> Nevertheless, an expanded network currently exists as a basis for continuing advocacy in the face of the growing visibility of unsafe abortions, as well as the fact that the country will not achieve the Millennium Development Goal (MDG) of reducing the maternal mortality ratio by three-quarters by 2015.

In Trinidad and Tobago, abortion is not legal even in situations of rape or incest (Offences Against the Person Act, 1925). This has not been an effective hindrance to women and girls who need to have one performed. Poor women and girls seek abortions from unqualified persons, often in "backstreet" unhygienic conditions where injury inevitably results. Some of the methods and implements used to induce miscarriages include: inserting bicycle spokes into the uterus; douching with bleach or hot Dettol; ingesting hot stout with quinine tablets; ingesting Cytotec, an over-the-counter drug which results in haemorrhaging; having a 'massage' by a village midwife; throwing oneself down the stairs; and so on.<sup>63</sup> Some 3,000–4,000 women are treated at public hospitals annually for the effects of unsafe terminations and over TTD \$1 million is drained from the public purse each month to treat these complications.<sup>64</sup> Sepsis and haemorrhage are the most prevalent conditions in women who seek emergency treatment at public hospitals as a result of these and other unsafe methods of abortion.<sup>65</sup> In the northeast Caribbean, often with no professional advice or follow-up care, cases of incomplete abortion and retained products of conception are now outpacing cases of uterine perforation that result from backstreet surgical procedures.<sup>66</sup> Many women do not seek early medical intervention and go on to suffer infertility, fistulae, pelvic inflammatory disease, and chronic pelvic pain.

While poor women and girls suffer these fates, their middle class counterparts can afford to pay for abortions conducted by gynaecologists and general practitioners under sanitary conditions in private medical clinics. Thousands of such illegal abortions are estimated to be performed annually. Thus, Caribbean governments are responding neither to the threats to women's physical, mental and psychological health that result from their decisions concerning abortion, nor the class inequality that the criminalization of abortion continues to perpetuate.

Citizenship is often viewed as operating in the public sphere. However, Plummer identifies "intimate citizenship" as a "cluster of emerging concerns over the rights to choose what we do with our bodies, our feelings, our relationships, our eroticisms and our representations" (1995: 7). Women in one of the Jamaican focus groups explored this larger conception of women's citizenship as including notions of "belonging to oneself," "claiming personal integrity in one's experience of sexual pleasure," and "one's right to choose or refuse to participate in various kinds of sexual activity." While they recognized that the reality of women's poverty and dependence, as well as the threat of violence often weakened

<sup>62.</sup> Joan French, Personal communication, April 2012.

<sup>63.</sup> Personal communications with public health personnel in Trinidad and Tobago, March 2012.

<sup>64.</sup> Central Statistical Office, Trinidad and Tobago (1999), Population and Vital Statistics Report.

<sup>65.</sup> C. J. Martin (2006), "In the womb of the law", *Trinidad and Tobago Review*, 4 September, 2006, pp. 12–13.

<sup>66.</sup> See G. Pheterson and Y. Azize (2005), "Abortion practice in the Northeast Caribbean: Just write down stomach pain", Reproductive Health Matters, vol. 13, no. 26, pp. 44–45.

women's ability to exercise their fundamental rights in sexual decision-making, they expressed the strong belief that women needed to articulate greater personal strength and a sense of themselves in intimate relationships:

We have generations of young women who don't know anything or much about sexual pleasure, because we know from the statistics that young girls are often sexually molested .... Imagine the range of sexual activities in which women become disconnected from self-empowering pleasure. A radical implication of this is that our most intimate relationships form part of our citizenship rights. Sexual violence diminishes our possibilities for blooming and flourishing as a human being.<sup>67</sup>

As Mohammed has observed, "the problematic areas of abortion rights, sexual orientation and sexual identity present some of the stumbling blocks to democracy and are perceived as damaging to the conservatism and religious base on which small societies fashion and ensure gendered behaviours deemed acceptable." 68

However, as the discussions among women in the focus groups revealed, there is an emerging openness to enlarging the concept of women's democratic rights as citizens. This also has implications for how men view and express their manhood and masculinity(ies).

### 4.4 Socialization, affection and care

An ECLAC study points out that "unpaid domestic ... or reproductive care work directly impacts on the productive sector contributing in no small measure to the economic sustainability of society" (2007: 1). It also found that women have "overwhelming responsibility for child/family care; the poorer the household, community and/or country, the greater the burden of work. Because of this responsibility, women "hustle" more than men to find a means of survival, often by finding multiple sources of waged work and/or other income" (2007: 14).

The study reports further that in the Bahamas, Barbados, and St. Vincent and the Grenadines, there were no processes in place to measure women's unpaid domestic work, although Barbados has implemented legislation with regard to paid domestic work. The Domestic Employees (Hours of Duty) Act, 1982 provides for minimum wages for maximum hours of work per week. In Trinidad and Tobago, the National Union of Domestic Employees (NUDE) which is affiliated to the International Wages for Housework Group, launched a Wages for Housework campaign and in 1995, independent Senator Diana Mahabir-Wyatt introduced the Counting Women's Unremunerated Work Bill into Parliament. In Dominica, unpaid work was included in the 2001 census, and the National Policy and Action Plan for Gender Equity and Equality recognizes the contribution of women's unpaid work to home and child care.

<sup>67.</sup> Focus Group participant, Jamaica, January 2012.

<sup>68.</sup> Patricia Mohammed (2011), "Gender Politics and Global Democracy: Insights from the Caribbean", August 2011, p. 16, Unpublished paper.

Red Thread of Guyana was the first women's organization in the region to conduct a systemic time-use survey of women from all ethnic groups including illiterate women, which found that women had a typical unpaid working day of 14–18 hours, "with little help from anyone, often with minimal or unreliable technology, limited access to amenities and with very little leisure or free time for themselves." Even when women were pregnant or sick, they continued their weekly duties even though this meant extended work hours of 21–24 hours per day. Red Thread concluded that "sexism continues to trivialize and refuses to acknowledge the importance of what women are doing" (ECLAC, 2007: 22).

To assist mothers in striking a balance between unpaid and paid work, the state and the private sector have begun to put in place child care facilities In Grenada, the Ministry of Social Development provides day care in the form of community educational services, for children between the ages of six months and three years old. In addition, the Mobile Caregivers Programme provides day care for children aged 3 months to 3 years old at home in the rural communities of St. David.<sup>69</sup> Similarly, in St. Vincent and the Grenadines, the Roving Caregivers Programme targets rural communities, and in 2007 it served 302 families and 319 children.

The so-called "absent father syndrome" has been the subject of many studies on Caribbean masculinities. Jacqueline Sharpe, President of the Family Planning Association of Trinidad and Tobago states, "That Caribbean men care for their family and provide for them economically has been demonstrated .... However, their emotional availability and social ties to children are unclear" (1996: 262). A World Bank study on youth development in the Caribbean concludes that "the family is both the strongest protective factor and the strongest risk factor for youth behaviour and outcomes" (World Bank, 2003: xvi). There thus obtains a link between absent fathers and male parental guidance and support, and at-risk behaviours among the male youth population.

### 4.5 Women and the economy

In the post-independence period, Caribbean girls and women have taken greater advantage of educational opportunities than boys and men. Seeing education as a means of upward mobility, girls have outnumbered boys in secondary school enrolment and outperformed boys in schools.<sup>70</sup> However, Mark Figueroa indicated that while women graduates now outnumber males at the University of the West Indies, this is not true of all disciplines.<sup>71</sup> Plummer observed that while girls' educational access, retention and attainment have greatly improved, these indicators are declining for boys.<sup>72</sup> Figueroa has linked this to gender socialization practices which privilege the male gender. He

<sup>69.</sup> Government of Grenada, Ministry of Social Development, Accessible at: http://www.gov.gd/ministries/social\_development.html

70. Rhoda Reddock (2004), Interrogating Caribbean Masculinities: Theoretical and Empirical Analyses (ed.), University of the West Indies Press, Mona, Jamaica, p. xv.

<sup>71.</sup> See Mark Figueroa (2004), "Male privileging and male 'academic underperformance' in Jamaica", In Rhoda Reddock (ed.), Ibid, pp. 137-166.

<sup>72.</sup> David Plummer (2007), "Has learning become taboo and sexual risk compulsory? Researching the relationship between masculinities, education and HIV", Paper presented at Masculinites, Education and Criminal Justice Research Symposium, Centre for Gender and Development Studies, University of the West Indies, St. Augustine Campus, Trinidad and Tobago, p. 3.

argues that female dominated professions are comparatively low status and low paying, and women tend to have more qualifications than men for the same job. Thus despite women's educational advances, male privilege is perpetuated in the labour market.<sup>73</sup>

Caribbean women have been economically active since African slavery and Indian indentureship, and continue to exhibit relatively high rates of labour force participation. In 1985, over 20% of the female population in the Caribbean was economically active. In Jamaica, 62% of females over fourteen years old participated in the labour force, with approximately 40% in Barbados (Antrobus, 1985). The World Bank reported that for Jamaica, the figure increased to 72% for women aged 15–64 years old in 1995, but declined to 61% in 2009. In St. Lucia there was a steady increase of females between the ages of 15–64 entering the labour force – from 45% in 1990 to 56% in 2009. Similarly, there were also steady increases in St. Vincent and the Grenadines from 49% in 1990 to 62% in 2009.

However, due to the deeply embedded gender socialization which continues to affirm the private sphere as women's space, gendered occupational segregation still exists. A 2010 Inter-American Development Bank (IDB) report indicated that in Jamaica women were concentrated in four sectors: commerce (30.7%), education and health (22.6%), domestic service (15.3%), and primary activities (12.1%). Thus while women have been entering new sectors, they are concentrated in 'traditional' occupations. The high incidence of female-headed households has reinforced this, pushing women into employment with low wages and poor working conditions. Women are also the first to be fired – two-thirds of persons laid off in 2001 were women (IDB, 2010: 121-122).

While domestic workers comprise a significant percentage of women workers in the Caribbean, the ILO reports that "domestic work is undervalued, underpaid, unprotected and poorly regulated" due to the job's similarity to women's domestic work which has no monetary compensation (ILO, 2010). In a Trinidad and Tobago focus group discussion, the plight of domestic workers was highlighted in terms of unfair dismissals, even after years of working with the same employer. The question was posed, "Are domestic workers full and equal citizens, and how can they access their citizenship rights?" The question has relevance to the thousands of mainly women workers across the Caribbean whose employment is not mediated by a collective bargaining process, whose place of employment within the setting of the household still bears and perpetuates features and traces of the colonial master/ mistress/ servant condition and relationship, and who often have to negotiate the complex environment with another woman as householder and mistress, who more than likely is herself caught up in negotiating a complex web of unequal gender relationships.

Domestic workers have begun to organize nationally and regionally, and have joined international networks. The National Union of Domestic Workers (NUDE) established in Trinidad and Tobago in 1982 has campaigned for legislation to recognize domestic workers as workers and protect their

<sup>73.</sup> See Mark Figueroa (2004), Op. Cit., pp. 137-166.

<sup>74.</sup> See World Bank (2009), Genderstats Database, Accessible at: http://web.worldbank.org/WBSITE/EXTERNAL/TOPICS/EXTGENDER/EXTANATOOLS/EXTSTATINDDATA/EXTGENDERSTATS/0,,menuPK:3237391~pagePK:64168427~piPK:64168435~theSitePK:3237336,00.html

rights. NUDE's membership includes some 10,000 domestic workers who are excluded from the country's Industrial Relations Act and the Occupational Safety and Health Act. Similarly, the Jamaica Household Workers Association (JHWA) was founded in 1991 to represent the needs and interests of female household workers. In November 2011, NUDE and JHWA successfully launched the Caribbean Domestic Workers Network at the Barbados Workers' Union Labour College to push Caribbean governments to ratify and implement the ILO's 2011 landmark Convention Concerning Decent Work for Domestic Workers. The Convention sets out that, "domestic workers around the world who care for families and households, must have the same basic labour rights as those available to other workers: reasonable hours of work, weekly rest of at least 24 consecutive hours, a limit on in-kind payment, clear information on terms and conditions of employment, as well as respect for fundamental principles and rights at work including freedom of association and the right to collective bargaining."<sup>75</sup>

With regard to other opportunities for employment, the working class focus group in Jamaica felt that women's prospects for recruitment and training were limited in areas such as public transport and national security (the army). Although they noted that more women were being recruited as bus drivers, the view was that opportunities were still limited. And where some changes were taking place, it was due to the fact that women were more willing than men to adapt to the recent requirement to multi-task as drivers-conductors (i.e., to both drive the bus as well as collect bus fares) without a significant wage increase.

With regard to agriculture, Barrow (1994) asserts that in the Caribbean agricultural sector, "androcentric connotations" such as "peasant" for "male peasant" and "farmer" for "male farmer" inform women being written out of agriculture, and when their involvement is affirmed it is not as "farmers" but as "housewives and mothers" who produce food for their families in their "kitchen gardens." She argues further, that where there is the acknowledgement that women are involved in agriculture and farming and contribute to national production and development, policies are directed equally to male and female farmers with the underlying assumption that both benefit equally. But this is often not so since men and women in rural communities tend to play different roles and functions in their households, families and communities.

UN Women has found that Caribbean women have "limited access to and control over the means of production – land and credit in particular." The Ministry of Agriculture in Guyana advises that, "If women had the same access to productive resources as men, they could increase yields on their farms by 20–30 per cent." Thus, women in agriculture face issues regarding land ownership, access to financial assistance and agricultural incentives, as well as to education and

<sup>75.</sup> ILO (2011), "Text of the Convention Concerning Decent Work for Domestic Workers", International Labour Convention, 100th Session, Geneva, Switzerland, Accessible at: http://www.ilo.org/wcmsp5/groups/public/--ed\_norm/--relconf/documents/meetingdocument/wcms\_157836.pdf 76. UN Women (n.d), "Advocacy Brief: Strengthening Women's Economic Security and Rights", Accessible at: http://www.unifemcar.org/ge\_iss.cfm?SubID=168&link\_=1

<sup>77.</sup> Ministry of Agriculture, Guyana (2011), "Women in Agriculture: Closing the Gender Gap for Sustainable Development", Message on the observance of International Women's Day , 8 March, 2011, Accessible at: http://www.agriculture.gov.gy/Speeches/Message%20by%20the%20 Ministry%20of%20Agriculture%20on%20the%20observance%20of%20International%20Women's%20Day%20-March%2008,%202011.html.

training. In addition, other critical requirements such as water for household and sanitation, child care, financing, technology, markets, and labour support would enable greater agricultural productivity and earnings.

Women's entrepreneurship continues to be concentrated in the informal sector. While men also occupy the informal sector, Sookram et al (2006: 3) and Sookram and Watson (2007: 2-3) have found that in Trinidad and Tobago, they predominate in the "business" informal sector or activities that provide high outputs or remuneration, whereas women are found mainly in the "household" informal sector. A 2001 study of female entrepreneurs in small and cottage industries in Barbados, Suriname, and Trinidad and Tobago found that they dominated the manufacturing, wholesale and retail trade sectors in enterprises such as food processing, catering, garment construction, and hairdressing. They were also more driven by improving the living standards of their families than the profit motive, and they tended to avoid risky ventures particularly if they became an entrepreneur due to circumstances such as loss of a job, divorce or death of a family member. They also identified constraints of gender discrimination and gender scrutiny when dealing with loans officers, pressures of balancing domestic and business responsibilities, lack of readily available information on small business opportunities, high costs of raw materials, and difficulty in accessing credit. There is thus a correlation between women's participation in the informal sector and poverty.

Caribbean governments, the private sector, credit unions and NGOs have been encouraging women's entrepreneurship, largely in the form of micro-credit programmes. In Guyana, the Ministry of Human Service and Social Security in collaboration with the Guyana Bank for Trade and Industry Limited launched the 5-year Women of Worth micro-credit programme in 2010 to assist single mothers in starting small businesses. In Trinidad and Tobago, the Network of NGOs launched the WRS Bank in November 2004, based on the Women's Responsive Sou Sou Banking System, or the African tradition of sou sou. The WRS Bank or Sou Sou Bank aims "to work with rural and urban low-income women to remove poverty from their lives through wealth practices and enterprise."79 The Women Business Owners (WBO) Jamaica Limited, funded by the Inter-American Development Bank, has launched a project on Strengthening and Promoting Women's Enterprise to assist women business owners to access capital, training, mentorship, and technical assistance. In Barbados, the Women Entrepreneurs of Barbados (WEB) has emerged as a business association for women. Members receive support to own and expand sustainable businesses. Catherine Kumar, CEO of the Trinidad and Tobago Chamber of Industry and Commerce, has been quoted as saying that "women have progressed and are being considered for the top positions. It is just that we need to see more women wanting to take up these positions." 80

<sup>78.</sup> Carol Ferdinand (2001), "Jobs, Gender and Small Enterprises in the Caribbean: Lessons from Barbados, Suriname and Trinidad and Tobago" (ed.), Seed Working Paper No. 19, In Focus Programme on Boosting Employment through Small Enterprise Development, Job Creation and Enterprise Department Series on Women's Entrepreneurship Development. International Labour Organization – Caribbean Office.

<sup>79.</sup> The Network of NGOs for the Advancement of Women in Trinidad and Tobago (n.d.), "The Women's Responsive Sou Sou Banking System", Accessible at: http://www.networkngott.org/index.php?option=com\_content&view=article&id=12&ltemid=17

 $<sup>80. \</sup> Quoted \ in \ newspaper \ article \ "Women \ at top, by \ choice", In \ Trinidad \ and \ Tobago \ Newsday, September \ 2, 2010.$ 

Social protection programmes in the Caribbean feature a number of institutional weaknesses including: low value of benefits; high administrative costs; poor quality service; lack of sustained funding; slow response rate for requests for assistance; red tape and bureaucracy in accessing benefits; lack of coordination between ministries and departments; and unclear roles and functions of officers and departments (Henry-Lee, 2011: 7). It has also been argued that while re-distributive policies have provided some social welfare and have allowed some economic autonomy, little emphasis has been placed on preventative or transformative strategies.

Gender-responsive budgeting is also an unfamiliar concept for most Caribbean states. Bureaux and Ministries of Women's/ Gender Affairs tend to receive the lowest budgetary allocations, and there is little if any attempt by mainstream sector ministries such as water and sanitation, agriculture and food production, trade and industry, the environment, among others to include plans, programmes and budgetary allocations to address specific gender issues and gaps. As a result, macro-economic policy frameworks based on an understanding of women's and men's differential economic roles and activities are non-existent, or at best, very poorly framed.<sup>81</sup>

Within the economic sphere, the impact of the feminist movement bears some scrutiny. The strategies for women's economic empowerment have tended to focus on policies, projects, training and mentorship. The question that needs to be answered is whether these are sufficient to build women's economic autonomy in the context of the obstacles they face. There is an urgent need for women's voices and perspectives to be heard not only at the micro-levels but on macro-economic and trade policy. More also needs to be done to advance women's participation at the highest levels of the economic and corporate sectors in the Caribbean. While some women have become CEOs of large companies and have forged spaces in the tourism, agriculture, and the oil and gas industry, there is an absence of analyses of women's location within the major sectors of Caribbean economies. Compared to men who dominate the top positions in the major economic sectors, women's voices have been very limited on issues of macro-economic development. To interpret Jackson and Wedderburn, this could be linked to the gender stratification in the labour market in which men, concentrated in the more organized sectors, have greater institutional bargaining power unlike women whose lower ability to negotiate is linked to their concentration in the more informal and unorganized segments of the labour market.<sup>82</sup>

<sup>81.</sup> Simel Esim (2000), "Gender-Sensitive Budget Initiatives for Latin America and the Caribbean: A Tool for Improving Accountability and Achieving Effective Policy Implementation", Paper Prepared for the Eighth Regional Conference on Women of Latin America and the Caribbean, Beijing +5, Lima, February 8-10, 2000.

<sup>82.</sup> See Jason Jackson and Judith Wedderburn (2009), "Gender and the Economic Partnership Agreement: An analysis of the Potential Gender Effects of the CARIFORUM-EU EPA", 2 February, 2009, p.14.

### 4.6 Human security

The concept of human security is very relevant to women's citizenship. Human security posits that "to protect people – the first key to human security – their basic rights and freedoms must be upheld". It encompasses broadly: "the absence of violent conflict," "human rights and good governance," "access to education and health care," and ensuring that "each individual has opportunities and choices to fulfil his or her own potential." Thus, human security and human rights go hand in hand. It recognizes the importance of women's and men's individual and collective agency in shaping and implementing decisions that affect their lives. States therefore have the responsibility to protect citizens not only from external threats such as wars, but also from internal threats including hunger and poverty, violence and abuse, and environmental pollution, among others that may be experienced in the home and the wider community. This is a fundamental tenet of the 'rights based approach to development' which stresses the importance of "developing capacities of the 'duty bearers' to meet their obligations and 'rights-holders' to claim their rights" (Mukhopadhyay, 2003: 6).

### Gender-based violence

The Caribbean feminist movement has had its most significant advocacy, campaigns and legislative impact on the issue of violence against women, advocating for states to honour their commitments to international conventions that protect women from all forms of violence, namely the Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Discrimination against Women (CEDAW), the Declaration on the Elimination of Violence Against Women, the Beijing Platform for Action, and the Millennium Development Goals (MDGs).

CAFRA has been involved in the campaign on violence against women in the region since the 1990s, centred on legislative reform, public education and counselling. It also sponsored the first Regional Tribunal on Violence Against Women held in Barbados in November 1998, and held events throughout the Caribbean. These culminated in recommendations including: enacting legislation on sexual harassment, utilizing the CARICOM model legislation as a guide; establishing family courts with support services for families; and enacting legislation to enable "battered woman syndrome" to be used as a defense in trials involving domestic violence.<sup>84</sup>

Through the OECS Family Law Reform Project, the governments of the Organization of Eastern Caribbean States (OECS) have sought to create a harmonized model Family Legislation which includes a proposed Domestic Violence Bill. In aiming to fill the legislative void on this human right's issue, the Bill seeks to protect women from domestic violence. It widens the definition of domestic violence to include not only physical, sexual and emotional abuse, but also stalking, destruction of property and

<sup>83.</sup> Commission on Human Security (2003), Human Security Now: Protecting and Empowering People, Commission on Human Security, New York, Accessible at: www.humansecurity-chs.org

<sup>84.</sup> CAFRA (1998), "International Day Against Violence to Women: Gender Violence: Causes, Effects and Solutions", 25 November, 1998, Accessible at: http://www.cafra.org/spip.php?article100

intimidation. In addition, the Bill would also increase the power of police officers to arrest perpetrators at the scene of a domestic violence incident.<sup>85</sup>

In Dominica, the Domestic Violence Bill, 1996 and Sexual Offences Act, 1998 and were passed to legally protect persons, especially women and girls, from all forms of violence. In 2001, the Bureau of Women's Affairs undertook a survey of 770 males and females on their attitudes to and experiences of domestic violence. The study found that a large percentage of the males interviewed came from abusive homes, and there was a general belief that women's behaviour provoked abusive violence. Most incidents of domestic abuse affecting the young and old in marriages, common-law or visiting relationships but more so in long-term relationships, were not reported due to a lack of confidence in the police, the law and judicial services. As a result of the study, the Bureau recommended: public education and training in areas such as conflict-resolution, domestic roles, personal relationships, and human rights; implementation of existing legislation; improved government policy and support services; implementation of a male outreach programme; inclusion of the issue of domestic violence in the Health and Family Life (HFLE) school curriculum; acquisition of parenting/ life skills; economic empowerment for disadvantaged groups; consciousness-raising/ sensitization of law enforcers on gender-based and domestic violence; and linkages between the government, civil society and the private sector.<sup>26</sup>

In Guyana, the Domestic Violence Act, 1996 includes protection of victims of domestic violence, help and shelter for victims, and applications for protection orders which can be filed with the clerk of the magistrate's court. Despite the legislation, domestic violence persists – for example, in June 2008 there were over 3,600 cases.<sup>87</sup> Trotz commented that "proliferating legislation appears to be accompanied by an increase in violence against women and children .... One would expect that with more laws and visibility, rates of violence would start going down, but tragically the relationship seems to be in the opposite direction."<sup>88</sup>

In Jamaica, the low rate of clearing up of sexual offences, points to weaknesses in the criminal justice system.

<sup>85.</sup> Government of Anguilla (n.d.), Accessible at: www.gov.ai or http://www.gov.ai/documents/msd/Article\_on\_Domestic\_Violence\_Bill.pdf 86. Bureau of Women's Affairs, Dominica (2002), "Report on Domestic Violence Research in Dominica", September 2002; See also UN ECLAC (2002), "Attitudes to Domestic Violence in Dominica: Some Research Findings", Gender Dialogue, Issue no. 7, September 2002.

<sup>87.</sup> Immigration and Refugee Board of Canada (2008), "Guyana: Prevalence of Domestic Violence, Availability of State Protection, Recourse and Services Available to Victims", 8 October, 2008, GUY102929.E, Accessible at: http://www.unhcr.org/refworld/docid/492ac7c3c.html

<sup>88.</sup> Alissa Trotz (2010), "Law and Domestic Violence", Starbroek News, 25 October, 2010, Accessible at: http://www.stabroeknews.com/2010/features/10/25/law-and-domestic-violence/

Table 2: Sexual offences reported and cleared up in Jamaica, 2008

	'	
SEXUAL OFFENCE	REPORTED	CLEARED UP
Rape	849	316
Carnal Abuse	610	356
Indecent Assault	499	394
Incest	55	68
Buggery	92	63
Attempted Rape	22	7
Assault with Intent to Rape	85	40
Gross Indecency	20	7
TOTAL	2,232	1,251

Source: Economic and Social Survey of Jamaica, 2008

With a 56% clear-up rate as indicated in Table 2 above, in Jamaica women as citizens have claims to rights and freedoms that are not being met within the criminal justice system. An assessment of policing and prosecution in Jamaica supported by UN Women revealed a host of systemic weaknesses in the criminal justice system. Recommendations were made on law and policy reform, and enhancing effectiveness in policing and prosecuting. Proposals on improving access to the justice system, particularly for women and girls included: public education, provision of legal services to victims/ survivors, improvement in court facilities, provision of shelters for victims/ survivors, and improvement in the complaints' process.<sup>89</sup>

Domestic violence thus persists despite state legislation across the Anglophone Caribbean. The major barriers include: gaps in legal frameworks; lack of knowledge of the legislation by law enforcement officials, especially the local police; women's lack of knowledge of their rights and understanding of and confidence in the justice system; the threat of further violence and social stigma if women attempt to access the justice system; and financial constraints such as the costs of litigation. These add up to a lack of access to gender justice for women. To female victims of gender-based violence, the judicial system can be like hostile territory and justice a foreign land.

Guarantees of women's human rights are also limited by the fact that only a minority of Caribbean countries have signed the Optional Protocol to CEDAW, which would enable individuals and NGOs to take complaints of women's rights violations directly to the CEDAW Committee for investigation, rather than waiting on States Parties to do so. The absence of this instrument is felt particularly sharply in relation to what Thomas Hammarberg, European Commissioner for Human Rights at the Council of Europe, refers to as the "gap (that) still exists between the rights proclaimed in human rights treaties and the reality in member states. Closing this implementation gap is crucial for all human rights work today."

<sup>89.</sup> Bureau of Women's Affairs, Jamaica (2009), "Policing and Prosecuting of Sexual Offences in Jamaica: A Baseline Assessment, 2009".

<sup>90.</sup> Council of Europe: Commissioner for Human Rights (2009), "Serious implementation of human rights standards requires that benchmarking indicators are defined", 17 August, 2009, Accessible at: http://www.unhcr.org/refworld/docid/4a8bfe6a2.html

In addition, boys and men are increasingly experiencing gender-based violence including incest, being beaten by girlfriends and sexual partners, and violence and bullying in schools and the wider society due to (perceptions of) their sexual orientation. However, they are often ashamed to talk about it or report it to the police.

### **Human trafficking**

As trafficking in persons has become an important trans-border issue in the Caribbean, the International Labour Organization (ILO), International Organisation for Migration (IOM), and other international agencies have been playing a catalytic role in putting this issue on the agenda across the Caribbean. According to Kamala Kempadoo, "regional bodies such as the Organization of American States, the Association of Caribbean States and the Caribbean Community (CARICOM) have shown signs of making human trafficking an issue" (2007: 80-81). There has been action to address various dimensions of the problem, particularly trafficking of labour, including child labour, and trafficking of women into prostitution. The majority of persons trafficked are female children and young women.

Kempadoo locates the discussion on trafficking within the harsh economic and social conditions in Caribbean economies, high levels of poverty and unemployment, unregulated and underground sectors, and the strong reliance of persons who are not in the formal sector on the drug and sex trades. Fundamentally she states, "human trafficking, if you want to call it that, provides industries, both in the formal or informal sector, with cheap labour" and is propelled by the "dire inequalities between the haves and the have-nots, and the larger that gap gets, the more we'll see the smuggling, exploitation and violence." <sup>91</sup>

The CARICOM Single Market and Economy (CSME) could see an increase in trafficking and the regional sex trade where, for example, a person enters a CARICOM country seeking a particular job, but may find that it is not forthcoming. Such situations may induce unsuspecting women into sex work. Much needs to be done in terms of legislation, regional cooperation and the expansion of welfare services for survivors of trafficking, and for the protection of the rights of sex workers. The fact that some countries such as Jamaica do not offer protection from forced labour and slavery as a fundamental right, is cause for concern.<sup>92</sup>

### **HIV/AIDS**

The Caribbean region, with an HIV/AIDS prevalence rate of 1%, is the second most-affected region in the world after Sub-Saharan Africa and the most affected region in the Americas.<sup>93</sup> According to UNAIDS, at the end of 2009, there were 30.8 million people worldwide living with HIV/AIDS,

<sup>91.</sup> See "Human Trafficking in the Caribbean". Nex Generation interviews Professor Kamala Kempadoo, Ph.D. in NEX Generation, Issue no. 7, Spring, Apr.-Jun 2012, pp. 70, 71.

<sup>92.</sup> International Organisation for Migration (2005), Legal Review of Trafficking in Persons in the Caribbean. p. 13.

among them 15.9 million women and 2.5 million children. AIDS has been the leading cause of death in the 15–49 age group in Barbados and Trinidad and Tobago, and the majority of new HIV-positive cases occur among women aged 20–24. Twenty-one Caribbean countries had created and implemented national strategic plans on HIV/AIDS by the end of 2006. However, while they "embraced a comprehensive approach" including prevention, treatment, care, institutional development, management and coordination, and monitoring and evaluation, there was no significant drop in the number of new HIV infections in the region between 2001 and 2008. There has thus been a call for governments to do more to reduce the incidence of new HIV infections in individual states and the region as a whole.<sup>94</sup>

It is evident that there are policy gaps and implementation deficits with regard to gender-based violence, human trafficking, and HIV/AIDS. These issues need to be placed on the regional policy agenda within the human rights, human development and human security frameworks to ensure that women and children can enjoy and fully contribute to human development. As duty bearers, governments in the region are responsible for securing the human rights of all.

<sup>93.</sup> The Henry J. Kaiser Family Foundation (2009), "HIV/AIDS Policy Fact Sheet", November 2009, Accessible at: http://www.kff.org/hivaids/upload/7505-06.pdf

 $<sup>94.\</sup> UNAIDS\ (2010), UNAIDS\ report\ on\ the\ global\ AIDS\ epidemic,\ Accessible\ at:\ http://www.unaids.org/globalreport/$ 



### How women evaluate the performance of democracy



### 5. How women evaluate the performance of democracy

### 5.1 Democracy's ambiguous relationship with women

Among its principles, democracy posits the equality of men and women in law. This formal commitment to equality is, according to Tracy Robinson, an appeal to "a gender blind or virtual equality." It advances "speculative claims to equality but fails to adequately address that which exists – the substantive inequality women face" (Robinson, 2000). This ambiguity between the promise and reality of women's citizenship in law, intertwined with the patriarchal nature of the democratic state and other institutions, as well as exclusions based on race/ethnicity, class, age, (dis)ability and sexual orientation, all inform women's continuing struggle for gender equality.

Since the 1970s, the response of Caribbean governments has been reflected largely in the establishment of Bureaux and Ministries of Women's/ Gender Affairs (see earlier discussions in Sections 2.5, 3.3.1 and 3.3.2), through which the state has sought to systematize its response to women's rights and gender equality claims. These entities have served to remind the state of its commitments and obligations, facilitate legal reform (often based on CARICOM's model legislation), formulate policies and deliver programmes, and acted as a conduit for dialogue between women's organizations and the state. However, their effectiveness has been undermined by factors including: the lack of adequate funding and personnel, and some uncertainty about their location and mandate within the ministerial hierarchy and public sector bureaucracy. Despite these realties, their work has served to keep Caribbean states responsive, to a degree, to gender equality demands and commitments at the national, regional and global levels. The consultative approach to developing national gender policies since the 2000s in the Bahamas, Belize, Dominica, Guyana, Jamaica, and St. Kitts and Nevis<sup>95</sup> and the overseas territories of the British Virgin Islands, Cayman Islands, and Turks and Caicos Islands has served to raise awareness of the need for gender justice in all spheres of life. The implementation of these policies will be a critical challenge.

<sup>95.</sup> Trinidad and Tobago is still in the process of developing its national gender policy. The process, initiated by the government in 2002, has been repeatedly hamstrung over the past decade by the issues of termination of pregnancy and sexual orientation which have been contested by faith-based organizations in the society (see Verna St. Rose-Greaves, Minister of Gender, Youth and Child Development, "Feature Address", presented at the Stakeholder Consultation on the Trinidad and Tobago National Gender Policy, Cascadia Hotel, St. Ann's, Port of Spain, 16 May, 2012, Unpublished). The Barbados Government has indicated that its Bureau of Gender Affairs will soon begin developing a National Gender Policy (see http://www.unifemcar.org/ge\_iss.cfm?link\_=13).

This points to the fundamental question of who is accountable to women, and what must this accountability look like? In its 2008/2009 publication, Who Answers to Women? Gender and Accountability, UNIFEM (now UN Women) proposed two basic requirements: first, women must be part of accountability systems and must be "entitled to ask for explanations and justifications," and second, "power holders must answer for their performance in advancing women's rights." This means that the integrity of democratic institutions and the performance of decision-makers must be judged by their delivery on the goals of gender equality and equity (UNIFEM, 2009: 2-3).

How to ensure that women are part of accountability systems, and power holders are made accountable for achieving gender equality and equity goals? The question has practical implications at the institutional and leadership levels in the Caribbean. For example, with regard to the link between state machineries and women's rights organizations (see earlier discussions in Sections 2.5, 3.3.1 and 3.3.3), the question remains of how to ensure state accountability. One may ask, how many countries have an independent and viable national women's/ gender commission that is mandated to hold the state accountable for its women's rights and gender equality commitments? Perhaps Belize has the most developed National Women's Commission which brings together representatives of women's organizations and undertakes research and training, working in parallel with the Women's Bureau. However, the effectiveness of these bodies as an independent and strong monitor of governments' performance is open to question.

### 5.2 Democratic deficits of governance and accountability

However, accountability to women has not been identified among the indices used to judge Caribbean democracies, said to be experiencing a crisis of governance. Brian Meeks, for example, has identified clientelism, centralization of power, the exclusion of third parties, and the absence of a strong independent civil society as being among the negative features that have characterized the practice of democracy in the region (Meeks, 1996). The competitiveness of electoral politics, often reinforced by "force, fraud and violence" has also been a pronounced feature of political engagement in Jamaica since the 1970s (Ryan, 2001). In 1996, Figueroa wrote about the "garrison phenomenon" in Jamaica and its threat to democratic values (Figueroa, 1996). He forewarned the worst manifestations of the May 2010 "Tivoli Incursion", the incursion by state security forces into Tivoli Gardens in West Kingston in search of Christopher "Dudus" Coke, drug lord and de facto leader of the inner-city garrison, when over 70 persons were killed (D'Aguilar, 2012). Judith Wedderburn poses the question, "Should a Commission of Enquiry into the Tivoli Incursion be held, what weight would be given to women's voice, place, role and contribution to the overall process as well as the impact on them and their families, or would they be treated simply as collateral damage?" <sup>96</sup>

<sup>96.</sup> Judith Wedderburn, Personal communication, May 2012.

'Low-intensity democracy', evidenced by declining voter participation, emerged as the major theme on Norman Girvan's website following the 29 December, 2011 national elections in Jamaica. 97 Some 27.8% of electors voted for the winning party which secured 66% of parliamentary seats, representing the continuation of a downward trend witnessed in the four previous elections. The tribalism of political parties on the basis of class in Jamaica, and ethnic polarization in Guyana and Trinidad and Tobago, represents another feature of the crisis in politics.

A crisis of public ethics, lack of transparency and accountability, and pervasive corruption are among other issues of concern. The Americas Barometer Report 2010 reveals that Trinidad and Tobago (83.1%) and Jamaica (81.7%) manifest the highest perception of corruption in the Americas, with Guyana (78.5%) and Belize (76%) following closely behind. Some 53.4% of Jamaicans surveyed regarded corruption as "very common" and 40.5% as "common." The report also revealed that since 2006, Jamaicans' belief that democracy is the best form of government has declined from 78.8% to 70.1%. Unfortunately the report is gender blind, but what is well known is that corruption is linked to persistent poverty in the region, diverting huge resources from development programmes that are critical to the lives of women and their families, e.g., job creation, water and sanitation, health, school feeding, education, transport, agriculture and entrepreneurship, among others.<sup>99</sup>

Sunity Maharaj, journalist, encapsulates the situation as follows:

The failure to fertilise the environment and water the roots of a genuine democracy is the source of the enduring protest and corruption that so define Caribbean society. It is why in this peaceful region of sun, sea and sand, we can never take social peace for granted. Under the surface of the 500-year history of the modern Caribbean runs a thread of revolution that represents the unending battle to destroy centralised power. On any given day, in any given country, we could wake up to the news of a protest that has been magically and mysteriously transformed into a revolution. 100

### 5.3 Under-representation of women in politics

### **National Parliaments**

Focus group participants concurred that the post-independence crisis of politics is most starkly evident in the persistent under-representation of women. This weakness has been manifested since the granting of Universal Adult Suffrage (UAS), as shown by the data in Table 3 below. Women were fielded as candidates immediately or within a year of their access to the vote under Universal Adult

<sup>97. &</sup>quot;Jamaica's PNP – Back in the Saddle", Accessible at: http://www.normangirvan.info/girvan-Jamaicas-new-PNP-government).

<sup>98.</sup> USAID, LAPOP, University of the West Indies, and Vanderbilt University (2010), "The Political Culture of Democracy in Jamaica, 2010: Democratic Consolidation in the Americas in Hard Times".

<sup>99.</sup> Focus group meeting held in St. Augustine, Trinidad and Tobago, January 2012.

<sup>100.</sup> Maharaj Sunity (2012), "Politics Without People", Sunday Express, 25 March, 2012, p. 14. Accessible at: http://www.trinidadexpress.com/ commentaries/Politics\_without\_people-144124265.html

Suffrage in Jamaica, Barbados, Guyana and Belize. In other countries, the wait for women took much longer – 19 years in St. Kitts and Nevis, and 30 years in Antigua and Barbuda. Thus women's citizenship right to vote did not automatically lead to their political representation.

Table 3: Women's right to vote, entry into and winning of seats in Caribbean Parliaments

Country	Year women granted right to vote (UAS)	Year women first contested elections	Year women first won seat(s) in Parliament
Jamaica	1944	1944	1944
Trinidad and Tobago	1946	1950	1966
Barbados <sup>101</sup>	1951	1951	1951
Grenada	1951	1954	1961
Dominica	1951	1957	1966
St. Lucia	1951	1961	1974
St. Vincent and the Grenadines	1951	1957	1957
Antigua and Barbuda	1951	1980	2004
St. Kitts and Nevis	1952	1971	1984
Guyana	1953	1953	1953
Belize	1961	1961	1961
The Bahamas	1962	1962	1982

Sources: Cynthia Barrow-Giles and Tennyson S.D. Joseph (2005), General Elections and Voting in the English Speaking Caribbean, Kingston: Ian Randle Publishers, Kingston, Jamaica; and Linnette Vassell (2003), Women Organising and the Development of the Women's Movement in the Caribbean, Institute of Gender and Development Studies, University of the West Indies, Mona Campus, Jamaica. Data for St. Vincent and the Grenadines and for the Bahamas was clarified by Nelcia Robinson and Christine Campbell, respectively.

Table 4 below indicates that women's representation in Caribbean parliaments for the period 1995–2011 falls within three low bands: 0–10% (Belize at 0% and Antigua and Barbuda at 10%); 10%–15% (Dominica, St. Lucia, St. Vincent and the Grenadines, and Jamaica); and 15% and over (Bahamas, Guyana, and Trinidad and Tobago).

The Caribbean is thus falling short of the 30% target in the "political, public and private sectors" set by Commonwealth Ministers Responsible for Women's Affairs in 1996 (Commonwealth Secretariat, 1997: 19). 102 Guyana is the only country with 30% of women in parliament, achieved through a 2000 quota system for which the feminist movement fought actively during the country's post-Beijing constitutional reform process. The Elections Laws (Amendment) Act, 2000 requires that party lists must have one-third female candidates (Persadie, 2012: 23).

<sup>101.</sup> Billie Miller, Personal communication, May 2012, indicates that in Barbados legislation was passed in 1943 giving women the right to vote and run for a seat in the Barbados House of Assembly. The right was qualified, i.e., one had to have property or money or both. The first election was held in 1944. Full universal adult suffrage was achieved in 1951, and the first woman was elected to Parliament in the general election of 1951.

<sup>102.</sup> Economic and Social Council (ECOSOC) Resolution E/RES/1990/15 in 1990 first recommended targets for increasing the proportion of women in leadership positions to 30% by 1995 and 50% by 2000. The 30% target was also referred to in the Beijing Platform for Action (para. 182) in 1995 (Available at http://www.legco.gov.hk/yr02-03/english/panels/ha/papers/ha0314cb2-1636-1e.pdf).

Table 4: Women in Parliament in the Caribbean, 1995 - 2011

Country	% elected women 1995	% elected women 2000	% elected women 2004	% elected women 2011
Antigua and Barbuda	11.1	8.8	10.5	(2/19) 10.5
Bahamas	10.8	19.6	20.0	(5/41) 12.2
Barbados	18.4	20.4	13.3	10.0
Belize <sup>103</sup>	10.3	18.4	6.7	0.0
Dominica	9.4	9.7	19.4	(4/32) 12.5
Grenada	17.9	17.9	26.7	(2/13) 13.3
Guyana	11.1	8.8	30.8	(21/70) 30.0
Jamaica	12.3	16.0	11.7	(8/63) 12.7
St. Kitts and Nevis	0.0	13.3	0.0	(1/15) 6.7
St. Lucia	14.3	13.8	11.1	(2/18) 11.1
St. Vincent and the Grenadines	9.5	14.3	22.7	(3/21) 14.3
Suriname	n/a	n/a	19.6	(5/51) 9.8
Trinidad and Tobago	20.6	20.9	19.4	(12/42) 28.6

Sources: (1) Commonwealth Parliamentary Association (2000), "Women in Commonwealth Parliaments", Presented at Commonwealth Workshop on "Gender and Democracy", Windhoek, Namibia, February 2000; (2) Information sourced from the Inter-Parliamentary Union; National Women's Machineries in the Caribbean; and National Women's Commission, Belize.

The barriers to women's access to power and decision-making identified in a 2001 Commonwealth Parliamentary Association study, include political, economic, cultural and psychological factors as well as institutional structures, arrangements and styles. Being in parliament has its own challenges which limit women's participation, including those relating to "the predetermined and psychologically established social roles that are assigned to men and women, and the mass media and its attitude towards female Parliamentarians". 104

Women parliamentarians and activists attending the Caribbean Regional Colloquium on "Women Leaders as Agents of Change" held in Trinidad and Tobago in June 2011, committed to promoting gender equality in areas such as women's economic empowerment and security, ending gender-based violence, advancing sexual and reproductive health and rights, equal pay for work of equal value, and shared family responsibilities". The Port of Spain Consensus, the outcome document, made recommendations to address these and other issues.<sup>105</sup>

#### **Local Government**

The decentralization reforms in the Caribbean over the last decade have been structural reforms, for the most part. Trinidad and Tobago was the exception where women's organizations engaged

<sup>104.</sup> Commonwealth Parliamentary Association (2001), Gender-Sensitizing Commonwealth Parliaments: A Study Group Report, Accessible at: www.cpahq.org

<sup>105.</sup> See Commonwealth Secretariat (2011), "Port of Spain Consensus on Transformational Leadership for Gender Equality", Outcome document of Caribbean Regional Colloquium on "Women Leaders as Agents of Change", Port of Spain, Trinidad and Tobago, 28-30 June, 2011. Accessible at: http://www.thecommonwealth.org/files/238222/FileName/Port-of-SpainConsensus

in an explicit strategy to increase women's participation in local government. The NGO Network of Organizations for the Advancement of Women's "Engendering Local Government Project" in 1996, 1999 and 2003 "contributed to an increase in the number of women in local government from ... 16.7% to 40% over a period of six years" (Andaiye, 2009: 10).

Table 5: Women in Local Government in the Caribbean, 2011

In 2009 there were 92 elected councillors bringing to 222 the total number of female councillors.			
······································			
No local government system exists.			
Recommendations have been made to increase women's participation in local government.			
In 2009, women comprised 50% of councillors in town councils, 40% in village councils, 30% in urban councils, at 12.5% in Carib councils.			
No local government system exists.			
In 2008, only 5% of all councillors were women.			
Women councillors have declined from 27% in 2000-2003 to 23% in 2003-2007 and 18% in 2007-2010. The numb of women mayors fell from 3 before 2007 to 2 in January 2012.			
No local government system exists.			
No figures could be sourced on women councillors in the district, town, village and councils.			
No local government system exists.			
The 2010 local government elections resulted in women's representation as follows: 30% of councillors, 21% of mayors, and 38% of aldermen.			

 $Source: Commonwealth\ Local\ Government\ Forum\ (2012), Commonwealth\ Local\ Government\ Handbook\ 2011/12, Accessible\ at:\ www.clgf.org.uk$ 

Increasing women's participation in corporate governance has become a major issue since it promotes gender equity and diversity, drives profitability and sustainable economic growth, and ensures accountability and transparency.<sup>107</sup> Some earlier research had been conducted on women's representation on Boards and Commissions in Jamaica,<sup>108</sup> and in 2007-2008 the Women's Resource and Outreach Centre (WROC) undertook further research.

Table 6 below shows that in Jamaica, men account for 71% of the overall sample and thus have a strong decision-making presence on boards. "However, at approximately 84% on private sector boards, their representation far exceeded women's presence who occupied only 16% of seats on boards of publicly listed companies." <sup>109</sup> Overall, the data show that women comprised 33% of public sector boards compared to 16% of private sector boards. In addition, none of the private sector boards in the sample had more than 25% female directors, and two had 0%. When compared to a 1998 study, it was found that in the decade of 1998-2007 women's representation showed a marginal 4% increase on public sector boards compared to a 2% increase in the private sector.

<sup>106.</sup> Local Government elections held in March 2012 resulted in 4 women mayors.

<sup>107.</sup> World Development Report (2012), Gender Equality and Development, Washington, D.C.

<sup>108.</sup> Linnette Vassell (2000), "Power, Governance and the Structure of Opportunity for Women in Decision-Making in Jamaica", In Patricia Mohammed (ed.), The Construction of Gender Development Indicators for Jamaica, PIOJ/ UNDP/ CIDA, Kingston, Jamaica, pp. 83-95.

<sup>109.</sup> Women's Resource and Outreach Centre (2008), Gender and Governance: Implications for the Participation of Women on Boards and Commissions in Jamaica, Kingston, Jamaica, pp. 24-25.

Table 6: Sex composition of Boards in the overall sample in Jamaica, 2007

Type of Organization	Total no. of Members	Number of Women	Number of Men	% Women	% Men
Public Sector	212	69	143	33	67
Private Sector	69	11	58	16	84
Trade Unions	10	3	7	30	70
Total	291	83	208	29	71

 $Source: Compiled from \ lists of Board \ Members \ and \ Senior \ Managers \ of selected \ organizations \ (WROC, 2008, Gender \ and \ Governance: Implications \ for the \ Particians \ of \ Articles \ organizations \ (WROC, 2008, Gender \ and \ Governance: Implications \ for the \ Particians \ organizations \ organ$ pation of Women on Boards and Commissions in Jamaica, Kingston, Jamaica, Table 1, p. 24).

The Network of NGOs for the Advancement of Women in Trinidad and Tobago undertook a survey in 2009-2010 as part of the WROC Jamaica project, the results of which are presented in Tables 7 and 8 below. The study examined all categories of entities (statutory bodies, state enterprises/ special purpose companies, listed private companies, credit unions and trade unions). Women comprised an average of 29% of board members. Their representation on statutory boards was 39% due to the fact that senior public servants, the majority of whom are women, often represent their ministries. Women comprised 34% of boards of credit unions, 31% each of special purpose companies and trade unions, and 17% of listed private companies.

Table 7: Sex composition of Boards in Trinidad and Tobago, 2010

•	J .			
Category of entities	No. of Entities	No. of Directors	% of Women	% of Men
Statutory Boards	% of Men	141	39	61
State enterprises/ special purpose companies	58	413	31	69
Listed private companies	24	242	17	83
Credit Unions	6	49	34	66
Trade Unions	3	35	31	69
Total	115	880	29	71

Source: UNDEF Report, Outcome 4 – Indicative Research on Gender and Leadership at the level of Boards and Commissions undertaken in Trinidad and Tobago by the Network of NGOs of Trinidad and Tobago (WROC, T&T UNDEF Report Revised, June 2011).

Table 8: Female chairs and vice-chairs of Boards in Trinidad and Tobago, 2010

Category of entities	No. of Entities	No. of Female Chairs	% of Female Chairs	No. of Female Vice- chairs	% of Female Vice- chairs
Statutory Boards	24	6	25	4	17
State enterprises/special purpose companies	58	6	10	5	8
Listed private companies	24	1	4	0	0
Credit Unions	6	0	0	0	0
Trade Unions	3	1	33	0	0

Source: UNDEF Report, Outcome 4 – Indicative Research on Gender and Leadership at the level of Boards and Commissions undertaken in Trinidad and Tobago by the Network of NGOs of Trinidad and Tobago (WROC, T&T UNDEF Report Revised, June 2011).

Ideological and psychological barriers also hinder Caribbean women's political participation at an individual level, in addition to their wider social impact. WROC's 1998 study revealed that while 94.5% of men surveyed agreed that women were sufficiently prepared for leadership of boards, some 35.7% of women surveyed were of the opinion that women were not prepared. The view expressed was that society "does not readily embrace female leadership" and this results in women's "lack of self-confidence, hesitancy and lack of determination" (WROC, 2008: 50).

In Jamaica, the 51% Coalition – Development and Empowerment through Equity, a grouping of some 10 women's organizations and individual women, with support from various entities including the Private Sector Organisation of Jamaica (PSOJ) and Friedrich Ebert Stiftung (FES), launched an advocacy campaign in November 2011 calling for legislative quotas of "not more than 60% or less than 40% of either sex" on all boards, with a primary focus on public entities. A number of initiatives have been taken, including the submission of names of women who have been trained and eligible for boards to Prime Minister Portia Simpson-Miller and selected government ministers, gender sensitization sessions with the women named, and development of a programme of action with the Jamaica Stock Exchange towards influencing the private sector. Indications are that a small increase in numbers of women on boards is taking place, but the data are still incomplete. According to Judith Wedderburn, the Coalition "represents a new collective space for critical research, reflection, education and advocacy in Jamaica, which has not been present for some time." <sup>10</sup>

### 5.4 New initiatives for advancing women's transformational leadership: two case studies

#### a. Caribbean Institute for Women in Leadership (CIWiL)

In the context of women's low representation in decision-making in the region, the Caribbean Institute for Women in Leadership (CIWiL)<sup>111</sup> was founded by women's organizations which saw the need for a regional NGO network focused on advancing women's transformational leadership. The initiative emerged from a symposium which was convened by the Commonwealth Secretariat in collaboration with UNIFEM, and hosted by the Directorate of Gender Affairs in Antigua and Barbuda in June 2005

The organization was formally launched at a conference on "Transforming Leadership: Centering Women's Voice and Influence in Governance in the Caribbean," held in Barbados in July 2009 and attended by women parliamentarians and activists, and representatives of regional and international agencies. CIWiL's emergence and development are a tribute to Sheila Roseau's

<sup>110.</sup> Judith Wedderburn, Personal communication, May 2012.

<sup>111.</sup> This section on CIWiL is based on Baksh, 2011: 13-14; and Sheila Roseau, Personal communication, May 2012.

leadership, and the institutional support of the Directorate of Gender Affairs in Antigua and Barbuda. Since its launch in 2009, CIWiL's work has been supported by UN Women–Caribbean Office, the Organization of American States/ Inter-American Commission on Women (OAS/CIM), UN Democracy Fund (UNDEF), and the Institute of Gender and Development Studies (IGDS), University of the West Indies, Mona Campus.

CIWiL believes that increasing the numbers of women in political decision-making and parliament is as important as promoting awareness of transformational leadership in the region. The impact is expected to be seen in increased responsiveness and accountability of state institutions, processes and duty bearers, resulting in gender-responsive policy making. In addition, CIWiL views women's participation in democratic governance as a political and civil right, and therefore as a public good in and of itself.

CIWiL seeks to strengthen women's political participation in the Caribbean through:

- Elaborating a "women's political agenda", developed through a participatory and inclusive process across the region;
- Undertaking training institutes for women leaders, including emerging and potential leaders, supported by mentorships/ internships within political parties and NGOs;
- Awareness-raising of all stakeholders (women's organizations, political parties, trade unions, community-based organizations, and others) on the need for women's equal participation in politics and decision-making, including through public dialogues/ conferences on women's political thought and Caribbean governance issues; and
- Networking and partnership-building with all stakeholders to increase commitment to gender equality in governance, and gender-responsive policy making (see Baksh, 2011: 13-14).

CIWiL's three 15-day leadership training institutes held to date have trained 79 women from Belize, Jamaica, St. Kitts and Nevis, and St. Lucia. Specific aims of the training institutes include: building understanding of Caribbean political economy, democracy and development issues; building skills in influencing political decision-making through a focus on political party and electoral processes, parliamentary dynamics, and constituency/ stakeholder outreach; strengthening women's political leadership skills and capacities to better perform their legislative, oversight and representative functions; assisting women political actors to develop advocacy and networking skills in support of gender-sensitive policies/ legislation and other issues of national interest; gender-responsive and ethical decision-making; equitable and effective leadership approaches and dynamics; partnership building with civil society for governance accountability; and effective political and social communications. As a result, there has been an increase in the numbers of

women contesting general elections in the participating countries. A notable outcome was the election of three women to the Parliament of St. Lucia in the November 2011 general election.

Strategically, CIWiL has also initiated training institutes for young women's transformational leadership, which seek to strengthen the capacities of young women leaders aged 21–30 who are involved in working on gender equality issues. The programme aims to: build a cadre of young women leaders interested in transforming the culture of exclusion that has systemically limited women's equal participation in the decision-making processes that affect their lives; contribute to the revitalization of the Caribbean women's movement through the engagement of young women in gender justice initiatives in various sectors; engage in advocacy activities for policy change, and legislative reform for the achievement of women's rights and gender equality; strengthen the capacity of young women activists to assume leadership roles and participate in decision making; support young women in their personal and professional development through inter-generational mentorship; and utilize new information communications technologies (ICTs) to strengthen networking, advocacy and support mechanisms for young women across the region.<sup>112</sup>

CIWIL thus represents one stream in the trajectory of feminist organizing in the Caribbean, in seeking to promote women's transformational leadership through elaborating a women's political agenda, training and capacity building, advocacy and awareness-raising, and networking and partnership building. An evaluation of the impact of CIWiL's work to date is currently being undertaken.

#### b. Jamaica Civil Society Coalition (JCSC)<sup>113</sup>

The Jamaica Civil Society Coalition (JCSC) represents a broad-based coalition of civil society organizations initiated and chaired by Carol Narcisse, an individual feminist, and supported by the Friedrich Ebert Stiftung (FES) under the leadership of Judith Wedderburn. It seeks to transform governance towards accountability, transparency, and reducing the power of money and violence in politics, among others.

During April and May 2010, Jamaica faced a national crisis with severe international implications, referred to as the "Tivoli Incursion" (see Section 5.2). The period was characterized by violent instability and brought into sharp focus the extent of the threat to Jamaica's democratic political system and the rule of law. It served to heighten civil society's attention to the inter-connections between violence, drugs and governance, and the very stability of the state.

#### Carol Narcisse reflects that:

<sup>112.</sup> Sheila Roseau, Personal communication, May 2012.

<sup>113.</sup> This section on the Jamaica Civil Society Coalition (JCSC) is based on the reflections of Carol Narcisse, Personal communications, May 2012.

In May 2010, the then JLP Government refused to sign the US extradition order for drug dealer, Christopher "Dudus" Coke, and thereby place the matter before the Jamaican Court to determine the merits of the request. In the midst of the national crisis precipitated by the Government's decision, press releases were circulating thick and fast from a wide cross section of organizations. These included a range of NGOs and CBOs, private sector and Church umbrella organizations, etc. From my vantage point of being on a news and current affairs radio programme at the time, I could keep track of the various statements in the media, and see the emerging commonalities and differences in the positions being taken. I came to the conclusion that a strategically important next step was to bring together the various groups, in order to make a deeper impact on governance in that moment of national crisis and take forward a transformational agenda.<sup>114</sup>

On 2 June, 2010 the leadership of several civil society organizations came together to dialogue, identify points of agreement, and consider creating an alliance to advocate for good governance. They agreed to establish the Jamaica Civil Society Coalition (JCSC), conceptualized as a people-centred, non-partisan, non-discriminatory coalition of civil society groups and individuals based on core principles of gender equality, democracy, transparency, respect for diversity, and protection of the natural environment. The JCSC's aim is to be an effective, broad-based forum for civil society participation and engagement in shaping national policy, and positively influencing the rule of law and governance in Jamaica. The membership composition of the JCSC is as follows: fourteen (14) NGOs active in human rights, election oversight, peace and justice, violence reduction, environment and sustainable development, and women's economic development; five (5) private sector umbrella organizations; two (2) community-based umbrella organizations; two (2) Church umbrella organizations; and seven (7) individuals.

Since June 2010, the JCSC has maintained a robust, on-going dialogue and collaboration, resulting in joint action to improve governance and decision-making. It has gained recognition as a civil society consultative forum, and national and international agencies have utilized the JCSC mechanism to hold consultations with civil society. These agencies have included the International Monetary Fund (IMF), Planning Institute of Jamaica (PIOJ), and the Electoral Commission of Jamaica (ECJ).

The JCSC's advocacy on key governance issues has had significant impact to date, for example:

- Its concerted advocacy strategies influenced the decision to publicly televise the Commission
  of Enquiry into Coke's extradition a first in the history of Jamaican Commissions of Enquiry;
- Recommendations made in submissions on key national policies were incorporated, including to the Planning Institute of Jamaica (PIOJ) on the proposed Community Renewal Programme and Growth Inducement Strategy, and to the Electoral Commission of Jamaica (ECJ) on political campaign financing, political party registration and financial disclosure:

<sup>114.</sup> Carol Narcisse, Personal communication, May 2012.

- Successful lobbying for a broader civil society representation on the national social partnership mechanism, the Partnership for Transformation (PFT);
- Successful staging of public fora with live radio broadcasts on key national issues.
   These forums resulted in a civil society submission to a Joint Select Committee of Parliament which is considering: (a) constitutional changes related to dual citizenship of parliamentarians; and (b) new civil society actors engaging in social interventions in West Kingston in the post-Tivoli Incursion period;
- Sustained advocacy resulted in both political parties signing and agreeing to voluntarily comply with some of the provisions of the ECJ's recommendations prior to the 29 December, 2011 general election; and
- Collaboration with the Private Sector Working Group on Tax Reform resulted in a JCSC submission on Tax Reform to the Joint Parliamentary Committee in March 2012, which included a special focus on the protection of the vulnerable.

Carol Narcisse's experience of feminist leadership has influenced the guiding principles of the Coalition and WROC, a member organization has championed the advocacy for women's representation on key decision-making Boards and Commissions. The process of discussion, debate and advocacy has fostered a deeper understanding of the interconnectedness of all forms of oppression, among the different member groups. Discussions on issues related to class and gender inequalities, while challenging, are beginning to take place across the divides within the Coalition. However, given the growing class and gender inequalities in the society and their potential to undermine sustainable human development, the Coalition needs to push harder to mainstream a class and gender analysis and approach in its advocacy and coalition building on the full spectrum of issues being addressed, including political reform and governance, peace and human security, and sustainable development.

#### 5.5 Experiences and expectations of women's political leadership

The expectation that women politicians would be more responsive and accountable to advancing the women's rights and gender equality agenda is often expressed in the same breath as the question of what impacts women elected to office have made in advancing gender equality in the Caribbean. The plain answer is that as the report has shown, women's representation in parliament has been 'spotty' and has not resulted in women's full and equal political, economic, social, cultural and personal citizenship. Even where there has been a 'critical mass' of 30% as in Guyana since 2000, the impact has been negligible because women secure their seats in parliament as part of a 'tribal' political system, and they thus tend to be bound within political party power structures, conventions and positions.

Further, as one female parliamentarian in Trinidad and Tobago commented during a WINAD/IGDS dialogue held between women politicians and civil society activists in March 2012, it is unrealistic to expect that women on the campaign trail will speak specifically or only to women's rights and gender equality issues, but to the broader interests of men and women. While women's organizations are not calling for an exclusively focused advocacy, there is an expectation that women's interests and gender perspectives should inform the spectrum of issues raised on the campaign trail, and in parliament and local government. Women local councillors, who have achieved a critical mass of 32% in Trinidad and Tobago, asserted that their relative silence on issues affecting women has been connected to a general lack of support from women's organizations.<sup>115</sup>

The women politician's statements seem to reflect a generally low level of gender awareness, and thus their inability to articulate gender and human rights perspectives on mainstream development issues. Andaiye has observed that at both the national and local levels women face similar constraints, and that the "narrowing margins of political and economic decision-making in the region" is a critical constraint not only for the state, but also for women. She concluded that without a radical transformation of power relations between women and men, not much can be achieved at either level (2009: 27).

Women parliamentarians also face considerable pressure to meet unrealistic expectations in both the private and public spheres. According to the CPA report cited earlier:

The female parliamentarian faces the burden of expectations from her own family and is assumed to be a super-human being: she must carry out her parliamentary responsibilities with breadth, depth and vigour; she is expected to be a better representative than her male counterpart; she must take care of her family, seeing to the care, protection and education of her children; she must ensure that the home is appropriate for her status in the society and certainly for that of her spouse; she must see to the well-being of her spouse and she must, in the eyes of many, be at all times perfectly groomed. These are very high, if not impossible standards to be maintained at all times, and they are often standards not expected of their male colleagues. 116

Negative portrayals in the mass media add to the challenges experienced by women in leadership. While the media can and has been used to promote positive images of women, it has also been responsible for perpetuating gender biases. An analysis of images of women in Caribbean newspapers found that women were often portrayed as mothers and housewives, and that a Eurocentric standard of beauty tended to be depicted. It was also found that women's pages or lifestyle sections of newspapers devoted less space to social and political issues, and more to recipes and articles on fashion (Cuthbert, 1981).

Women Prime Ministers Portia Simpson-Miller and Kamla Persad Bissessar have achieved the highest elected office in Jamaica and Trinidad and Tobago respectively, but in so doing have

<sup>116.</sup> Commonwealth Parliamentary Association (2001), Op. Cit., p. 14.

faced extraordinary levels of public attack. Shirley Campbell's and Taitu Heron's examinations of Portia Simpson-Miller's 2007 election campaign, have shown that she was subjected to mockery and abuse based on her working class background. Political cartoons in particular, "demonstrated blatant class prejudice, sexism and a lack of respect for the Office of Prime Minister – because she is a woman." <sup>117</sup> In 2011, despite continued vilification by the JLP Government which repeated the attacks that had been made against her by her own party in the 2007 election, she led the People's National Party to a dramatic victory after only four years in opposition and gained her own mandate in the December 2011 general election.

In the case of Persad-Bissessar, Merle Hodge's recent letter to the editor of a daily newspaper in the face of the onslaught of public attacks on the Prime Minister, draws attention to the situation:

It has been a long and difficult struggle to get women to enter politics at the higher levels. What women are afraid of is precisely what has been happening to our Prime Minister from the moment she announced her candidacy for Political Leader of the UNC, to the present day. If you are a female politician, it is likely that men and women will wade into your personal life to publicly attack you. They don't do it to male politicians (Hodge, 2012).

Clearly, women's achievement of the position of Prime Minister in Trinidad and Tobago and Jamaica represents an important development in Caribbean democracies. In the case of Simpson-Miller, there is a history of intense and bruising competition with two male leaders when she ran to succeed the former Prime Minister as party leader in 2007. With regard to Persad-Bissessar, she faced down and out-manoeuvred ex-Prime Minister Basdeo Panday to win the leadership of United National Congress (UNC) political party and form a 5-party coalition which challenged the People's National Movement (PNM) and won the 2010 election by a landslide. She is currently holding together a coalition government representing different ethnic, ideological and geographic groupings, which detractors and supporters alike have used essentialist arguments to explain – her 'feminine' and 'soft' nurturing and team building skills, and ability to communicate with people from all walks of life. However, in both Jamaica and Trinidad and Tobago, the possibilities for political party reform and the pace of reform are circumscribed by the balance of forces for and against the change process within and outside the parties.

There is great expectation that these women Prime Ministers would be more responsive and accountable to advancing the women's rights and gender equality agenda in their respective countries, with the potential for influencing the wider Caribbean. To date, five months under Simpson-Miller's leadership, there has been a marginal increase of women in Cabinet and the Bureau of Women's/Gender Affairs has been placed in the Office of the Prime Minister. This opens the door for women's and civil society organizations to put forward specific proposals

<sup>117.</sup> Shirley Campbell (2008), "The Making and Unmaking of a Female Prime Minister", In Leith Dunn and Judith Wedderburn (eds.), Gender and Governance, Centre for Gender and Development Studies, University of the West Indies, Mona Campus, Kingston, pp. 28-58; and Taitu Heron (2008), "Political Advertising and the Portrayal of Gender, Colour and Class in Jamaica's General Elections 2007", Ibid, pp. 59-104.

related to the implementation of the national gender policy, including a call for quotas in decision-making at all levels.

Joan French points out that under Simpson-Miller, "there has always been a greater focus on programmes for the poor, particularly employment, jobs, health and education; practical action to improve social security for children and the elderly; no hesitation about laws to protect women – although it remains to be seen if her surprise commitment on sexual rights will go as far as taking the lead for removal of the buggery laws. She is now learning from past mistakes and taking a team approach to governing." In addition, "there is evidence of ongoing reporting to the public, no doubt influenced by the work of the Jamaica Civil Society Coalition which has created public demand for transparency. This all adds up to a progressive agenda developed through an extensive, mainly internal party consultative process on the basis of which the PNP won the elections." Simpson-Miller thus seems to be acting, as research on women's political leadership in developing countries tends to suggest, "consultatively, with a focus on the practical, and a concern for the poor and social issues. However, whether job creation and economic management will succeed remains to be seen, in the context of the country's economic crisis." 118

In her two years as Prime Minister to date, Persad-Bissessar has articulated her commitment to women's rights and gender equality on national, CARICOM, Organization of American States, Commonwealth, United Nations, and other global platforms. She created a Ministry of Gender, Youth and Child Development, and approved the establishment of a National Commission on Women's Empowerment Gender Equity. She appointed women to strategic ministries, set a target of 40% of women on state boards, and made a commitment to introducing a genderresponsive budget and national development plan. In addition, her government has been implementing social protection programmes to eradicate poverty. Under the leadership of Minister Verna St. Rose-Greaves, the Ministry of Gender, Youth and Child Development successfully moved a long-awaited Children's Bill through Parliament, with the support of the opposition. The Ministry also set up a Cabinet Appointed Committee to review and finalize the national gender policy which has been languishing under previous governments since 2002. The coming weeks and months will be critical with regard to the government's adoption of the policy in the context of public debate on the issues of sexual orientation and termination of pregnancy. The broad movement for gender equality is hopeful that the Prime Minister will adopt a national gender policy that promotes a new sexual and reproductive rights and health agenda for the country and the Caribbean.

In conclusion, the question that again needs to be asked is, "What is the way forward in pressing for accountability from women duty bearers at all levels for the realization of women's citizenship rights?" Together, the factors discussed in this chapter point to the need for women's organizations as political actors to re-evaluate their strategies of engagement in politics and governance, in order

<sup>118.</sup> Joan French, Personal communication, May 2012.

to secure women's full rights as citizens. It is not enough for women's organizations and civil society coalitions to stand at the sidelines and criticize women in government and political parties.

What seems to be needed is a combination of evidence-based critique, lobbying and encouragement to push for the reforms needed, and to monitor the implementation and impacts. Women's organizations and movements need to be principled and fearless, as well as sensitive in offering critical support to women leaders as they hold them to account. Importantly, women's organizations need to institutionalize gender sensitization programmes for women leaders at all levels, and facilitate networking among women leaders in various spheres including political parties, parliament, national and local government, the public service, trade unions and the private sector, and women's organizations.



# Conclusions and recommendations



## 6. Conclusions and recommendations

#### 6.1 Conclusions

Historically, Caribbean women have figured significantly in the political and social movements that have shaped the region's rich history. Women participated in resistance struggles during the periods of African slavery and Indian indentureship. In the early late 19th and early 20th centuries, they advocated for the right to vote and social reforms, engaged in the labour movements for improved wages and working conditions for workers, among others. However, while women were granted the vote equally with men under universal adult suffrage, this did not change the malefemale power relations inherited from the colonial period with regard to other civil liberties such as equal representation in decision-making or access to the labour market. Women's early activism and organizing continued into the anti-colonial and independence movements of the 1940s and '50s, and the processes of negotiating constitutional decolonization and national independence by the male political leadership.

The independence project itself, founded largely on British democratic values and institutions, did not significantly alter the relations of economic and social power held by the elite. In addition, women's engagement within 'women's arms' of political parties and their varied contributions through voluntary organizations, while playing a critical role in the process of mass political mobilization and undergirding the anti-colonial project into nationhood, did not yield much power for women to envision, shape and implement a new post-independence agenda. Thus women's positioning at the periphery of politics, as well as the patriarchal control exercised within political parties and the family, has constrained women's citizenship rights and political representation in the Caribbean during the post-independence period.

Yet, the women's organizations that emerged in the 1970s and '80s as part of the new social movements internationally, while small and not constituting a mass movement in the Caribbean, played a catalytic and dynamic role in bringing to public attention a wide range of issues facing women, and struggled for and secured important reforms particularly in the areas of social and economic rights. National women's/ gender machineries, promoted and supported by the UN and Commonwealth Secretariat in the same period, constituted the states' response to

women's activism and advocacy. Occupying the bottom rungs of the ministerial hierarchy, with accountability to political directorates that have been patriarchal in tendency and internally divided on women's rights and gender equality issues, with miniscule financial and human resources, and the responsibility for policy-making, legislative reform as well as delivery of a wide range of services, they have faced resistance in effectively mobilizing and influencing the mainstream public sector.

In addition, the larger national and regional political and economic agendas that formed an integral part of the goals of earlier movements, became subsumed under 'women's issues' and since the UN world conferences of the 1990s including the Fourth World Conference on Women held in Beijing in 1995, 'gender issues'. This global agenda of the 1970s-2000s, led by UN approaches [of women in development (WID), women and development (WAD), gender and development (GAD), and gender mainstreaming], and supported by the international aid machinery of the multilateral, bilateral and other donor agencies, has been located within the processes of strengthening of neo-liberal policies and ideology. Nonetheless, this period opened some space for the movement to make an impact, particularly through legal reforms in key social and economic areas directly related to women's lived experiences. Linked to and in parallel with this process, the Caribbean feminist movement has faced other challenges including dependence on international donor funding, lack of strong organizational structures and systems, leadership crises as many founding members have moved into academia and international organizations, and inadequate alliances with a new generation of activists and leaders.

It needs to be recognized that the neo-liberal emphasis on the individual did enable the movement to make visible women's 'personal' and 'private' issues such as violence against women, sexual and reproductive rights and health, and the care economy in the post-1975 period, which had been excluded in previous periods and movements. However the spread of neo-liberal ideology has constrained the feminist movement in addressing the shape and agenda of the post-independence state at the level of the political system and institutions, macro-economic and trade policy, and the wider governance agenda, although the legal and institutional reforms do imply new ways of being for the state, the economy and social relations. Despite the fact that these are not yet constructed into a holistic, integrated and inclusive alternative political agenda, they offer the possibility of transforming the existing definition of 'politics' from the male-dominated, gender-blind version defined by the 'public' and 'macro', to an engagement that includes the 'personal' and 'private'.<sup>119</sup>

Importantly, at this historical moment as the region begins national celebrations of 50 years of independence, these 'personal' and private' issues in Caribbean gender systems are among the key political and social issues that are destabilizing individual societies. The region is facing crises of gender-based violence, manhood and masculinity, reproductive care, sexuality, and leadership and governance.

**Crisis of gender-based violence:** The statistics of women's and girls' experience of domestic violence, incest, rape and other forms of sexual violence and abuse are staggering. In Trinidad and

<sup>119.</sup> Joan French, Personal communication, May 2012.

Tobago, homicides due to domestic violence are second only to gang murders. The high incidence of rape is horrifying, including gang rape. Growing numbers of men and boys are experiencing domestic and other forms of gender-based violence, as evident in newspaper stories of boys who are being sexually abused in their families and communities and bullied as a result (of perceptions) of their sexual orientation, and increasing reports by men to domestic violence hotlines of being beaten by spouses and partners. Men are often ashamed to talk about domestic and sexual violence or report it to the police, which serves to remind us of earlier periods when it was a shame for women to discuss their experiences of domestic violence or rape.

Crisis of manhood and masculinity: In the Caribbean, as globally, 'male gender gaps' have begun to emerge. Since the 1990s, there has been evidence of boys dropping out of the education system at higher rates than girls at the primary and secondary levels, and presently young women represent some 65-75% of university entrants and graduates in the region. A significant number of young men and boys, too many for such small island populations, are involved in illegal firearms, gang violence, drug use and trafficking, rape, kidnapping, murder and other forms of criminal activity. Many young men die on the roads due to speeding or driving under the influence of alcohol and/or drugs. Large numbers of adult men are facing alcoholism, lifestyle related diseases, unemployment, homelessness and depression. And men experience a high rate of suicide. These social problems are all related to gender norms related to 'manhood' and 'masculinity which have not changed significantly in Caribbean societies, while women have been challenging the expectations, attitudes, behaviours, roles and responsibilities related to 'womanhood' and 'femininity'.

**Crisis of reproductive care:** Despite the fact that Caribbean women are increasingly well educated and employed in the labour force, they are still expected to be the primary care-givers of the society. They are responsible for doing the majority of the housework; bearing and raising children; taking care of the sick, the aging, the elderly and the disabled; and managing community-based organizations. Women need daycare centres, and private spaces at the workplace to breastfeed their babies, if they are expected to be effective members of the work force. In addition, men and boys need to share in the housework and the care of children, the extended family and the community.

Crisis of sexuality: Caribbean popular culture paints a picture of highly sexual societies, as evidenced in the music, dance, carnival and chutney festivals, etc. Despite this, individual countries and the region as a whole have not effectively addressed sexuality issues in national policies and programmes – even when faced with high levels of teenage pregnancy, sexually transmitted diseases including HIV/ AIDS (the Caribbean region is second only to Sub-Saharan Africa with regard to infection rates globally), high numbers of poor women and girls having had backstreet abortions who end up in public hospitals, and so on. In addition, across the Anglophone Caribbean states, except for the Bahamas, homosexuality is still criminalized. Governments have continued to be influenced by faith-based organizations, and the 'public/private' dichotomy is most evident in the state's lack of responsiveness to sexuality as a 'normal' aspect of contemporary life.

**Crisis of leadership and governance:** The low level of women's political representation is evident across the region. In addition, the Caribbean is seeing some of the most dysfunctional forms of male-dominant leadership in government, opposition, private sector and labour movement, which is intrinsically related to the crises in the gender system discussed above.

Girvan's statements that, "the 'Independence' ... bequeathed and the democracy ... acquired in 1962 were nothing but a monumental face card," and "very little of substance [has] actually changed,"<sup>120</sup> have particular resonance for women. For despite the high points of organization building and advocacy in the 1970s and '80s, the majority of women have not secured a significant shift in their relation to power at the levels of the self and personhood, the family, the community, the workplace, the market or the state. Thus their citizenship rights in all its dimensions have been severely short-changed. This is taking place as the current global economic crisis creates further shocks and setbacks to Caribbean economies, and inequalities increase which affect the life chances of women and children, and poor and working class men.

#### 6.2 General and specific recommendations

The search for solutions to address the persistence of discrimination against women and gender inequalities is a global one. While there are no prescriptive strategies that may be universally applied, there is much that can be learnt from the processes occurring among women's movements in the global South. Like women in the Caribbean, they are concerned about and committed to women's struggle for full emancipation and wholeness. The report's overarching recommendation is that support, advocacy and action need to be guided by the lessons drawn from Caribbean women's activism and organizing for citizenship and inclusive democracy, as explored in the chapters and conclusions above.

#### a. General Recommendations

 Promote women's rights as human rights as a means of confronting gender-based discrimination on moral, religious or cultural grounds

Anglophone Caribbean states and society are dominated by vestiges of colonial history, and a post-independence democratic governance system and neo-liberal economic agenda. The research undertaken for the report demonstrates that lived citizenship as experienced by the majority of Caribbean peoples, is distant from the rights that are assumed to be accessible to 'universal citizens'. The comments of women activists in the focus group discussions deepen our understanding of the reality of gender, race/ethnic, class, age, (dis) ability, sexual orientation, and other bases of discrimination, inequality and exclusion in

the Caribbean. The failure of the Jamaican Constitution to provide the constitutional and legal foundation for women's claim to full citizenship rights is an important reminder of the dominance of the patriarchal system. The recent correction in the Jamaican Charter of Fundamental Rights and Freedoms that now enshrines the rights of women, presents an opportunity for women individually and collectively to confront discrimination and inequalities based on moral, religious or cultural grounds, and to advocate proactively for their rights to equal political, economic and social citizenship at all levels.<sup>121</sup>

#### — Observe the actions and impulses of women in the national and global contexts

It is important to explore and understanding the processes occurring among women's movements in the Caribbean and globally. This is why the experiences, analyses, perspectives and insights of the focus group participants and the reviewers who contributed to this study, have been so highly valued. Similarly, lessons may be drawn from a dialogue that is currently taking place between two generations of feminists in Jamaica, women in their '30s and early '40s s who are leading the discussion, and those who have been activists for over 30 years contributing to the conversation. One of the issues being discussed is the "horrific" revelation by a doctor of an overwhelming number of children in Jamaica being subjected to sexual abuse and suffering to the point of death and from infections. This exposé was followed by another revelation by the Office of the Children's Registry that at least 7,245 had suffered sexual abuse within the past four years, evidence of what has been cited by a leading regional journalist as a "frightening epidemic" of sexual molestation and violence in three CARICOM countries. Like so many persons, these feminists were expressing pain and outrage, recounting other incidents, calling for action to end the silence, and asking how to take action practically.

#### Re-engage in dialogue and awareness-raising centred on the personal

The 'personal is still political', and each actor needs to see her own interest defined in the struggle. It is this definition of personal interest that will lead to a re-visioning of the movement and its goals and strategies.

Women face tremendous risk and fear in breaking the silence around male violence and misuse of power in the home, workplace and public places. The following is the testimony of a 40-year-old incest survivor in one of the focus group discussions:

As a survivor of sexual (incestuous) abuse ... who has told this story, I can testify to the salvific grace of activism over the past decades, the opportunity provided by the women's movement, now rebranded? The gender justice movement has been empowering even as ruff and tuff an' often disheartening, as we chip away at some vital root causes.....

<sup>121.</sup> Thanks to Judith Wedderburn for this conclusion and recommendation (Personal communication, May 2012).

<sup>122. &</sup>quot;Horrific!" Sunday Observer, 1 April, 2012, pp. 1, 4, 5.

<sup>123.</sup> Ricky Singh (2012), "Action, not talk on wave of sexual crime and violence in CARICOM", Sunday Observer, The Agenda, 15 April, 2012, p. 5.

Some Caribbean men are also beginning to engage in this journey, and collaboration between women's and men's organizations in the region is an important step in dismantling all forms of discrimination and gender inequalities in the private and public spheres.

#### Validate and draw on our history of organizing and struggle, and recognize both our achievements and the gaps

We have not achieved the political, economic, social and cultural transformation that earlier movements envisioned. This calls, inter-alia, for taking into account the history of our struggles and movements through the various periods and the current context, nationally and regionally, recognizing both our achievements and the gaps, as well as linkages to the global struggle for women's rights and citizenship and people-centred, inclusive and participatory democracy. It requires teaching/learning about the herstory of the women's movement, so that new generations can define their own space in moving forward. This process is vital to rebuilding an agenda that seeks to transform the distorted understandings and experiences of women's and men's citizenship that has been our collective experience in the Caribbean.

In particular, the independence project has not created an equal citizenship for women, but we also need to recognize that neither has it done so for men. Young, African-Caribbean working class men are the most visibly vulnerable in the current period, but the hegemonic constructions of manhood and masculinity evident among men of all race/ethnic, class, age, (dis)ability, sexual orientation and other groups, have shaped our institutional and social systems and relationships.

#### Build inter-generational conversations and alliances

The focus group discussions showed the importance of sharing and dialoguing across differences of class, race/ethnicity, age, (dis)ability and sexual orientation. This broad alliance building is vital at both the national and regional levels in order to develop an inclusive agenda across our differences to strengthen our democracy.

There is need for dialogue and alliance building between feminist activists across generations, in support of a new generation of women exploring new strategies and seeking to learn the history and lessons of the past. Young feminists, beneficiaries of the space created by the second wave of feminist organizing in the 1970s and '80s on issues considered taboo or too sensitive by earlier generations of feminist activists, are now engaged in a range of struggles including reproductive health and rights, sexual orientation, the lived meanings of citizenship, as well as economic justice and access to decision-making at all levels. They have the clarity that women who are entering parliament, local government, boards and commissions, and other decision-making arenas need to be supported to promote a women's rights and citizenship agenda to

address the historical democratic deficit. Thus a new opportunity exists to build a holistic lobby with a new definition of democracy in which all rights are not only recognized in law, but effectively enjoyed.

The 51% Coalition in Jamaica uses a two-pronged approach of promoting women's leadership and decision-making, with sensitization to the barriers to be overcome to effect their full citizenship. This approach holds promise, if it does not fall prey to old divisions between the 'acceptable' issues such as political participation and economic empowerment, and the personal issues related to patriarchy in the home and family, as well as sexuality, sexual orientation and reproductive rights. The engagement with young women activists who have demonstrated that these issues are taken for granted in their agenda is critical to the new departure that is needed to ensure that the rights of all women are defended

#### Build and strengthen organizational advocacy

The Caribbean has built a number of regional institutions and networks, e.g., the Institute for Gender for Gender and Development Studies (IGDS), Caribbean Institute for Women in Leadership (CIWIL), Caribbean Association for Feminist Research and Action (CAFRA), CARICOM Women's/ Gender Desk, Caribbean Policy Development Centre (CPDC), among others. Each has varying capacities which could be assessed and utilized towards the reframing and re-building process that is imperative. Many of these organizations were involved in defining "the Port of Spain Consensus" in June 2011, which includes important recommendations for redefining the political agenda of the movement.

#### Engage voice and vote

The national women's/ gender machineries across the region, a number of which have developed national gender policies and action plans based on both gender justice and gender mainstreaming approaches, are opening the door to alliances between the state/ public sector, women's/ men's/ civil society organizations, the trade union movement, and the private sector. Women as a voting constituency must advocate for the implementation of these policies and action plans to ensure state accountability and public service delivery.

Building mechanisms in which women are part of the accountability system may require parliaments to constitute independent national women's/ gender commissions which have the authority to monitor state legislation, policies and implementation, and engage in public awareness raising to ensure that institutions and power holders respond to the mandate of ensuring women's rights and gender equality.

#### Support women in political leadership and decision-making

There is need to support women in politics. The two current women Prime Ministers in the Caribbean have been and are being attacked on the basis of their gender. Feminists have demonstrated the capacity to challenge this gender-based discrimination, while retaining the independence to assess their economic and social policies and programmes.

At a recent WINAD/IGDS event held in Trinidad and Tobago in celebration of International Women's Day 2012, women's rights activists and academics held a dialogue with women in parliament and local government. The women in politics spoke of the important contribution that women's organizations could make to their work in advancing women's rights and gender equality.

#### Engage with men in the debate and struggle for transformation

Collaboration with like-minded men to change the construction of manhood and masculinity in the Caribbean is critical. The dropping out of boys/ men from the education system, the increasing gender-based violence, the wider gang violence and criminality that threatens the security and the stability of society and state, the homophobia that is rampant in the society leading to violence particularly against men and boys based on their sexual orientation, cannot be solved without a broad, sensitive and compassionate engagement.

#### Mobilize resources, broadly defined

Women's full emancipation is a matter of rights and justice, and an imperative for development. It is widely recognized that resources for women's organizing and action have seriously declined since 2000, in contradiction to the lofty goals of the Beijing Platform for Action agreed in 1995. The AWID reports have shown that almost two-thirds of the 1,000 women's rights organizations surveyed globally had annual budgets of USD \$50,000 or less in 2006/2007, and half the organizations had been receiving reduced donor funding since 2000.<sup>124</sup> The situation is even worse in the Caribbean due to countries having achieved 'middle income' status in the World Bank rankings, except for Haiti and Guyana.<sup>125</sup>

Caribbean resource mobilization needs some rethinking to reduce dependency on traditional international funders, especially as these resources have been shrinking and access is increasingly more competitive. New possibilities include building South-South partnerships for programming and resource mobilization, particularly in the current

<sup>124.</sup> See Cindy Clark and Ellen Sprenger (2006), "Where is the Money for Women's Rights?"; and Joanna Kerr (2007), "The Second FundHer Report: Financial Sustainability for Women's Movements Worldwide", Accessible at: http://www.awid.org/AWID-s-Publications/Funding-for-Women-s-Rights

<sup>125.</sup> A 2010 news headline reads, "Guyana is no longer the second poorest nation in the western hemisphere", flagging the fact that Guyana has now moved up to a low middle income country in the world rankings. Accessible at: http://www.kaieteurnewsonline.com/2010/05/04/guyana-is-no-longer-the-second-poorest-nation-in-the-western-hemisphere/

context of the BRICS and other growing economies. More space needs to be created for the voice of the Caribbean feminist movement to be heard globally through an alliance of women's organizations and individual feminists, which could seek to challenge current donor agencies to commit resources to the Caribbean as one of their priorities. The movement also needs to do some strategizing with regard to mobilizing support from governments. A state-civil society approach at the national level (facilitated by UN Women - Caribbean, CARICOM, OAS and ECLAC) could strengthen the relationships between national women's/ gender machineries and women's organizations and networks, in order to support gender justice and gender mainstreaming initiatives in all sectors across the public service.

#### **b.** Specific Recommendations

#### Women's/ civil society organizations and networks:

- Define the political agenda for securing women's rights and gender equality and strengthening democracy, recognizing our differences. It is imperative that alliances/ partnerships are built among women's organizations and networks to mobilize against existing inequalities, drawing strength from our differences.
  - This calls for commitment to a "strategy of uniting ourselves," 126 which requires the hard work of discussing and negotiating differences of race/ethnicity/colour, class, age, sexual orientation, abilities/disabilities, which need to be seen as resources to help us to urgently "re-invent and re-create shared horizons of liberation." 127
- ii. Secure/advance women's (political, economic, social, cultural, personal and sexual) citizenship and strengthen democracy

This could be viewed as a core mandate for the national independence project for the Caribbean over the next fifty (50) years, and includes various components:

- Develop strategies to advance women's economic citizenship with a focus on training, employment, and entrepreneurship in mainstream sectors such as agriculture, construction and ICTs;
- Promote literacy on the various dimensions of citizenship rights and responsibilities;
- Explore applications of the theme to issues currently being addressed by women's organizations/networks, speaking to 'each other's issues' in a joined-up, holistic way;

<sup>126.</sup> See Sarah Bracke (2004), "Different worlds possible: feminist yearnings for shared futures", In Joanna Kerr, Ellen Sprenger & Alison Symington (eds.), The Future of Women's Rights, p.97.

<sup>127.</sup> Ibid, p. 99.

- Link/ apply the theme to core issues facing the nation and region, e.g., reversing the low/ no growth phenomenon in Caribbean economies; addressing corruption; addressing environmental vulnerabilities/ mitigating the impacts of climate change/ exploring climate change adaptation; searching for alternatives to neoliberal economic frameworks; reforming international trade; building regional cooperation.
- iii. Engage and partner with young women leaders and their organizations.
- iv. Build partnerships with men and men's organizations to advance women's and men's equal/equitable citizenship rights.
- v. Lobby for national gender policies and their effective implementation.
- vi. Produce and disseminate popular educational materials on gender and citizenship.

#### Political Parties:

- vii. Undertake research on women's political citizenship within the parties.
- viii. Viii. Develop, adopt and implement gender equality policies in the parties, including putting in place specific measures and targets to strengthen women's citizenship rights and responsibilities within the parties, and monitor their implementation and achievement.

#### Women in political parties:

- ix. Strengthen the women's arm of the party by raising awareness on and supporting the advancement of women's citizenship rights and responsibilities within the party.
- x. Establish and sustain linkages and partnerships with women outside the political party to undertake sensitization, education and training to enhance capacity for dialogue and advocacy within the party.
- xi. Identify and work with supportive men in the party to enhance gender equality and democracy within the party.

#### Legislative and executive bodies:

- xii. Develop, adopt and implement national gender policies in order to redress existing deficiencies in women's citizenship rights and responsibilities and to strengthen democracy and the state.
- xiii. Drawing on 'international best practice', e.g., from Commonwealth member countries,

- strengthen national women/s gender machineries through evaluating and enhancing their structure(s), staffing, financial resources, capacity for gender mainstreaming, etc.
- xiv. Institute special measures such as quotas, to increase women's participation in decision-making in parliament, local government, boards and commissions, etc.
- xv. Ratify the ILO Convention on Domestic Workers (2011), and provide resources to secure the enforcement of its provisions to guarantee the decent work agenda.
- xvi. Pursue at the CARICOM level, measures to strengthen the regional women's/ gender machinery to advocate for and support women's citizenship rights and responsibilities.
- xvii. Commit to re-energizing CARICOM's agenda on women's rights and gender equality, giving special emphasis to measures that advance the economic rights and social protection of women and their families through trade and the free movement of skills under the CSME.

#### Regional civil society organizations/ networks:

Prime Minister Tillman Thomas of Grenada presented a proposal at the CARICOM Heads of Government meeting in May 2011, which identified priorities for "Re-Energizing CARICOM Integration." The "Tillman priorities" mirrored proposals made in country studies undertaken by CARICOM on "Gender and the CSME" with regard to the need to advance women's citizenship within the regional integration process through the CSME.

#### Against this background, it is recommended that:

- xviii. Discussions be held with regional women's organizations and civil society on the findings and recommendations of the present report on "Women's Citizenship and Democracy in the Anglophone Caribbean," with a view to informing and seeking feedback on women's citizenship and democracy in the Caribbean.
- xix. The findings and recommendations of the various country studies on "Gender and the CSME" be summarized and tabled as part of the framework for discussion on "reenergizing CARICOM."
- xx. Regional women's/ men's/ civil society organizations such as CAFRA, CARIMAN, CPDC, CIWiL, DAWN–Caribbean and WAND, and supported by national-level partner organizations where appropriate, make representation to CARICOM regarding the re-establishment and strengthening of the CARICOM Women's/ Gender Desk to address agreed priorities arising from the "Gender and the CSME" country studies.
- xxi. Specific attention be given to proposals to advance the "Free Movement of Skills" as identified in the Tillman Report as follows:

- Ensure that the agreed ten categories of free movement of Skilled Community Nationals work efficiently, smoothly and seamlessly across all member states;
- Fast-track the implementation of CVQ administrative arrangements, so that a wide group of artisans and domestic workers are drawn into the net of CSME entitlements and benefits:
- Fast-track the Protocol on Contingent Rights of Community Nationals working in member states in exercise of their CSME Rights. If individual member states have capacity constraints with regard to access to their social services, the principle of variable geometry may be invoked;
- Apply the automatic six-month stay consistently and transparently by all member states. Exceptions and derogations should be clearly stated;
- Agree that CARICOM nationals should have the right of appeal in cases of alleged unfair and/or otherwise inappropriate treatment;
- Ensure that immigration and other officials in member states who interact with CARICOM nationals know what the policies and agreements are, and treat CARICOM nationals with due respect and courtesy;
- Expeditiously review the schedule of implementation for full freedom of movement of CARICOM nationals, and communicate the decision and reasons for it to the regional public" (Source: "Re-energizing CARICOM Integration").
- xxii. Regional civil society organizations/ networks lobby for the implementation of the Tillman recommendation that civil society be mobilized to support the regional integration movement. The mechanism for civil society participation in the decisionmaking of CARICOM and for monitoring performance of agreed measures needs to be activated.
- xxiii. Develop in partnership with men's organizations, e.g., CARIMAN, a programme of outreach on agreed issues to raise awareness and build support.
- xxiv. Initiate collaboration with Haiti and Suriname on CARICOM gender and citizenship issues.

#### International Development and Cooperation Partners:

xxv. Support regional discussions of the proposals being made to "mainstream gender and citizenship," and consult with other international development partners including the wider UN system, OAS and Commonwealth Secretariat on how this may be effected.

- xxvi. Initiate short on-line courses for Caribbean women leaders and activists on Caribbean political economy; the structure and functioning of the state in the epoch of neoliberalism; gender and citizenship; and gender-responsive budgeting.
- xxvii. Initiate dialogue with international development partners that programme in the region and civil society organizations/ networks towards: (a) a common position of support for CARICOM's institutional strengthening and capacity building on gender and citizenship; (b) addressing the critical resource constraints facing women's and civil society organizations (and hence their very survival); (c) revisiting the principles and commitments of the 2005 Paris Declaration, and lobbying OECD bilateral donors which programme in the Caribbean to establish that a percentage of grants made to country programmes should be directed to support the work of women's/ men's/ civil society organizations.
- Sustain collaboration with the OAS and other international development partners to increase attention to the Caribbean and strengthen synergies.

#### Bibliography

- Aching, Gerald (2002), *Masking and Power: Carnival and Popular Culture in the Caribbean*, Minneapolis, University of Minnesota Press.
- Andaiye (2011), "Promoting and Protecting the Rights of Migrant Domestic Workers in CARICOM", Presented at the Global Forum on Migration and Development (GFMD), Jamaica Conference Centre, Kingston, Jamaica, 7-8 September, 2011, Accessible at: http://www.google.tt/#hl=en&sugexp=frgbld&gs\_nf=1&cp=52&gs\_id=a0&xhr=t&q=Deportation+of+Gu yanese+women+household+workers+from+Barbados&pf=p&rlz=1C2ECWD\_enGBTT464TT 464&sclient=psyab&oq=Deportation+of+Guyanese+women+household+workers+from+Barbados&aq=f&aqi=&aql=&gs\_l=&pbx=1&bav=on.2,or.r\_gc.r\_pw.r\_qf.,cf.osb&fp=31d0849f338 2550c&biw=1920&bih=930
- Andaiye (2009), "Critical Review of Selected Interventions in Support of Women's Participation in Electoral Processes in the Caribbean in the Period 2007-2008", Institute for Gender and Development Studies, University of the West Indies, Cave Hill Campus, Barbados.
- Anderson, Rick (2004), "Reggae Music: A History and Selective Discography", *Note*, vol. 61, no. 1, pp. 206-214.
- Antrobus, Peggy (1985), "Employment of Women Workers in the Caribbean." In Pat Ellis (ed.) Women of the Caribbean, Zed Books, London.
- Bakare-Yusuf, Bibi (2006), "Fabricating Identities: Survival and the Imagination in Jamaican Dancehall Culture", *Fashion Theory: The Journal of Dress, Body and Culture*, vol. 10, no. 4, pp. 461-483.
- Baksh, Rawwida (2011), "Women Leaders as Agents of Change: Background Paper", Prepared for the Caribbean Regional Colloquium on Women Leaders as Agents of Change, convened by the Government of Trinidad and Tobago in partnership with ClWiL, Commonwealth Secretariat, UN Women and OAS/CIM, held in Port of Spain on 28-30 June 2011, Unpublished, pp. 1-14.

- Baksh-Soodeen, Rawwida (1998), "Issues of Difference in Contemporary Caribbean Feminism", Feminist Review, no. 59, pp. 74-85.
- Baksh-Soodeen, Rawwida (1991), "Power, Gender and Chutney", Trinidad and Tobago Review, no. 13, p. 7.
- Barnes, Natasha (2000), "Body Talk: Notes on Women's Spectacle in Contemporary Trinidad", Small Axe, March 2000, no. 7, pp. 93-105.
- Barriteau, Eudine (2001), The Political Economy of Gender in the Twentieth Century Caribbean, Palgrave, London.
- Barriteau, Eudine (1998), "Liberal Ideology and Contradictions in Caribbean Gender Systems", In Christine Barrow (ed.) Caribbean Portraits: Essays on Gender Ideologies and Identities, lan Randle/ Centre for Gender and Development Studies, Kingston, Jamaica.
- Barrow, Christine (1998), "Caribbean Masculinity and Family: Revisiting 'Marginality' and 'Reputation", In Christine Barrow (ed.) Portraits: Essays on Gender Ideologies and Identities. lan Randle/ Centre for Gender and Development Studies, Kingston, Jamaica, pp. 339-360.
- Barrow, Christine (1994), "Women in Caribbean Agriculture: Persistent Invisibility in Research and Policy", Paper presented at Conference, "Advances in Tropical Agriculture in the 20th Century and Prospects for the 21st Century", Faculty of Agriculture, University of the West Indies, St. Augustine, Trinidad and Tobago, September 4-9, 1994, Revised October 1994.
- Barrow-Giles, Cynthia and Joseph S. D. Tennyson (2006), General Elections and Voting in the English-Speaking Caribbean 1992-2005, Ian Randle Publishers, Kingston, Jamaica.
- Basdeo, Sahadeo (1982), "The 1934 Indian Labour Disturbances in Trinidad: A Case Study in Colonial Labour Relations", In Bridget Brereton and Winston Dookeran (eds.) East Indians in the Caribbean: Colonialism and the Struggle for Identity, Kraus, New York.
- Batra, Kanika (2011), Feminist Visions and Queer Futures in Post-Colonial Drama: Community, Kinship and Citizenship, Routledge, New York.
- Bolland, Nigel (2001), The Politics of Labour in the British Caribbean, Ian Randle Publishers, Kingston, Jamaica.
- Bureau of Women's Affairs, Dominica (2002), "Report on Domestic Violence Research in Dominica", September 2002.
- Bureau of Women's Affairs, Jamaica (2007), "Report to the Tenth Session of the Regional Conference on Women in Latin America and the Caribbean", Quito, Equador, August 6-9, 2007.
- CAFRA (1998), "Gender Violence Causes, Effects and Solutions", International Day Against Violence to Women, November 25, 1998, Accessible at: http://www.cafra.org/spip. php?article100

- Central Statistical Office Trinidad and Tobago (1999), Population and Vital Statistics Report.
- Chandsingh, Rajendra (1980), "The State, the Economy and Type of Rule in Guyana: An Assessment of Guyana's Socialist Revolution", Latin American Perspectives, Autumn 1980, vol. 10, no. 4, pp. 59-74.
- Clarke, Colin and David Howard (2006), "Contradictory socio-economic consequences of structural adjustment in Kingston, Jamaica", The Geographical Journal, June 2006, vol. 172, issue 2, pp. 106-129.
- Clyne, Kalifa (2011), "Child marriages still practised in T&T: St Rose-Greaves promises legislation", Trinidad and Tobago Guardian, November 6, 2011, Accessible at: http://www. quardian.co.tt/node/26825
- Commission on Human Security (2003), Human Security Now: Protecting and Empowering People, Commission on Human Security, New York, Accessible at: www.humansecurity-chs.org
- Commonwealth Parliamentary Association (2001), Gender-Sensitizing Commonwealth Parliaments: A Study Group Report. Accessible at: http://dev.cpahq.org/uploadedFiles/ Information\_Services/PIRC/g\_report.pdf
- Commonwealth Secretariat (2011), "Port of Spain Consensus on Transformational Leadership for Gender Equality", Outcome document of Caribbean Regional Colloquium on "Women Leaders as Agents of Change", Port of Spain, Trinidad and Tobago, June 28-30, 2011. Accessible at: http://www.thecommonwealth.org/files/238222/FileName/Port-of-SpainConsensus
- Commonwealth Secretariat (1997), Conclusions and Recommendations, Fifth Meeting of Commonwealth Ministers Responsible for Women's Affairs, Trinidad and Tobago, November 25-28, 1996, p. 19.
- Cooper, Carolyn (2005), "Sweet and Sour Sauce: Sexual Politics in Jamaican Dancehall Culture", The Sixth Jagan Lecture, Presented at York University, Toronto, October 22, 2005.
- Cooper, Carolyn (2004), Sound Clash: Jamaican Dancehall Culture at Large. Palgrave Macmillan, New York
- D'Aguilar, Lloyd (2012), "The Tivoli Massacre one year later: An analysis", Jamaica Resist, Accessible at: http://lloyddaguilar.blogspot.com/2011/05/tivoli-massacre-one-year-lateranalysis.htm
- Dankelman, Irene and Joan Davidson (1988), Women and Environment in the Third World Alliance for the Future, Earthscan Publications Limited, London.
- Dunn, Leith and Judith Wedderburn (2008) (eds.), Gender and Governance, Centre for Gender and Development Studies, University of the West Indies, Mona Campus, Kingston, Jamaica.

- ECLAC (2009), Caribbean Development Report, Volume II, Accessible at: http://www.eclac.cl/ publicaciones/xml/3/38253/LCARL.245part1.pdf
- ECLAC (2007), "The Contribution of Women to the Economy and Social Protection especially in relation to Unpaid Work Performed by Women in the Caribbean", Caribbean Subregional Preparatory Meeting for the Tenth Session of the Regional Conference on Women in Latin America and the Caribbean, St. John's, Antiqua and Barbuda, May 22-23, 2007.
- ECLAC (2005), Gender Impact Assessment of Hurricane Ivan Grenada: A gender impact assessment of Hurricane Ivan, Accessible at: http://www.eclac.org/cgibin/getProd.asp?xml=/ publicaciones/xml/7/23217/P23217.xml&xsl=/portofspain/tpl-i/p9f.xsl&base=/socinfo/tpl-i/ top-bottom.xslt
- ECLAC (2002), "Attitudes to Domestic Violence in Dominica: Some research findings", Gender Dialogue, Issue 7, September 2002. Accessible at: http://www.eclac.org/portofspain/ Noticias/paginas/0/11850/Sep2002.pdf
- Editor (2009), "Faultlines: News and Notes from the Center of Race and Gender", Center for Race and Gender, University of California, Berkley.
- Ellis, Patricia (2003), Women, Gender and Development in the Caribbean: Reflections and Projections, Ian Randle Publishers, Kingston, Jamaica.
- Esim, Simel (2000), "Gender-Sensitive Budget Initiatives for Latin America and the Caribbean: A Tool for Improving Accountability and Achieving Effective Policy Implementation", Paper Prepared for the Eighth Regional Conference on Women of Latin America and the Caribbean: Beijing +5, Lima, February 8-10, 2000.
- Ferdinand, Carol (2001), "Jobs, Gender and Small Enterprises in the Caribbean: Lessons from Barbados, Suriname and Trinidad and Tobago" (ed.), Seed Working Paper no. 19, In Focus Programme on Boosting Employment through Small Enterprise Development, Job Creation and Enterprise Department, Series on Women's Entrepreneurship Development, International Labour Organization - Caribbean Office.
- Figueroa, Mark (1996), "Garrison communities in Jamaica, 1962-1993: Their growth and impact on political culture", Mimeo.
- Figueroa Mark (2004), "Male privileging and Male 'Academic Underperformance' in Jamaica", In: Rhoda Reddock (ed.) Interrogating Caribbean Masculinities: Theoretical and Empirical Analyses. The University of the West Indies Press, Kingston, pp.137-166.
- Ford-Smith, Honor (1989), Ring Ding in a Tight Corner: A Case Study of Organizational Democracy in Sistren, 1977-1988, Women's Program of the International Council for Adult Education (ICAE), Toronto. Republished (1997), In M. Jacqui Alexander and Chandra Talpade Mohanty, Feminist Genealogies, Colonial Legacies, Democratic Futures, Routledge.

- Fraser, Nancy (1990), "Rethinking the Public Sphere: A Contribution to the Critique of Actually Existing Democracy", Duke University Press, Social Text, vol. 25, no. 26, pp. 56–80. Accessible at: http://en.wikipedia.org/wik/Public\_sphere
- French, Joan (1995), "Colonial Policy towards Women after the 1938 Uprising", In Saskia Wieringa (ed.) Subversive Women: Women's Movements in Africa, Asia, Latin America and the Caribbean, Kali for Women Press, New Delhi.
- French, Joan and Honor Ford-Smith (1986), Women, Work and Organizations in Jamaica 1900-1944, Institute of Social Studies, The Hague.
- Girvan, Norman (2012), "Jamaica's PNP Back in the Saddle Again", January 9, 2012, Accessible at: http://www.normangirvan.info./Girvan-Jamaica's-new-PNP-government
- Girvan, Norman (1969), "Abeng, Moko and New World: A Review", New World Quarterly, vol. 5, pp. 1-10.
- Gleaner (2011), "The Unresolved Question of Dual Citizenship and Political Representation", December 25, 2011.
- Gonsalves, Ralph (n.d.), "1935 Labour Riots in St. Vincent and their Political Significance", Quoted in Rhoda Reddock (2005), "Women Worker's Struggles in the British Colonial Caribbean: The 1930's", In Constance Sutton (ed.) Revisiting Caribbean Labour, Ian Randle Publishers, Jamaica, pp. 19-40.
- Gregg, Veronica (2005), Caribbean Women: An Anthology of Non-Fiction Writing, 1890-1980, University of Norte Dame Press, pp.70-95.
- Habermas, Jurgen (1989), The Structural Transformation of the Public Sphere: An Inquiry into a Category of Bourgeois Society, Cambridge, Massachusetts, MIT Press.
- Hart, Richard (2002), Labour Rebellions of the 1930s in the British Caribbean Region Colonies, Caribbean Labour Solidarity and the Socialist History Society, Accessible at: http://www. socialisthistorysociety.co.uk/HART.HTM#s10
- Henry-Lee, Aldrie (2011), "Social protection among the most vulnerable in small states: The experience of the Caribbean", ECLAC, Port of Spain, Trinidad and Tobago. September 11, 2011.
- Herweg, Andrew (2009), "Barbados first' policy flogs Guyanese in Barbados", In Council of Hemispheric Affairs, August 5, 2006, Accessible at: http://www.coha.org/barbadian-first-policyflogs-guyanese-in-barbados/
- Higman, B.W. (2011), A Concise History of the Caribbean, Cambridge University Press.
- Hodge, Merle (2012), "Gender Discrimination Against female PM", Letter to the Editor, Newsday, March 28, 2012.

- IDB (2010), "Women's Economic Opportunities in the Formal Private Sector in Latin America and the Caribbean: A Focus on Entrepreneurship", The International Bank for Reconstruction and Development/The World Bank.
- IFAD (1999), "Poverty Assessment Report of 1999", Accessible at: http://www.ifad.org/gender/ learning/challenges/women/g\_6\_2.htm
- ILO (2011), "Text of the Convention Concerning Decent Work for Domestic Workers", International Labour Convention, 100th Session, Geneva, Switzerland, Accessible at: http:// www.ilo.org/wcmsp5/groups/public/---ed norm/--relconf/documents/meetingdocument/ wcms\_157836.pdf
- ILO (2010), "Measuring the Economic and Social Value of Domestic Work", Domestic World Policy Brief 3, International Labour Office (ILO), Geneva, Switzerland.
- Immigration and Refugee Board of Canada (2008), "Guyana: Prevalence of Domestic Violence, Availability of State Protection, Recourse and Services Available to Victims", October 8, 2008, GUY102929.E, Accessible at: http://www.unhcr.org/refworld/docid/492ac7c3c.html
- Immigration and Refugee Board of Canada (2007), "Barbados: Legal Recourse and Services Available To Women who are Victims of Domestic Violence", March 8, 2007, BRB102420.E, Accessible at: http://www.unhcr.org/refworld/docid/47d6544512.html
- Immigration and Refugee Board of Canada (2007), "Barbados: Treatment of homosexuals, including protection offered by the state and the attitude of the population", March 9, 2007, BRB102422.FE, Accessible at: http://www.unhcr.org/refworld/docid/469cd6a52.html
- Immigration and Refugee Board of Canada (2006), "Jamaica: Laws regarding homosexuality; applicable penalties and whether they are enforced", October 6, 2006, JAM101671.E, Accessible at: http://www.unhcr.org/refworld/docid/45f1475a2.html
- Immigration and Refugee Board of Canada (2005), "Trinidad and Tobago: Treatment of gays, gay lifestyle, support groups; whether sections 13 and 16 of the Sexual Offences Act and paragraph 8 (1) (e) of the Immigration Act are enforced (January 2003–November 2005)", December 6 2005, TTO 100707.E, Accessible at: http://www.unhcr.org/refworld/ docid/45f148070.html
- International Monetary Fund (2004), "Macroeconomic implications of natural disasters on the Caribbean", Working Paper, Accessible at: http://www.imf.org/external/pubs/ft/wp/2004/ wp04224.pdf
- International Organisation for Migration (2005), Legal Review of Trafficking in Persons in the Caribbean, Accessible at: http://www.unicef.org/lac/spbarbados/Implementation/CP/ Regional/review\_trafficking\_Carib\_IOM.pdf
- Jones, Michael (2008), "Caribbean Attitudes towards Homosexuality Changing but Violence toward LGBT People Remain Common", Change.org, Accessible at: http://news.change.org/

- stories/caribbean-attitudes-toward-homosexuality-changing-but-violence-toward-lgbtpeople-remains-common
- Kaufman, Michael (1985), Jamaica under Manley: Dilemmas of Socialism and Democracy, Zed Books, London.
- Kempadoo, Kamala (2007), "The war on human trafficking in the Caribbean, Race and Class, Oct-Dec 2007, vol. 49, issue 2, pp. 79-85.
- King, Stephen and Richard Jensen (1995), "Bob Marley's 'Redemption Song'; The Rhetoric of Reggae and Rastafari", Journal of Popular Culture, vol. 29, issue 3, pp. 17-36.
- Ledgister, F.S.J. (2006), "Democracy in the Caribbean: Post-Colonial Experience", Accessible at: http://cau.academia.edu/FraganoLedgister.papers/409274/Democracy\_in\_the\_Caribbean
- Lewis, Linden (2002), "Envisioning a Politics of Change within Caribbean Gender Relations", In Patricia Mohammed (ed.) Gendered Realities: Essays in Caribbean Feminist Thought, University of the West Indies Press, Kingston, Jamaica, pp. 512-530.
- Little-White, Heather (2007), "Compulsory sex education in schools?" Jamaica Gleaner, September 9, 2007, Accessible at: http://jamaica-gleaner.com/gleaner/20070909/out/out8.html
- McAlmont, Cecilia (2011), "The Participation of Guyanese Women in Politics and Parliament during the Administration of the People's National Congress", History in Action, vol. 2, no. 1, April 2011, Accessible at: http://uwispace.sta.uwi.edu/dspace/bitstream/handle/2139/11128/ Article%204%20-%20mcalmont.pdf?sequence=1
- McClain, Linda and Joanna Crossman (2009), (eds.) Gender Equality: Dimensions of Women's Equal Citizenship, Cambridge University Press, London.
- Maharaj, Sunity (2012), "Politics Without People", Sunday Express, March 25, 2012. p.14, Accessible at: http://www.trinidadexpress.com/commentaries/Politics without people-144124265.html
- Martin, C.J. (2006), "In the womb of the law", Trinidad and Tobago Review, September 4, 2006, pp. 12-13.
- Meeks, Brian (1996), Radical Caribbean: From Black Power to Abu Bakr, The University of the West Indies Press, Kingston, Jamaica.
- Meer, Shamin with Charlie Sever (2004), Gender and Citizenship, Overview Report, BRIDGE, Institute of Development Studies, Sussex.
- Meighoo, Kirk (1998), "Putting up a New Resistance: The OWTU and the Emergence of an Open, Plural and Democratic Left in Trinidad and Tobago", In Deryck Brown (ed.) Selected Issues and Problems in Social Policy: Studies in Caribbean Public Policy 2, Canoe Press, University of the West Indies, Kingston, Jamaica, pp. 222-268.

- Miller, Errol (1991), Men at Risk, Kingston, Jamaica Publishing House.
- Ministry of Agriculture, Guyana (2011), Message by the Ministry of Agriculture on the observance of International Women's Day 2011, "Women in Agriculture: Closing the Gender Gap for Sustainable Development." Accessible at: http://www.agriculture.gov.gy/Speeches/ Message%20by%20the%20Ministry%20of%20Agriculture%20on%20the%20observance%20 of%20International%20Women's%20Day%20-March%2008,%202011.html
- Patricia Mohammed (2011), "Gender Politics and Global Democracy: Insights from the Caribbean", August 2011, Unpublished paper.
- Mohammed, Patricia (1989), "The Women's Movement in Trinidad and Tobago in the 70's and 80's", Caribbean Quarterly, vol. 35, nos. 1 & 2, pp. 38-45.
- Molyneux, Maxine (2007), "Refiguring Citizenship: Research Perspectives on Gender Justice in the Latin American and Caribbean Region", In Maitrayee Mukhopadhyay and Navsharan Singh (eds.) Gender Justice, Citizenship and Development, International Development Research Centre (IDRC), Ottawa, pp. 71-75.
- Mukhopadhyay, Maitrayee (2003), "Rights Based Approaches in Development", KIT Issue Paper, KIT, The Haque.
- Munroe, Trevor (1962), The Politics of Constitutional Decolonization in Jamaica 1944-1962, Institute of Social and Economic Research, University of the West Indies.
- Murdoch, Adlai (2004), "Masking and Power: Carnival and Popular Culture in the Caribbean" (Review), Research in African Literatures, vol. 35, no. 1, pp. 205-206.
- Nettleford Rex (1978), Caribbean Cultural Identity: The Case of Jamaica, Institute of Jamaica, Kingston.
- Neufville, Zadie (2009), "Jamaica: For an Abortion Law that reaches the Poor", Inter Press Service (IPS). June 14, 2009, Accessible at: http://ipsnews.net/news.asp?idnews=47216
- Pateman, Carole (1988), The Sexual Contract, Stanford University Press, California.
- People's National Party (1979), Principles and Objectives, September 1978, Kingston, Jamaica.
- Persadie, Natalie (2012), "Getting to One-third: Creating Legislative Access to Political Space for Women in Guyana", Draft paper presented at Workshop on "Gender, Power and Social Justice in the Caribbean", Institute of Gender and Development Studies, University of the West Indies, St. Augustine, Trinidad and Tobago, March 5, 2012, p. 23.
- Pheterson, G. and Y. Azize (2005), "Abortion practice in the Northeast Caribbean: Just write down stomach pain", Reproductive Health Matters, vol. 13, no. 26, pp. 44–45.
- Phillip, Nicole (2007), "Women in the Grenada Revolution, 1979-1983", Small Axe: A Caribbean Journal of Criticism, February 2007, Issue 22, pp. 39-66.

- Plummer, David. (2007), "Has learning become taboo and sexual risk compulsory? Researching the relationship between masculinities, education and HIV", Paper presented at Masculinites, Education and Criminal Justice Research Symposium, Centre for Gender and Development Studies, University of the West Indies, St. Augustine Campus, Trinidad and Tobago.
- Plummer, K. (1995), Telling Sexual Stories: Power, Change and Social Worlds, Routledge, London and New York.
- Plummer, K. (2001), "The Square of Intimate Citizenship: Some Preliminary Proposals", Citizenship Studies, vol. 5, no. 3, pp. 237-253.
- Rabess, Gregory (n.d.), "Popular Media and Cultural Identity in the Eastern Caribbean", WACC, Accessible at: http://waccglobal.org/en/19981-communication-issues-in-the-caribbean/907-Popular-media-and-cultural-identity-in-the-Eastern-Caribbean--.html
- Ramdin, Ron (1982), From Chattel Slave to Wage Earner: A History of Trade Unionism in Trinidad and Tobago, Martin Brian and O'Keefe, London.
- Reddock, Rhoda (2008), "Forever Indebted to Women: The Contribution of Women in the Development of the Caribbean Labour Movement", Consortium for Social Development and Research Lecture Series, University of the West Indies – Open Campus, St. Augustine, Trinidad and Tobago, October 22, 2008.
- Reddock, Rhoda (2008), "Gender, Nation and the Dilemmas of Citizenship: The Case of the Marriage Acts of Trinidad and Tobago", In Carolyn Eliott (ed.), The Global Empowerment of Women: Responses to Globalisation and Politicised Religion, Routledge, New York.
- Reddock, Rhoda (2005), "Women Workers' Struggles in the British Colonial Caribbean: The 1930s", In Constance Sutton (ed.) Revisiting Caribbean Labour, Ian Randle Publishers, Kingston, Jamaica, pp. 19-40.
- Reddock, Rhoda (2004), (ed.) Interrogating Caribbean Masculinities, The University of the West Indies Press, Kingston, Jamaica.
- Reddock, Rhoda (2004), "Reflections on Gender and Democracy in the Anglophone Caribbean: Historical and Contemporary Considerations", Institute of Social History, the Netherlands
- Reddock, Rhoda (1998), "Feature Address at the HIVOS/UNIFEM Meeting of Women's Organizations", Caribbean Association for Feminist Research and Action, Grenada, December 1–2, 1998, Accessible at: http://www.cafra.org/spip.php?article681
- Reddock, Rhoda (1994), Women, Labour and Politics in Trinidad and Tobago: A History, Ian Randle Publishers, Kingston, Jamaica.
- Regis, Louis (1999), The Political Calypso: True Opposition in Trinidad And Tobago, 1962-1987, University of Florida Press, Florida.

- Robins, Steve, Andrea Cornwall and Bettina Von Lieres (2008), "Rethinking 'Citizenship' in the Postcolony", Third World Quarterly, vol. 29, no. 6, pp. 1069-1086.
- Robinson, Tracy (2003), "Beyond the Bill of Rights: Sexing the Citizen", In Eudine Barriteau (ed.) Confronting Power, Theorizing Gender, University of the West Indies Press, Kingston, Jamaica, pp. 231-261
- Robinson, Tracy (2000), "Fictions of Citizenship, Bodies without Sex: The Production and Effacement of Gender in Law", Gender and Sexualities-Small Axe, March 2000, no. 7, pp. 1-27.
- Rodney, Walter (1981), A History of the Guyanese Working People, 1881-1905, John Hopkins Press, Baltimore and London.
- Rowley, Michelle (2003), "Crafting Maternal Citizens? Public Discourses of the 'Maternal Scourge' in Social Welfare Policies and Services in Trinidad", Social and Economic Studies, University of the West Indies, vol. 52, no. 3, pp. 31-58.
- Ryan, Selwyn (2001), "Democratic Governance in the Anglophone Caribbean: Threats to Sustainability", In Brian Meeks and Folke Lindahl (eds.) New Caribbean Thought: A Reader, University of the West Indies Press, Kingston, Jamaica, pp. 73-103.
- Sen, Gita and Caren Grown (1987), Development, Crises and Alternative Visions: Third World Women's Perspectives, Earthscan Publications Ltd., London.
- Sharpe, Jacqueline (1996), "Mental Health Issues and Family Socialization in the Caribbean", In J. Roopnarine and J. Brown (eds.) Caribbean Families: Diversity among Ethnic Groups,
- Ablex, Greenwich.
- Sheppard, Suzanne (2006), "How TT's laws cover common-law unions", Trinidad and Tobago Newsday, January 22, 2006.
- Shepherd, Verene (1999), Women in Caribbean History, Ian Randle Publishers, Kingston, Jamaica.
- SISTREN Theatre Collective (2009), "Tek it to dem and rise up wi community", Baseline Report, May 2009.
- Smith, Hope (2004), "Performing Gender in Trinidad Calypso", Latin American Music Review, vol. 25, no. 1, pp. 32-56.
- Sookram, S., F. Schneider, F. and P. Watson (2006), "Structure and Size of the Household Sector of the Hidden Economy in Trinidad and Tobago", Unpublished.
- Sookram, S. and P. Watson (2007), "Small-Business Participation in the Informal Sector of an Emerging Economy", Unpublished.
- Springer, Jennifer (2004), "Roll it Gal': Allison Hinds, Female Empowerment and Calypso", Meridians, vol. 8, Issue 1, pp. 93-129.

- Tator, Carol (1998), Challenging Racism in the Arts: Case Studies of Controversy and Conflict, University of Toronto Press, Canada.
- The Henry J. Kaiser Family Foundation (2009), "HIV/AIDS Policy Fact Sheet", November 2009, Accessible at: http://www.kff.org/hivaids/upload/7505-06.pdf
- The National Carnival Commission of Trinidad and Tobago (n.d.), "History of Calypso", Accessible at: http://www.ncctt.org/home/carnival/history-of-carnival-and-its-elements/ history-of-calypso.html
- The Network of NGOs for the Advancement of Women in Trinidad and Tobago (n.d.), "The Women's Responsive Sou Sou Banking System", Accessible at: http://www.networkngott.org/ index.php?option=com content&view=article&id=12&Itemid=17
- Thomas, Tillman (2010), "Re-Energising CARICOM Integration", Presentation by Hon. Tillman Thomas, Prime Minister of Grenada and Chairman of CARICOM, at the CARICOM Heads of Government Meeting, May 2010, Accessible at: http://www.normangirvan.info/Reenergising-caricom-integration-prime-minister-tillman-thomas
- Trotz, Alissa (2010), "Law and Domestic Violence", Starbroek News, October 25, 2010. Accessible at: http://www.stabroeknews.com/2010/features/10/25/law-and-domestic-violence/
- Trotz, Alissa (2007), "Red Thread: The Politics of Hope in Guyana, Race and Class, vol. 49, no. 2, pp. 71-79.
- UNAIDS (2010), Report on the Global AIDS Epidemic, Accessible at: http://www.unaids.org/ globalreport/
- UN Women (2012), Progress of the World's Women, 2011-2012, Accessible at: http://progress. unwomen.org/pdfs/EN-Report-Progress.pdf
- UNICEF (2005), "Situation Analysis of Jamaican Children", UNICEF Country Office, Kingston, Jamaica, February 2005.
- UNICEF Caribbean Area Office (2002), "Children in Focus", vol. 15, no. 1, Accessible at: http:// www.unicef.org/barbados/cao\_publications\_cifreform.pdf
- UNIFEM (2009), Progress of the World's Women 2008/2009: Who Answers to Women? Gender and Accountability, UNIFEM, New York.
- UNIFEM Caribbean Office (2008), "Child Support, Poverty and Gender Equality: Policy Considerations for Reform", April, 2008.
- UNIFEM Caribbean Office (2006), "The Administration of Family Justice: Child Support, Shared Family Responsibilities and Gender Equality." Barbados Research Report, Summary.
- UN Women (n.d.), Advocacy Brief: Strengthening Women's Economic Security and Rights, Accessible at: http://www.unifemcar.org/ge\_iss.cfm?SubID=168&link\_=1

- United Nations. "Short History of the Commission on the Status of Women" << http://www. un.org/womenwatch/daw/CSW60YRS/CSWbriefhistory.pdf>>
- United Nations (2008), "UN calls for more sex education in Caribbean schools to curb spread of HIV/AIDS: Sexual education a lynchpin of HIV prevention", August 1, 2008.
- United Nations Economic and Social Council (2007), "Policies to promote gender equality and empower women, Barbados", Accessible at: http://webapps01.un.org/nvp/indpolicy. action?id=135
- USAID/ LAPOP (2010), "The Political Culture of Democracy in Jamaica, 2010: Democratic Consolidation in the Americas in Hard Times", USAID, LAPOP, University of the West Indies, and Vanderbilt University.
- Linnette Vassell (2003), Women Organising and the Development of the Women's Movement in the Caribbean, Institute of Gender and Development Studies, University of the West Indies, Mona Campus, Jamaica.
- Vassell, Linnette (2000), "Power, Governance and the Structure of Opportunity for Women in Decision-Making in Jamaica", In Patricia Mohammed (ed.), The Construction of Gender Development Indicators for Jamaica, PIOJ/ UNDP/ CIDA, Kingston, Jamaica.
- Vassell, Linnette (1998), "Colonial Gender Policy in Jamaica, 1865-1945", In Brian Moore and Swithin Wilmot (eds.) Before and After 1865: Education Politics and Regionalism in the Caribbean, Ian Randle Publishers, Kingston, Jamaica, pp. 190-201.
- Vassell, Linnette (1993), "The Movement for the Vote for Women, 1918-1919", In The Jamaican Historical Review, vol. XV111, pp. 40-54.
- Walker, Karyl (2011), "Finger-raped in Barbados, J'can woman deported after shameful cavity search by immigration officer", March 24, 2011, Accessible at: http://www.jamaicaobserver. com/news/Finger-raped-in-Barbados\_8573453#ixzz1NCqphKEy
- Westmaas, Nigel (2009), "1968 and the Social and Political Foundations and Impact of New Politics' in Guyana", Caribbean Studies, July-Dec. 2009, vol. 37, Issue 2.
- Women's Resource and Outreach Centre (2011), Trinidad and Tobago UNDEF Report Revised, Kingston, Jamaica, Unpublished.
- Women's Resource and Outreach Centre (2008), Gender and Governance: Implications for the Participation of Women on Boards and Commissions in Jamaica, Kingston, Jamaica.
- World Bank (2010), "Women's Economic Opportunities in the Formal Private Sector in Latin America and the Caribbean: A Focus on Entrepreneurship", The International Bank for Reconstruction and Development/The World Bank, Washington, D.C.
- World Bank (2009), Genderstats database. Accessible at:

- http://web.worldbank.org/WBSITE/EXTERNAL/TOPICS/EXTGENDER/EXTANATOOLS/ EXTSTATINDDATA/EXTGENDERSTATS/0,,menuPK:3237391~pagePK:64168427~piPK:64168435 ~theSitePK:3237336,00.html
- World Bank (2003), "Caribbean Youth Development: Issues and Policy Direction", World Bank Country Studies, The International Bank for Reconstruction and Development/The World Bank, Washington, D.C.
- Yuval-Davis, Nira (2006), Gender and Nation, 2nd Edition, Sage Publications, California.

#### A note on the authors

#### Rawwida Baksh

#### Lecturer at the University of the West Indies

Rawwida Baksh is the coordinator of the *Caribbean Association for Feminist Research and Action* (CAFRA) and a lecturer at the University of the West Indies. She has previously worked as Director of the Women's Right Program at the International Development Research Centre in Canada, where she managed projects in Africa, Asia, Latin America and the Caribbean on such issues as women's political identity, access to justice and migration. In addition, she was the Gender Director for the Commonwealth Secretariat, where she coordinated the development of the Gender Equality Action Plan and led an area of work on Gender, Democracy, Peace and Conflict. She holds a doctorate in socio-historical linguistics from the University of the West Indies, a master's in gender and development from the Institute for Social Studies in The Hague and another in internation relations from the *London School of Economics*.

#### Linette Vassell

#### President of the Women's Resource and Outreach Centre of Jamaica

Linnette Vassell holds a master's degree in philosophy from the University of the West Indies, where she also worked for many years as a lecturer in Caribbean history and women's history. She was the first Coordinator of the Committee of Women for Progress in 1976 and a member of the Caribbean Association for Feminist Research and Action (CAFRA). She curently teaches at the Centre for Gender and Development Studies at the University of the West Indies in Mona, Jamaica. She is the author and co-author of a number of publications on the history of women's rights and participation in the Caribbean.







